### MICHAEL FREUND

ATTORNEY AT LAW

1915 ADDISON STREET

BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA 94704-1101

TEL 510/540-1992

FAX 510/540-5543

EMAIL FREUND1@AOL.COM

June 29, 2010

Re: Notice of Violation Against Symmetry Corporation for Violation of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6

### Dear Prosecutors:

I represent the Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), a non-profit California corporation whose mission is to safeguard the public from health hazards that impact families, workers and the environment. ERC is dedicated to reducing the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees and encouraging corporate responsibility. ERC is located at 5694 Mission Center Road, # 199, San Diego, CA 92108. Through this Notice of Violation, ERC seeks to reduce exposure to the public from lead contained in the named products manufactured and distributed by Symmetry Corporation.

This letter constitutes notification that Symmetry Corporation, located at 420 S. Hillview Drive, Milpitas, CA 95035 has violated the warning requirement of Proposition 65, the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act (commencing with section 25249.5 of the Health and Safety Code).

In particular, this company has manufactured and distributed products which have exposed and continue to expose numerous individuals within California to lead. Lead was listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity on February 27, 1987. Lead was listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a carcinogen on October 1, 1992. The time period of these violations commenced one year after the listed dates above. The primary route of exposure has been oral through ingestion.

Symmetry Corporation is exposing people to lead from the following products: Symmetry Botanicals Male Balance; Symmetry Botanicals New Attitude Energy Tonic; Symmetry Botanicals Botanacleanse Formula One; and Symmetry Botanicals Botanacleanse Formula Two; and Symmetry Botanicals Botanacleanse Formula Three.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to certain listed chemicals. Symmetry Corporation is in violation of Proposition 65 because the company failed to provide a warning to persons using their products that they are being exposed to lead. (22 C.C.R. section 12601.) While in the course of doing business, the company is knowingly and intentionally exposing people to lead, without first providing clear and reasonable warning. (Health and Safety Code section 25249.6.) The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. 22 C.C.R. section 12601 (b)(1) (A).

Proposition 65 requires that notice and intent to sue be given to a violator 60-days before the

suit is filed. With this letter, ERC gives notice of the alleged violation to the noticed party and the appropriate governmental authorities. This notice covers all violations of Proposition 65 that are currently known to ERC from information now available. ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations. A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, and referenced as Appendix A, has been provided to the noticed party.

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, ERC intends to file a citizen enforcement action against Symmetry Corporation unless the company agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) reformulate these products so as to eliminate further lead exposures; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and my client's objectives in pursuing this Notice, ERC will focus its efforts in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to lead and expensive and time-consuming litigation.

If you have any questions, please contact my office at your earliest convenience.

Sincerely,

Michael Freund

cc: Chris Heptinstall, ERC Karen Evans, ERC

## CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

# Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7 (d)

- I, Michael Freund hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the Notice of Violation in which it is alleged that the party identified in the Notice has violated Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party Environmental Research Center ("ERC"). ERC is dedicated to reducing the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees and encouraging corporate responsibility. The Notice of Violation alleges that the party identified has exposed persons in California to lead from products that it manufactures and distributes. Please refer to the Notice of Violation for additional details regarding the alleged violations.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. In particular, I have consulted with the laboratory that conducted the testing to determine the concentration of lead in the products identified in the Notice of Violation and I have relied on the testing results. The testing was conducted by a reputable testing laboratory with substantial experience in testing for lead. These facts, studies or other data derived through this investigation overwhelmingly demonstrate that the party identified in the Notice of Violation exposes persons to lead through oral exposure (ingestion).
- 4. Based on my consultation with the laboratory, the results of the laboratory testing, as well as published studies on lead, it is clear that there is sufficient evidence that human

exposures exist from exposure to the products from the noticed party. Furthermore, as a result of the above, I have concluded that there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the California Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7 (h) (2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 27, 2010

Michael Freund

Attorney for Environmental Research Center

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am a citizen of the United States and a resident of the County of Alameda. I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within entitled action; my business address is 1915 Addison Street, Berkeley, California 94704. On June 29, 2010 I served the within:

Notice of Violation and Certificate of Merit (Supporting documentation pursuant to 11 CCR section 3102 sent to Attorney General only)

on the parties in said action, by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the United States Post Office mail box in Oakland, California to said parties addressed as follows:

See Attached Service List

I, Michael Freund, declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on June 29, 2010 at Berkeley, California.

