# The Carrick Law Group P.C. 350 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2930 Los Angeles, California 90071

# OCTOBER 22, 2008

# NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 *et seq.*)

First Class Mail-Proof of Service Attached

Current President/CEO/General Counsel Natural Organics, Inc. dba Nature's Plus, Inc. 548 Broadhollow Road Melville, NY 11747-3704

## **Re:** Consumer Vitamin Supplement Products

Dear Sir or Madam:

Vicky Hamilton (the "Noticing Party") serves this Notice of Violation ("Notice") upon **Natural Organics, Inc. dba Nature's Plus, Inc.** ("**Nature's Plus**" or "Noticed Company") pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code ("H&S Code") § 25249.7(d) and Title 27 California Code of Regulations ("CCR") § 25903. This Notice satisfies a prerequisite for the Noticing Party to commence an action against **Nature's Plus** to enforce the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (California H&S Code § 25249.5 *et seq.* On information and belief, the violations addressed by this Notice occur in every county and city in California. This Notice is being served upon **Nature's Plus**, the California Attorney General, the district attorney of every California county, and the city attorney of every California city with a population (according to the most recent decennial census) of over 750,000. If **Nature's Plus** has a current registration with the California Secretary of State that identifies a Chief Executive Officer, President, or General Counsel, this Notice is being addressed to, and served upon, one of those persons.

Attached as Exhibit A to this Notice is a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary." The attached Summary was prepared by the California Environmental Protection Agency and provides general information about the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986. Copies of the Summary are not required to be, and are not being, provided to the public enforcement agencies.

A description of the Noticing Party, the Alleged Violator, and the Alleged Violations Addressed by this Notice follows:

♦ This Notice is provided by Vicky Hamilton. Ms. Hamilton is an individual who resides in Los Angeles County in California. Ms. Hamilton is acting in the public interest pursuant to H&S Code § 25249.7(d), and is acting to protect the environment, improve human health and support environmentally sound practices. NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.) October 22, 2008 Page 2

• The Noticed Company's name and address is:

## Natural Organics, Inc. dba Nature's Plus, Inc. 548 Broadhollow Road Melville, NY 11747-3704

- The violations addressed by this Notice began on or after February 27, 1988, have occurred on numerous occasions each and every day since February 27, 1988, and are ongoing and continuing.
- This Notice of Violation covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at H&S Code § 25249.6.
- The name of each chemical that is listed pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 involved in the violations addressed by this Notice is Lead (reproductive toxin); and Lead and lead compounds (cancer); (the "Listed Chemicals"). The Listed Chemicals are listed (and have been so listed for more than twelve months) by the Governor of the State of California as being a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity, or both cancer and reproductive toxicity. See Exhibit B attached hereto.
- The routes of exposure for the violations addressed by this Notice are ingestion during the normal and recommended use of the Product(s).
- The type of consumer products causing the exposures addressed by this Notice are vitamin supplement products ("Products"), including but not limited to the following illustrative product(s):

Nature's Plus® Animal Parade Shake (Powder) Nature's Plus® Animal Parade Shake (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Especially Yours (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Prenatal (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Source of Life - Power Teen (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Source of Life - Prenatal (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Source of Life - Ultra (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Source of Life - Women (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Source of Life - Women (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Ultra Prenatal (Tablet/Capsule) Nature's Plus® Ultra Prenatal (Tablet/Capsule)

- There are numerous sources of the exposures addressed in this Notice. On information and belief, these exposures occur in homes, the workplace and everywhere else in California where these products are used. These exposures occur principally off the property of the Noticed Company.
- In the course of doing business, **Nature's Plus** knowingly and intentionally has exposed, and continues to expose, individuals to the Listed Chemical in the Products. No clear and reasonable warning is or has been provided by **Nature's Plus** to individuals regarding exposure to the Listed Chemical or regarding the fact that the Listed Chemical is known to the State of California to be a carcinogen.

