WRAITH LAW

16485 LAGUNA CANYON ROAD SUITE 250 IRVINE, CALIFORNIA 92618 Tel (949) 251-9977 Fax (949) 251-9978

March 8, 2012

NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 *ET SEQ.* (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is an attachment with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The names of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter "the Violators") are:

Banyan Botanicals, Banyan Trading, Co. and Banyan Trading, LLC

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemicals</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs I Sleep Soundly - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Healthy Kapha - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Ashwagandha - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Healthy Vata - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Haritaki - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Healthy Hair - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Blood Cleanse - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Healthy Pitta - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Heart Formula - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Kidney Formula - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Trim Support - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Men's Support - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Shatavari - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Vata Digest - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Immune Support - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Lung Formula - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Joint Support - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Mental Clarity - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Kapha Digest - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Liver Formula - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Tranquil Mind - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Gokshuradi Guggulu - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Kanchanar Guggulu - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Kaishore Guggulu - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Stress Ease - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Sweet Ease - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Women's Support - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Para Cleanse - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Pitta Digest - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Neem - Lead Banyan Botanicals Ayurvedic Herbs Triphala - Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion, but may have also occurred and may continue to occur through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least March 8, 2009, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 8, 2012 Page 3

provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as an expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely,

William F. Wraith

William Flesaith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Banyan Botanicals, Banyan Trading, Co. and Banyan Trading,
LLC and its Registered Agent for Service of Process only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 8, 2012 Page 4

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Environmental Research Center's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Banyan Botanicals, Banyan Trading, Co. and Banyan Trading, LLC

I, William F. Wraith, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
 - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: March 8, 2012

William F. Wraith

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 8, 2012
Page 5

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On March 8, 2012, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current CEO or President Banyan Botanicals 14316 Mel Smith Court, NE Albuquerque, NM 87123 Current CEO or President Banyan Trading, LLC 6705 Eagle Rock Avenue, NE Albuquerque, NM 87113 (Banyan Botanicals' Registered Agent for Service of Process) 6705 Eagle Rock Avenue, NE, Albuquerque, NM 87113

Current CEO or President Banyan Botanicals 624 A Street Ashland, OR 97520 Current CEO or President Banyan Trading, LLC 1709 Ridgecrest Drive, SE Albuquerque, NM 87108

Kevin J. Casey (Banyan Trading, LLC Registered Agent for Service of Process) 1709 Ridgecrest Drive, SE Albuquerque, NM 87108

Current CEO or President Banyan Botanicals 6705 Eagle Rock Avenue, NE, Albuquerque, NM 87113 Current CEO or President Banyan Trading, Co. 6705 Eagle Rock Avenue, NE Albuquerque, NM 87113

Kevin J. Casey Banyan Trading, Co. 6705 Eagle Rock Avenue, NE Albuquerque, NM 87113

On March 8, 2012, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 8, 2012 Page 6

On March 8, 2012, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION**, **CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ*.; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on March 8, 2012, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Amber Schaub

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 8, 2012

Page 7

Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 547 Market Street Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 2222 M Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004 District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Room 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County Post Office Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291 District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2nd Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Drive Carlton B Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113