

SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE FOR VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER
AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986

(*Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.*) (“Proposition 65”)

April 25, 2012

Kenneth R. Mangone, President,
or Current President/CEO
J. C. Penney Private Brands, Inc.
6501 Legacy Drive
Plano, TX 75024

Myron E. Ullman, III, President, or
Current President/CEO
J.C. Penney Corporation, Inc.
6501 Legacy Drive
Plano, TX 75024

Myron E. Ullman, III, President,
or Current President/CEO
J.C. Penney Company, Inc.
6501 Legacy Drive
Plano, TX 75024

Leonard Mendel, Chairman of the
Board or Current Chairman
Maytex
261 5th Ave
New York, NY 10016

AND THE PUBLIC PROSECUTORS LISTED ON THE DISTRIBUTION LIST ACCOMPANYING THE
ATTACHED CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re: Violations of Proposition 65 concerning **Tub Mats containing Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)
and Di-n-butyl Phthalate (DBP)**

Dear Mr. Mangone, Mr. Ullman, and to whom else this may concern:

Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc. (“CAG”), the noticing entity located at **9903 Santa Monica Boulevard #225, Beverly Hills, California 90212**, serves this Notice of Violation (“Notice”) on J.C. Penney Private Brands, Inc., J.C. Penney Corporation, Inc., J.C. Penney Company, Inc. and Maytex (collectively “Violators”) pursuant to and in compliance with Proposition 65. Violators may contact CAG concerning this Notice through its designated person within the entity, its attorney, Reuben Yeroushalmi, Esq., 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 610E, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, telephone no. (310) 623-1926, facsimile no. (310) 623-1930. This Notice satisfies a prerequisite for CAG to commence an action against Violators in any Superior Court of California to enforce Proposition 65. The violations addressed by this Notice occurred at numerous locations in each county in California as reflected in the district attorney addresses listed in the attached distribution list. CAG is serving this Notice upon each person or entity responsible for the alleged violations, the California Attorney General, the district attorney for each county where alleged violations occurred, and the City Attorney for each city with a population (according to the most recent decennial census) of over 750,000 located within counties where the alleged violations occurred.

- CAG is a registered corporation based in California. CAG is an entity dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. By sending this Notice, CAG is acting “in the public interest” pursuant to Proposition 65.
- This Notice concerns violations of the warning prong of Proposition 65, which states that “[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual . . .” *Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6*.

- **Tub Mats** (“**Tub Mats**”) contain **Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)**, also known as Diethyl Hexyl Phthalate and Bis (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate, which is known to the State of California to cause both cancer and reproductive toxicity, developmental, male. On January 1, 1988, the Governor of California added **Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)** to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause cancer, and on October 24, 2003, the Governor added **Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)** to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause developmental male reproductive toxicity. Both additions took place more than twenty (20) months before CAG served this Notice. **Tub Mats** also contain **Di-n-butyl Phthalate (DBP)**, also known as Dibutyl Phthalate, which is known to the State of California to cause reproductive toxicity, developmental, female, and male. On December 2, 2005, the Governor of California added DBP to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause developmental, female, and male reproductive toxicity. The addition took place more than twenty (20) months before CAG served this Notice.
 - An exemplar of the violations caused by **Tub Mats** includes but is not limited to:
 - **JCP Home™ Oval Bubble Tub Mat, UPC 073161972608**
- This Notice addresses consumer products exposures. A “[c]onsumer products exposure” is an exposure which results from a person’s acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption, or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service.” *Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602(b)*.

Violators caused consumer product exposures in violation of Proposition 65 by producing or making available for distribution or sale in California to consumers **Tub Mats**. The packaging for the **Tub Mats** (meaning any label or other written, printed or graphic matter affixed to or accompanying the product or its container or wrapper) contains no Proposition 65-compliant warning. Nor did Violators, with regard to the **Tub Mats**, provide a system of signs, public advertising identifying the system and toll-free information services, or any other system, which provided clear and reasonable warnings. Nor did Violators, with regard to the **Tub Mats**, provide identification of the product at retail outlets in a manner that provided a warning through shelf labeling, signs, menus, or a combination thereof. The **Tub Mats** are designed to be placed on the bottom of bath tubs.

- This Notice also concerns occupational exposures. An “[o]ccupational exposure” means an exposure to any employee in his or her employer’s workplace.” *Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602(f)*.

Violators caused occupational exposures in violation of Proposition 65 by allowing employees to handle the **Tub Mats** in the course of packaging, shipping, distributing, promoting, and selling **Tub Mats** without having first given clear and reasonable warnings to such employees that by handling the **Tub Mats** such employees would suffer exposures to **Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)** and **Di-n-butyl Phthalate (DBP)**. Violators’ employees were exposed to **Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)** and **Di-n-butyl Phthalate (DBP)** by touching **Tub Mats** with their bare skin at Violators’ premises located at 1600 Montebello Town Center, Montebello, CA 90640, among other locations where these activities take place including but not limited to other distributing, shipping, warehousing, packaging and retail centers. Violators did not provide any Proposition 65-compliant warnings on either the products or any substance present or any sign or system of signs within the workplace.

This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997.

This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to (a) the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California; and (b) employers with less than ten (10) employees. The approval also provides that an employer may use any means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement be subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the California Attorney General.

