ALTSHULER BERZON LLP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

177 POST STREET, SUITE 300 SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94108

(415) 421-7151

FAX (415) 362-8064 www.altshulerberzon.com FRED H. ALTSHULER OF COUNSEL

> JAMIE L. CROOK FELLOW

HAMILTON CANDEE EVE H. CERVANTEZ BARBARA J. CHISHOLM JEFFREY B. DEMAIN JAMES M. FINBERG EILEEN B. GOLDSMITH LAURA P. JURAN SCOTT A. KRONLAND PETER E. LECKMAN DANIELLE E. LEONARD STACEY M. LEYTON LINDA LYE PETER D. NUSSBAUM DANIEL T. PURTELL MICHAEL RUBIN REBECCA SMULLIN JENNIFER SUNG PEDER J. THOREEN JONATHAN WEISSGLASS

ANNE N. ARKUSH

STEPHEN P. BERZON

Via First Class Certified Mail Return Receipt Requested

September 25, 2009

CEO or President New Albertson's, Inc. P.O. Box 990 Minneapolis, MN 55440

New Albertson's, Inc. CT Corp. System 818 W. 7th St. Los Angeles, CA 90017

Dear CEO or President:

I represent the Natural Resources Defense Council ("NRDC"), a national nonprofit organization dedicated to safeguarding the Earth: its people, its plants and animals, and the natural systems on which all life depends. NRDC has a long history of advocating for strict regulation of the use of harmful chemicals in consumer products.

This letter constitutes notice that the entity listed below has violated and is violating the provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq. Specifically, this entity has violated and is violating Section 25249.6, which provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer . . . without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual"

Alleged Violator: New Albertson's, Inc.

Flea collars, including but not limited to Sergeant's Dual Action Flea & Tick Collar For Large Dogs, which are or have been produced, distributed, and/or sold by this entity, contain propoxur, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. Since August 11, 2007 and through January 2009, this entity has knowingly and intentionally exposed consumers within the State of California to propoxur at levels that exceed the No Significant Risk Level without providing a clear and reasonable warning of this exposure. Exposure occurs, *inter alia*, via



CEO or President New Albertson's, Inc. September 25, 2009 Page 2

dermal contact with animals wearing flea collars containing propoxur and hand-to-mouth contact following such dermal contact.

Pursuant to California Code of Regulations Title 27, §25903(b)(1), attached is a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary," prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and the California Environmental Protection Agency. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d)(1) of the Health and Safety Code, also attached is a Certificate of Merit pertaining to the noticing party's allegations.

Although violations are occurring throughout the State of California, at this time the noticing party lacks sufficient knowledge whether violations are occurring in each of California's 58 counties. The noticing party is therefore providing this notice to the California Attorney General, the District Attorney for each California county, and the City Attorney for the Cities of Los Angeles, San Diego, San Francisco, and San Jose, pursuant to California Code of Regulations Title 27, §25903(c)(3).

The <u>noticing party</u> is NRDC, which is located at 111 Sutter Street, 20th Floor, San Francisco, California, 94108, tel.: 415-875-6100. A responsible individual within NRDC is Michael Wall, a staff attorney at NRDC. If you wish to contact me, my contact information is below.

Barbara J. Chisholm Altshuler Berzon LLP 177 Post Street, Suite 300 San Francisco, CA 94108 Telephone: (415) 421-7151 Facsimile: (415) 362-8064

Barbara J. Chisholm

Enclosures

cc: Attorney General (without "Proposition 65: A Summary" attachment) (with confidential factual information supporting Certificate of Merit)

District Attorneys for California's 58 Counties (see list attached to Certificate of Service) (without "Proposition 65: A Summary" attachment)

City Attorneys for the Cities of Los Angeles, San Diego, San Francisco, and San Jose (see list attached to Certificate of Service) (without "Proposition 65: A Summary" attachment)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Barbara J. Chisholm, hereby declare:

I am an attorney in good standing with the California Bar and represent the noticing party, the Natural Resources Defense Council.

This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice, which alleges that the noticed entity or entities have violated and are violating Section 25249.6 of the Health and Safety Code by, in the course of doing business, knowingly and intentionally exposing individuals to propoxur, which has been designated as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, without a clear and reasonable warning.

I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

Based on the information that I have obtained through these consultations, I believe that there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information I have obtained (1) establishes a reasonable basis for concluding that this entire action has merit and that the noticing party will be able to prevail on each element for which it bears the burden of proof, and (2) does not prove that any affirmative defense set forth in Section 25249.5, et seq. of the Health and Safety Code has merit.

Attached to the copy of the Certificate of Merit that has been served on the Attorney General is factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information required by Section 25249.7(h)(2) of the Health and Safety Code.

Dated: September 21, 2009

Barbara J. Chisholm

Attorney for Natural Resources Defense Council

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am employed in the City and County of San Francisco, California. I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within action; my business address is 177 Post Street, San Francisco, California 94108.

On September 25, 2009, I served the following document(s):

Sixty-Day Notice of Violations of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65), Section 25249.6 of the California Health and Safety Code, for Exposing Consumers to Propoxur in Flea-and-Tick Collars Without Warning

on the entity listed below and the individuals identified in the list attached hereto as Appendix A, by placing true copies thereof in sealed envelopes addressed for service to the address(es) indicated below and in Appendix A, by enclosing them in an envelope, and by placing the envelope for collection and mailing following our ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing.