Michael Freund

District Attorney of Marin County District Attorney of Glenn County District Attorney of Alameda County 3501 Civic Center Dr., Room 130 PO Box 430 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 San Rafael, CA 94903 Oakland, CA 94612 Willows, CA 95988 District Attorney of Kings County District Attorney of Mono County District Attorney of Colusa County 1400 West Lacey PO Box 617 547 Market Street Hanford, CA 93239 Bridgeport, CA 93517 Colusa, CA 95932 District Attorney of Contra Costa District Attorney of Mariposa County District Attorney of Lake County County PO Box 730 255 N. Forbes Street 627 Ferry Street Mariposa, CA 95338 Lakeport, CA 95453 Martinez, CA 94553 District Attorney of Alpine County District Attorney of Humboldt County District Attorney of Monterey County 825 5<sup>th</sup> Street 230 Church Street, Bdg. 2 PO Box 248 Eureka, CA 95501 Salinas, CA 93901 Markleeville, CA 96120 District Attorney of Imperial County District Attorney of Mendocino County District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste 171 PO Box 1000 939 Main Street El Centro, CA 92243 Ukiah, CA 95482 Crescent City, CA 95531 District Attorney of Napa County District Attorney of Lassen County District Attorney of Amador County 931 Parkway Mall 708 Court Street, # 202 220 S. Lassen St., Ste 8 Napa, CA 94559 Susanville, CA 96130 Jackson, CA 95642 District Attorney of Inyo County District Attorney of Merced County District Attorney of Butte County PO Drawer D 25 County Center Drive 2222 "M" Street Independence, CA 93526 Merced, CA 95340 Oroville, CA 95965 District Attorney of Nevada County District Attorney of Los Angeles County District Attorney of El Dorado County 210 W. Temple Street, Room 345 110 Union Street 515 Main Street Nevada City, CA 95959-2503 Los Angeles, CA 90012 Placerville, CA 95667 District Attorney of Calaveras County District Attorney of Madera County District Attorney of Orange County 891 Mountain Ranch Road 401 Civic Center Drive West 209 West Yosemite Ave. San Andreas, CA 95249 Madera, CA 93637 Santa Ana, CA 92701 District Attorney of Kern County District Attorney of Modoc County District Attorney of Fresno County 204 S. Court Street 2220 Tulare Street, # 1000 1215 Truxtun Ave.

Bakersfield, CA 93301

Fresno, CA 93721

Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of San Mateo County District Attorney of Sutter County District Attorney of Placer County 400 County Ctr., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor 446 Second Street 2501 North Lake Blvd. Redwood City, CA 94063 Yuba City, CA 95991 Tahoe City. CA 96145 District Attorney of San Bernardino Cty District Attorney of Sierra County District Attorney of Ventura County Courthouse, PO Box 457 800 South Victoria Ave. 316 N. Mountain View Ave. Ventura, CA 93009 Donieville, CA 95936 San Bernardino, CA 92415 District Attorney of Santa Barbara District Attorney of Tehama County District Attorney of Plumas County County PO Box 519 520 Main Street, Room 404 1105 Santa Barbara Street Red Bluff, CA 96080 Quincy, CA 95971 Santa Barbara, 93101 District Attorney of Siskiyou County District Attorney of Yolo County District Attorney of San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1320 PO Box 986 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 Yreka, CA 96097 San Diego, 92101 District Attorney of Trinity County District Attorney of Solano County District Attorney of Riverside County PO Box 310 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 4075 Main Street 11 Court Street Fairfield, CA 94533 Riverside, CA 92501 Weaverville, CA 96093 District Attorney of San Francisco District Attorney of Yuba County District Attorney of Santa Clara County County 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing 215 Fifth Street 850 Bryant Street, Room 325 Marysville, CA 95901 San Jose, CA 95110 San Francisco, CA 94103 District Attorney of Tulare County District Attorney of Santa Cruz County District Attorney of Sacramento County 221 S. Mooney Ave., Room 224 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 901 "G" Street Visalia, CA 93291 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Sacramento, CA 95814 District Attorney of Tuolumne County District Attorney of San Joaquin County District Attorney of Sonoma County 423 No. Washington Street 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J PO Box 990 Sonora, CA 95370 Stockton, CA 95201 Santa Rosa, CA 95403 District attorney of San Luis Obispo San Jose City Attorney's Office District Attorney of Shasta County County 200 East Santa Clara Street 1525 Court Street, Third Floor 1050 Monterey St., Room 450 Redding, CA 96001-1632 San Jose, CA 95113 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney of Stanislaus County

800 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 200

PO Box 442

Modesto, CA 95353

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office

800 City Hall East

200 N. Main Street

Los Angeles, CA 90012

J 600 6

District Attorney of San Benito County

419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

Hollister, CA 95023

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. # 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

California Attorney General's Office Attn: Proposition 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 PO Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612

Karen A. Evans, General Counsel Environmental Research Center Law Office of Karen A. Evans. 4218 Biona Place San Diego, CA 92116

Rudy Revak, President Symmetry Corporation 420 S. Hillview Drive Milpitas, CA 95035