- This Notice also addresses environmental exposures. An “[e]nvironmental exposure” is an exposure which may foreseeably occur as the result of contact with an environmental medium, including, but not limited to, ambient air, indoor air, drinking water, standing water, running water, soil vegetation, or manmade or natural substances, either through inhalation, ingestion, skin contact or otherwise. Environmental exposures include all exposures which are not consumer products exposures, or occupational exposures.” *Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602(c)*.

Violators caused environmental exposures by not providing any Proposition 65-compliant warnings at their distributing, shipping, warehousing, and retail facilities located at 1600 Montebello Town Center, Montebello, CA 90640, among other locations where such exposures could foreseeably occur, to persons who could foreseeably come into contact with **Tub Mats**. Such exposures also occurred beyond the property owned or controlled by Violators.

These violations occurred each day between April 25, 2009, and April 25, 2012, and are ever continuing thereafter.

The principal routes of exposure were through dermal contact, ingestion, and inhalation. Persons sustain exposures by handling the **Tub Mats** without wearing gloves or by touching bare skin or mucous membranes with gloves after handling **Tub Mats**, as well as hand to mouth contact, hand to mucous membrane, or breathing in particulate matter emanating from the **Tub Mats** during installation and use, as well as through environmental mediums that carry the **Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)** and **Di-*n*-butyl Phthalate (DBP)** once contained within the **Tub Mats**.

Proposition 65 requires that notice of intent to sue be given to the violator(s) sixty (60) days before the suit is filed. *Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1)*. With this letter, CAG gives notice of the alleged violations to Violators and the appropriate governmental authorities. In absence of any action by the appropriate governmental authorities within sixty (60) calendar days of the sending of this notice (plus ten (10) calendar days because the place of address is within the United States but beyond the State of California), CAG may file suit. *See Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 1013; Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1); and Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25903(d)(1)*. CAG is ready and willing to discuss the possibility of resolving its grievances in the public interest short of formal litigation.

Dated: April 26/12



Reuben Yeroushalmi
Yeroushalmi & Associates
Attorneys for Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc.

Tub Mats containing Di (2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) and Di-*n*-butyl Phthalate (DBP)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Reuben Yeroushalmi, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the party(s) identified in the notice(s) has violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
3. I have consulted with at least one person with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 26/12

By:

Reuben Yeroushalmi

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 610E, Beverly Hills, CA 90212.

ON THE DATE SHOWN BELOW, I SERVED THE FOLLOWING:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy): Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (*only sent to Attorney General*)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

by enclosing copies of the same in a sealed envelope, along with an unsigned copy of this declaration, addressed to each person shown below and depositing the envelope in the U.S. mail with the postage fully prepaid. Place of Mailing: Beverly Hills, CA

Name and address of each party to whom documents were mailed:

Kenneth R. Mangone, President,
or Current President/CEO
J. C. Penney Private Brands, Inc.
6501 Legacy Drive
Plano, TX 75024

Myron E. Ullman, III, President,
or Current President/CEO
J.C. Penney Corporation, Inc.
6501 Legacy Drive
Plano, TX 75024

Myron E. Ullman, III, President,
or Current President/CEO
J.C. Penney Company, Inc.
6501 Legacy Drive
Plano, TX 75024

Leonard Mendel, Chairman of
the Board or Current Chairman
Maytex
261 5th Ave
New York, NY 10016

Name and address of each public prosecutor to whom documents were mailed:

See Distribution List

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Date of Mailing: 01/26/12

By: _____
Fereshteh Shakib

Distribution List

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St, 18th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Mono County District Attorney PO Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave Madera, CA 93637	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201 -0990
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642	Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant St, Rm 322 San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Dr. Oroville, CA 95965-3385	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, #130 San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway, Ste 1300 San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	San Bernardino County District Attorney 316 N Mountain View Ave San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550	Los Angeles City Attorney 200 N Main St Ste 1800 Los Angeles CA 90012	San Francisco City Attorney # 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234 San Francisco, CA 94102
Colusa County District Attorney Courthouse, 547 Market St. Colusa, CA 95932	Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526	Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney 725 Court St., Room 402 Martinez, CA 94553	Orange County District Attorney PO Box 808 Santa Ana, CA 92702	Merced County District Attorney 650 W. 20 th Street Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 "H" St. Crescent City, CA 95531	Nevada County District Attorney 201 Church St, Suite 8 Nevada City, CA 95959-2504	Napa County District Attorney PO Box 720 Napa, CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main St. Placerville, CA 95667-5697	Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Rm 404 Quincy, CA 95971	Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street, Suite 6 Riverside, CA 92501
Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th St Hollister, CA 95023
Glenn County District Attorney PO Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney County Government Center, Rm 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Siskiyou County District Attorney PO Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th St., 4 th Floor Eureka, CA 95501	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center Redwood City, CA 94063	Solano County District Attorney 600 Union Ave Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney 939 W. Main St., 2 nd Floor El Centro, CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr., Rm 212-J Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Ave. Bakersfield, CA 93301	Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St. San Jose, CA 95110	Shasta County District Attorney 1525 Court St, 3rd Floor Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr, 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230	Santa Cruz County District Attorney PO Box 1159 Santa Cruz, CA 95061	Sierra County District Attorney PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	Stanislaus County District Attorney PO Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353	Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101	Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130	Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902
Tuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370	Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009	Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	San Jose City Attorney 151 W. Mission St. San Jose, CA 95110