#### LAW OFFICES OF

# ANDREW L. PACKARD

100 PETALUMA BLVD N, STE 301, PETALUMA, CA 94952
PHONE (707) 763-7227 FAX (707) 763-9227
INFO@PACKARDLAWOFFICES.COM

May 24, 2010

### VIA CERTIFIED MAIL

Michael. O. Johnson, CEO-CHB Herbalife Ltd, Inc. 800 West Olympic Boulevard, Suite 406 Los Angeles, CA 90016

Current President/CEO Herbalife Manufacturing, LLC 20481 Crescent Bay Drive Lake Forest, CA 92630-8817

Agent for Service of Process Herbalife Manufacturing, LLC 800 West Olympic Boulevard, Suite 406 Los Angeles, CA 90016

Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq.

Dear Sirs,

This firm represents the Environmental Research Center (hereafter, "ERC"), a non-profit corporation organized under California's Non-Profit Public Benefit Corporation Law in connection with this notice of violations of California's Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* (also referred to as "Proposition 65").

ERC is dedicated to, among other causes, reducing the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic substances, consumer protection, worker safety and corporate responsibility. ERC has documented the violations of Proposition 65 described herein, and this letter serves to provide notification of these violations to you and to the public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations. A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the lead agency designated under the statute, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served upon the violator(s).

The names of the violators covered by this notice are: Herbalife Ltd, Inc.; and Herbalife Manufacturing, LLC (hereafter, the "Violators"). The Violators manufacture,

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. May 24, 20104, 2010 Page 2

market, distribute and/or sell in California the following products causing exposures to lead and lead compounds:

Healthy Meal Nutritional Shake Mix, Wild Berry Flavor Strawberry Shake ShapeWorks Soup Mix Cream, Chicken Flavor ShapeWorks Protein Drink Mix, Chocolate Flavor Muscle Strength & Recovery Protein Drink, Chocolate Flavor

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a substance known to cause reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as substances known to cause cancer.

Route of exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products by consumers. Accordingly, consumer exposures have occurred and continue to occur primarily through the ingestion route of exposure, but also may occur through the inhalation and/or and dermal contact routes of exposure.

**Duration of violations.** Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since at least May 24, 2007, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users.

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, ERC intends to file a citizen enforcement action against the Violators unless the Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) take effective measures to prevent unwarned lead exposures from being caused by products sold in the future; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. In keeping with the public interest goals of the statute and my client's objectives in issuing this notice, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to lead and expensive and time-consuming litigation. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall and the organization's mailing address is: 5694 Mission Center Road, #199, San Diego, CA 92108. Tel. (619) 309-4194. However, ERC has retained this firm in connection with this matter; therefore, all communications regarding this Notice of Violation may be directed to my attention at the above-listed firm address and telephone number.

Very Truly Yours,

Andrew L. Packard

Attachments:
OEHHA Summary
Certificate of Merit (w/o AG attachments)
Certificate of Service

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: the Environmental Research Center's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations Issued to Herbalife Ltd, Inc. and Herbalife Manufacturing, LLC

I, Andrew L. Packard, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party in the notice has violated Health & Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: May 24, 2010

Andrew L. Packard

Attachments (for Attorney General Copy only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 100 Petaluma Boulevard North, Suite 301, Petaluma, California 94952.

On May 24, 2010, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986: A SUMMARY"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Michael. O. Johnson, CEO-CHB Herbalife Ltd, Inc. 800 West Olympic Boulevard, Suite 406 Los Angeles, CA 90016 Agent for Service of Process Herbalife Manufacturing, LLC 800 West Olympic Boulevard, Suite 406 Los Angeles, CA 90016

Current President/CEO Herbalife Manufacturing, LLC 20481 Crescent Bay Drive Lake Forest, CA 92630-8817

On May 24, 2010, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT (including supporting documentation required by Title 11 CCR §3102) on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On May 24, 2010, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelop, addressed to each of the parties **on the Service List attached hereto**, and depositing it in a U.S. Postal Service Office for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on May 24, 2010, in Petaluma, California.

Andrew L. Packard

### Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 547 Market Street Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 939 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County Post Office Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Rm 345 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County 230 Church Street, Bldg 2 Salinas, CA 93901

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701 District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95603

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 4075 Main Street, 1st Floor Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004

District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Room 1300 San Diego, CA 92112

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Room 325 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County Post Office Box 990 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1050 Monterey Street, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1105 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1525 Court Street, Third Floor Redding, CA 96001-1632

District Attorney, Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Downieville, CA 95936 District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291

District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113