#### NOTICE OF VIOLATION

## California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

### Arsenic from Drinking Water Filtration Systems

May 15, 2009

This Notice of Violation is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice of Violation is provided by the Center for Environmental Health, 2201 Broadway, Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health and supporting environmentally sound practices. Michael Green is the Executive Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

#### **Description of Violation:**

- <u>Violator</u>: The names and addresses of the violators are listed on the attached Exhibit 1.
- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least May 15, 2006, and are continuing to this day.
- <u>Provision of Proposition 65</u>: This Notice of Violation covers both the "discharge provision" of Proposition 65 and the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which are found at California Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 and 25249.6, respectively.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is Arsenic. Arsenic, as used herein, refers to arsenic (inorganic arsenic compounds) and arsenic (inorganic arsenic oxides). Discharges of Arsenic and exposures to Arsenic occur from use of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations is drinking water filtration systems utilizing activated carbon filters and replacement filters used in such systems. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are listed on the attached Exhibit 1. The Arsenic is contained in the activated carbon used in this product.
- Obscharge Violations: Use of these products results in discharges or releases of Arsenic into a source of drinking water. Specifically, the drinking water filtration systems that are the subject of this Notice of Violation contain sufficient quantities of Arsenic such that Arsenic will leach from the filtration systems into water that passes through them. Arsenic is contained in the activated carbon used in these systems. As the products connect to the plumbing system of homes and workplaces before the faucet, they are sources of drinking water under Proposition 65. The water in these filtration systems is a source of drinking water. These discharges occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout California where these filtration systems are used.

Warning Violations: Use of the products identified in this Notice also results in human exposures to Arsenic. The filtration systems are constructed of materials that contain Arsenic. Arsenic is contained in the activated carbon used in these systems. The route of exposure for the violations is ingestion of water discharged through the filters. These exposures occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout California where these filtration systems are used. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards of Arsenic.

#### Resolution of Noticed Claims:

enforcement lawsuit against each of the alleged violators unless such violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) reformulate products sold in the future to eliminate the Arsenic exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any of the alleged violators is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to counsel for CEH: Eric S. Somers, Lexington Law Group, 1627 Irving Street, San Francisco, CA 94122, (415) 759-4111, esomers at lexlawgroup.com.

# EXHIBIT 1 May 15, 2009 Notice of Violation Arsenic from Drinking Water Filtration Systems

Name and Address of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	Item or SKU # or Further Description
<b>Multi-Pure International</b> 7251 Cathedral Rock Drive Las Vegas, NV 89128	Multi-Pure MPAD Replacement Filter	Model CB6AD
PUR Water Purification Products, Inc. One Procter & Gamble Plaza Cincinnati, OH 45202  The Procter & Gamble Company One Procter & Gamble Plaza Cincinnati, OH 45202  The Procter & Gamble Distributing LLC One Procter & Gamble Plaza Cincinnati, OH 45202  The Procter & Gamble Manufacturing Company One Procter & Gamble Plaza Cincinnati, OH 45202	PUR Water Filtration System 2-Stage Filter	SKU No. 7-23987-00755-7
, v	<u>.</u>	

## CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

- I, Howard Hirsch, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.
- 3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

May 15, 2009

**f**oward Hirsch

Attorney for CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

#### PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL

I declare that:

I am employed in San Francisco County, California; my business address is 1627 Irving Street, San Francisco, California 94122. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within cause.

On May 15, 2009, I served true copies of the following documents:

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and** 

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY (only sent to those on service list marked with an asterisks).

On this date, I deposited fully prepaid and sealed envelopes containing the abovementioned documents with the United States Postal Service, addressed to the following individuals:

Please see attached service list.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on May 15, 2009, at San Francisco, California.

Signed:_	. •	
	Fllen Reed	

#### SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney of Colusa County 547 Market Street Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Contra Costa County 627 Ferry Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney of Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney of Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney of Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Kings County 1400 West Lacey Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 District Attorney of Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County 939 Main Street El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Lassen County 220 S. Lassen St., Ste 8 Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney of Inyo County P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney of Los Angeles County 210 W. Temple Street, Room 345 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney of Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Marin County 3501 Civic Center Dr., Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney of Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney of Monterey County 230 Church Street, Bldg. 2 Salinas, CA 93901

District Attorney of Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482 District Attorney of Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney of Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney of Nevada County 201 Church St., Suite 8 Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney of Orange County 401 Civic Ctr Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Modoc County 204 S Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney of San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney of Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney of San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1320 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney of Riverside County 4075 Main Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney of San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Rm 325 San Francisco, CA 94103 District Attorney of Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney of San Joaquin County P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201

District Attorney of San Luis Obispo County 1050 Monterey St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney of San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Ctr, 3<sup>rd</sup> FI Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse, P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Santa Barbara County 1105 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney of Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney of Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney of Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 District Attorney of Shasta County 1525 Court Street, Third Floor Redding, CA 96001-1632

District Attorney of Stanislaus County 800 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 200 PO BOX 442 Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney of Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney of Trinity County P.O. Box 310 11 Court St. Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

District Attorney of Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Ave, Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291

District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 No. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office 800 City Hall East 200 N. Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue #1620 San Diego, CA 92101 San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

California Attorney General's Office Attention: Proposition 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612

H. Allen Rice, President & CEO \* Multi-Pure International 7251 Cathedral Rock Drive Las Vegas, NV 89128

Alan G. Lafley, Chairman & CEO \* The Procter & Gamble Company One Procter & Gamble Plaza Cincinnati, OH 45202

Wolfgang C. Berndt, President \*
The Procter & Gamble
Distributing LLC
One Procter & Gamble Plaza
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Keith Harrison, President \*
The Procter & Gamble
Manufacturing Company
One Procter & Gamble Plaza
Cincinnati, OH 45202

President \*
PUR Water Purification
Products, Inc.
One Procter & Gamble Plaza
Cincinnati, OH 45202