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.) October 22, 2008 Page 3

- ♦ These exposures are ongoing and continuing, with some continuing from 1989. The Noticing Party believes and so alleges that Nature's Plus tolled any applicable statute of limitations by failing at any time in the past to disclose the presence of the Listed Chemical in their Product(s) to those individuals to whom the Noticing Party owed a warning when those individuals purchased the Product(s) in retail stores or over the Internet where the Company(ies)' Products are sold for consumer use in California. The labels on these Product(s) do not include any warning that would meet the definition of a warning, or otherwise comply with, Title 27 CCR §§ 25601 to 25603.3, inclusive.
- The carcinogen and/or reproductive toxin contained in the ingredients of the Products, and subject to the warning requirements of H&S Code §25249.6 and more specifically at Title 27 CCR §§ 25601 to 25603.3., is listed below:
  - 1. Lead (reproductive)
  - 2. Lead and lead compounds (cancer)
- The aforementioned carcinogen and/or reproductive toxin is on the Governor's list (Proposition 65 Chemical List) as published at Title 27 CCR § 27001. These carcinogen and/or reproductive toxins are known to the State of California to cause carcinogenic and/or reproductive or development harm to humans requiring special warning labels and care in handling and use. Specifically, the concentration of these toxins in the subject Product exceeds the Maximum Allowable Daily Level ("MADL") threshold of 0.5 microgram per day set by the State of California for these chemicals as reproductive toxins, and requires a warning to purchasers and/or users of the existence of this chemical danger in the Product by **Nature's Plus**.
- ♦ The principal route of exposure is through a "consumer products exposure" via ingestion during the normal and recommended use of the Product(s). These exposures have gone on since February 27, 1988, and are ongoing and continuing at every place in California that the Products listed above are offered for sale and use. All references to "exposure" in this notice shall be understood to be exposures to the Products, including but not limited to the specific Products listed above and the ingredients of those Products. The sale of these Products constitutes a transfer of a known reproductive and/or carcinogenic chemical via the normal and recommended use of the Products by the purchaser or others, and will cause the chemical exposure without a clear and reasonable warning.
- The location of these alleged exposures are many and varied, and on information and belief occur within the 58 counties of the state of California, as evidenced by the District Attorneys addressed in the enclosed distribution list. The Noticing Party believes and so alleges that at least one of Nature's Plus's Product(s) were sold within each county by Nature's Plus wholesale or retail distributor in a retail store or over the Internet, and that sale caused the utilization of the Product(s) and consumption and subsequent exposure. This purchase and consumption caused exposures in that jurisdiction to the Listed Chemical in the Product(s) as identified herein, and those exposures by Nature's Plus were allowed to take place without the prerequisite warnings as delineated by the applicable statutes specified in this notice.

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.) October 22, 2008 Page 4

Please direct any inquiries regarding this notice or any communication for the noticing party, Vicky Hamilton to:

Roger Lane Carrick, Esq. The Carrick Law Group, P.C. 350 S. Grand Avenue, Suite 2930 Los Angeles, CA 90071 Tel.: (213) 346-7930 Fax: (213) 346-7931 E-mail: roger@carricklawgroup.com

## **EXHIBIT B**

List Of Chemicals Contained In The Attached 60-Day Notice of Violation That Are Listed By The Governor Of The State Of California As Being Known To The State Of California To Cause Cancer Or Reproductive Toxicity

## **REPRODUCTIVE TOXINS**

<u>Chemical</u>	CAS No.	Date Added to List
Lead		February 27, 1987

## CARCINOGENS

<u>Chemical</u>	CAS No.	Date Added to List
Lead and lead compounds		October 1, 1992

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d)

I, Roger Lane Carrick, on behalf of Ms. Vicky Hamilton hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice have violated California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical(s) that is the subject of this action.

4. Based upon the information obtained through those consultations, and all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all the elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 24249.7(h)(2), *i.e.*, (1) the identity of the person consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Date: October 22, 2008

/s/

ROGER LANE CARRICK THE CARRICK LAW GROUP, P.C. Attorneys for Vicky Hamilton

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 350 S. Grand Avenue, Suite 2930, Los Angeles, CA 90071-3406.

On October 22, 2008, I served copies of the documents listed immediately hereafter by first class mail by placing same in sealed envelopes, fully preparing postage thereon, and depositing said envelopes in the U.S. Mail at Los Angeles, California. Said envelopes were addressed as follows:

#### **ENTITY / VIOLATOR**

### **REGISTERED AGENT** (*if any*)

Gerald Kessler, CEO or Current President/CEO/Gen. Counsel Natural Organics, Inc. dba Nature's Plus, Inc. 548 Broadhollow Road Melville, NY 11747-3704

Gerald Kessler, CEO **3715 Cape Point Circle** Jupiter, FL 33458

Documents mailed:

- NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND 1. **TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (California Health and Safety** Code § 25249.5 et seq.)
- 2. **EXHIBIT A - THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (Government Entities excluded)
- **EXHIBIT B DETAILS OF RELEVANT PROPOSITION 65** 3. CHEMICAL LISTING
- 4. **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT – (attachments only sent to California Attorney General's Office**)

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the state of California that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on October 22, 2008, at Los Angeles, California.