CEO or President New Albertson's, Inc. P.O. Box 990 Minneapolis, MN 55440

New Albertson's, Inc. CT Corp. System 818 W. 7th St. Los Angeles, CA 90017

and

Individuals identified in list attached as Appendix A

I declare under penalty of perjury under laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this **September 25, 2009**, at San Francisco, California.

Appendix A

Edmund G. Brown, Jr.
Attorney General for the State of California
PO Box 944255
Sacramento, CA 94244

The Honorable Candice Hooper-Mancino, District Attorney, SAN BENITO COUNTY 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023-3801

The Honorable Donald Segerstrom, Jr., District Attorney, TUOLUMNE COUNTY 423 No. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Arthur Maillet District Attorney, INYO COUNTY PO Box D Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney, NAPA COUNTY Carithers Building 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Clifford Newell
District Attorney, NEVADA COUNTY
110 Union Street
Nevada City, California 95959

The Honorable Dean Flippo, District Attorney, MONTEREY COUNTY PO BOX 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102 The Honorable Bob Lee District Attorney, SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis District Attorney, SAN DIEGO COUNTY 330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Dolores Carr District Attorney, SANTA CLARA COUNTY 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Carl Adams, District Attorney, SUTTER COUNTY 446 2nd Street Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Carmen A. Trutanich City Attorney 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Christie Stanley, District Attorney, SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable Edward Berberian District Attorney, MARIN COUNTY 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable David Paulson, District Attorney, SOLANO COUNTY 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 The Honorable Edward Jagels, District Attorney, KERN COUNTY 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Elizabeth Egan District Attorney, FRESNO COUNTY 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable George Booth District Attorney, MONO COUNTY P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Gerald Shea District Attorney, SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY 1035 Palm Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Gregg Cohen
District Attorney, TEHAMA COUNTY
444 Oak Street, Room L
Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable James Fox, District Attorney, SAN MATEO COUNTY 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable James Willett, District Attorney SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY PO BOX 990 Stockton, CA 95202

The Honorable Bradford Fenocchio District Attorney, PLACER COUNTY 10810 Justice Center Drive Suite #240 Roseville, CA 95678

The Honorable Jeff Cunan District Attorney, PLUMAS COUNTY 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 The Honorable Gary Woolverton District Attorney, MODOC COUNTY 204 S. Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable Gerald Benito District Attorney, SHASTA COUNTY 1525 Court Street, Third Floor Redding, CA 96001-1632

The Honorable Gilbert Otero
District Attorney, IMPERIAL COUNTY
940 West Main Street, Ste. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Gregory Totten
District Attorney, VENTURA COUNTY
800 South Victoria Avenue
Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus District Attorney, SISKIYOU COUNTY PO BOX 986 Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney 1200 Third Ave., Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Jan Scully
District Attorney, SACRAMENTO
COUNTY
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Birgit Fladager
District Attorney, STANISLAUS COUNTY
832 12th Street, Suite 300
Modesto, CA 95354

The Honorable John Poyner
District Attorney, COLUSA COUNTY
547 Market Street, Ste. 102
Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Jeffrey Tuttle
District Attorney, CALAVERAS COUNTY
891 Mountain Ranch Road
San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable Jon Hopkins
District Attorney, LAKE COUNTY
255 N. Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

The Honorable Larry Morse II
District Attorney, MERCED COUNTY
650 W. 20th Street
Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Meredith Lintott District Attorney, MENDOCINO COUNTY PO BOX 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Michael Harper
District Attorney, TRINITY COUNTY
PO Box 310
11 Court St.
Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Michael Ramsey
District Attorney, BUTTE COUNTY
25 County Center Drive - Administration
Building, Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley District Attorney, ALAMEDA COUNTY 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Paul Gallegos District Attorney, HUMBOLDT COUNTY 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501 The Honorable Kamala Harris
District Attorney, SAN FRANCISCO
COUNTY
850 Bryant Street, Room 325
San Francisco, CA 94103

The Honorable Lawrence Allen
District Attorney, SIERRA COUNTY
100 Courthouse Square, Second Floor
Post Office Box 457
Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable Michael R. Keitz District Attorney, MADERA COUNTY 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Michael Ramos District Attorney, SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

The Honorable Michael Riese District Attorney, DEL NORTE COUNTY 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Patrick McGrath District Attorney, YUBA COUNTY 215 Fifth Street, Ste. 152 Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Phillip Cline
District Attorney, TULARE COUNTY
221 South Mooney Blvd., Suite 224
Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Robert Brown
District Attorney, MARIPOSA COUNTY
5101 Jones St.
P.O. Box 730
Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney City of San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113-1905

The Honorable Robert Burns District Attorney, LASSEN COUNTY 220 S. Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Robert Kochly
District Attorney, CONTRA COSTA
COUNTY
900 Ward Street
Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Ronald Calhoun
District Attorney, KINGS COUNTY
1400 West Lacey Blvd
Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Steve Cooley
District Attorney's Office, LOS ANGELES
COUNTY
210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas District Attorney, ORANGE COUNTY 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701 The Honorable Robert Holzapfel District Attorney, GLENN COUNTY PO Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Rodric Pacheco District Attorney, RIVERSIDE COUNTY 4075 Main Street Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua District Attorney, SONOMA COUNTY 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Todd Riebe, District Attorney, AMADOR COUNTY 708 Court Street #202 Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Vernon Pierson
District Attorney, EL DORADO COUNTY
515 Main Street
Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable William Richmond District Attorney, ALPINE COUNTY 270 Laramie Street P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Jeff Reisig District Attorney, YOLO COUNTY 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695