/s/ Kimberly A.K. Burgo

### DISTRIBUTION LIST – GOVERNMENT ENTITIES VIA FIRST CLASS U.S. MAIL – Documents on CD-Rom Mailed: (1) 60-Day Notice of Violation; (2) Exhibit B - Details of Relevant Proposition 65 Chemical Listing; (3) Certificate of Merit (w/atts. AG's office only); and (4) Certificate of Service

	CALIFORNIA ATTORNEY GENERAL CA Department of Justice PROP. 65 ENFORCEMENT REPORTING Attn: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 Hard Copies as well as CD-Rom	
Los Angeles City Attorney's Office 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Diego City Attorney's Office Civic Center Plaza 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101	San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102
San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 95113-1905	Office of the District Attorney of Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	Office of the District Attorney of Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120
Office of the District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Room 202 Jackson, CA 95642	Office of the District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965	Office of the District Attorney of Calaveras County County Government Center 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249
Office of the District Attorney of Colusa County 547 Market Street, Suite 102 Colusa, CA 95932	Office of the District Attorney of Contra Costa County PO Box 670 Martinez, CA 94553	Office of the District Attorney of Del Norte County County Courthouse 450 H Street, Suite 171 Crescent City, CA 95531
Office of the District Attorney of El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667	Office of the District Attorney of Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	Office of the District Attorney of Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988
Office of the District Attorney of Humboldt County 825 Fifth Street Eureka, CA 95501	Office of the District Attorney of Imperial County County Courthouse, Room 202 939 West Main Street El Centro, CA 92243	Office of the District Attorney of Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526
Office of the District Attorney of Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301	Office of the District Attorney of Kings County Government Center 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	Office of the District Attorney of Lake County 255 North Forbes Street, Suite 424 Lakeport, CA 95453

Office of the District Attorney of Lassen County County Courthouse 220 South Lassen Street, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130	Office of the District Attorney of Los Angeles County 18000 Criminal Courts Building 210 West Temple Street Los Angeles, CA 90012	Office of the District Attorney of Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637
Office of the District Attorney of Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	Office of the District Attorney of Mariposa County 5089 Bullion Street P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	Office of the District Attorney of Mendocino County County Courthouse P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482
Office of the District Attorney of Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340	Office of the District Attorney of Modoc County County Courthouse 204 South Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101	Office of the District Attorney of Mono County County Courthouse P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Office of the District Attorney of Monterey County 240 Church Street, Room 101 Salinas, CA 93902	Office of the District Attorney of Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559	Office of the District Attorney of Nevada County Courthouse Annex 201 Church Street, Suite 8 Nevada City, CA 95959-2504
Office of the District Attorney of Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	Office of the District Attorney of Placer County 11562 "B" Avenue, DeWitt Center Auburn, CA 95603	Office of the District Attorney of Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 P.O. Box 10716 Quincy, CA 95971
Office of the District Attorney of Riverside County 4075 Main Street, 1st Floor Riverside, CA 92501	Office of the District Attorney of Sacramento County 901 "G" Street P.O. Box 749 Sacramento, CA 95814	Office of the District Attorney of San Benito County 419 4th Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023-3801
Office of the District Attorney of San Bernardino County 316 North Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004	Office of the District Attorney of San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1320 San Diego, CA 92101	Office of the District Attorney of San Francisco County Hall of Justice 880 Bryant Street, Room 325 San Francisco, CA 94103
Office of the District Attorney of San Joaquin County 222 East Weber, Room 202 P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201	Office of the District Attorney of San Luis Obispo County 1050 Monterey Street, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Office of the District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063
Office of the District Attorney of Santa Barbara County 1105 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Office of the District Attorney of Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110	Office of the District Attorney of Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Suite 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060
Office of the District Attorney of Shasta County 1525 Court Street, Third Floor P.O. Box 1320 Redding, CA 96001-1632	Office of the District Attorney of Sierra County County Courthouse P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936	Office of the District Attorney of Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097