## SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE FOR VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986

(Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.) ("Proposition 65")

#### March 4, 2013

James Brower Chief Executive Officer/CEO Howard Berger Company, Inc. 324 A Half Acre Road Cranbury, NJ 08512 James Brower Chief Executive Officer/CEO Howard Berger Company, LLC 324 A Half Acre Road Cranbury, NJ 08512 Michael Balmuth, CEO, or Current President/CEO Ross Stores, Inc. 4440 Rosewood Drive Pleasanton, CA 94588-3051

Michael Balmuth, CEO, or Current President/CEO Ross Dress for Less, Inc. dba dd's Discounts 4440 Rosewood Drive Pleasanton, CA 94588-3051 Michael Balmuth, CEO, or Current President/CEO dd's Discounts 230 N. Market Street Inglewood, CA 90301-1217

AND THE PUBLIC PROSECUTORS LISTED ON THE DISTRIBUTION LIST ACCOMPANYING THE ATTACHED CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re: Violations of Proposition 65 concerning Flashlights with Rubber Grips containing Lead

To whom this may concern:

Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc. ("CAG"), the noticing entity located at 9903 Santa Monica Boulevard #225, Beverly Hills, California 90212, serves this Notice of Violation ("Notice") on Howard Berger Company, Inc., Howard Berger Company, LLC, Ross Stores, Inc., Ross Dress for Less, Inc., Ross Dress for Less, Inc. dba dd's Discounts, and dd's Discounts (collectively referred to as "Violators") pursuant to and in compliance with Proposition 65. Violators may contact CAG concerning this Notice through its designated person within the entity, its attorney, Reuben Yeroushalmi, Esq., 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 610E, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, telephone no. (310) 623-1926, facsimile no. (310) 623-1930. This Notice satisfies a prerequisite for CAG to commence an action against Violators in any Superior Court of California to enforce Proposition 65. The violations addressed by this Notice occurred at numerous locations in each county in California as reflected in the district attorney addresses listed in the attached distribution list. CAG is serving this Notice upon each person or entity responsible for the alleged violations, the California Attorney General, the district attorney for each county where alleged violations occurred, and the City Attorney for each city with a population (according to the most recent decennial census) of over 750,000 located within counties where the alleged violations occurred.

- CAG is a registered corporation based in California. CAG is an entity dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. By sending this Notice, CAG is acting "in the public interest" pursuant to Proposition 65.
- This Notice concerns violations of the warning prong of Proposition 65, which states that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual . . ." Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6.

- Flashlights with Rubber Grips (Flashlights) contain Lead, which is known to the State of California to cause both cancer and reproductive toxicity, developmental, male. On January 1, 1988, the Governor of California added Lead to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause cancer, and on October 24, 2003, the Governor added Lead to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause developmental male reproductive toxicity. Both additions took place more than twenty (20) months before CAG served this Notice.
  - o Exemplars of the violations caused by Flashlights include but are not limited to:
    - H.B. SMITH TOOLS® Flashlight, Item No. 79X2, UPC# 0-75877-51014-3, SKU# 400082458636.
- This Notice addresses consumer products exposures. A "[c]onsumer products exposure' is an exposure which results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption, or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service." Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602(b).

Violators caused consumer product exposures in violation of Proposition 65 by producing or making available for distribution or sale in California to consumers **Flashlights**. The packaging for the **Flashlights** (meaning any label or other written, printed or graphic matter affixed to or accompanying the product or its container or wrapper) contains no Proposition 65-compliant warning. Nor did Violators, with regard to the **Flashlights**, provide a system of signs, public advertising identifying the system and toll-free information services, or any other system, which provided clear and reasonable warnings. Nor did Violators, with regard to the **Flashlights**, provide identification of the product at retail outlets in a manner that provided a warning through shelf labeling, signs, menus, or a combination thereof. The **Flashlights** are designed to be held in one's hand.

These violations occurred each day between March 4, 2010, and March 4, 2013, and are ever continuing thereafter.

The principal routes of exposure were through dermal contact, ingestion, and inhalation. Persons sustain exposures by handling the **Flashlights** without wearing gloves or by touching bare skin or mucous membranes with gloves after handling **Flashlights**, as well as hand to mouth contact, hand to mucous membrane, or breathing in particulate matter emanating from the **Flashlights** during use, as well as through environmental mediums that carry the Lead and Lead compounds once contained within the **Flashlights**.

Proposition 65 requires that notice of intent to sue be given to the violator(s) sixty (60) days before the suit is filed. Cal. Health & Safety Code § 252549.7(d)(1). With this letter, CAG gives notice of the alleged violations to Violators and the appropriate governmental authorities. In absence of any action by the appropriate governmental authorities within sixty (60) calendar days of the sending of this notice (plus ten (10) calendar days because the place of address is within the United States but beyond the State of California), CAG may file suit. See Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 1013; Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1); and Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25903(d)(1). CAG is ready and willing to discuss the possibility of resolving its grievances in the public interest short of formal litigation.

Dated: 03-04-20/3

Reuben Yeroushalmi
Yeroushalmi & Associates
Attorneys for Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc.

#### Appendix A

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

#### THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACTION 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and its implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, Sections 25000 through 27000.

#### WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Governor's List." Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm. This list must be updated at least once a year. Over 735 chemicals have been listed as of November 16, 2001. Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release, or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and Reasonable Warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must:(1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is

exposed. Exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of listing of the chemical.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Discharges are exempt from this requirement if they occur less than twenty months after the date of listing of the chemical.

### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. The law exempts:

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer ("carcinogens"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "no significant risk" levels for more than 250 listed carcinogens.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm ("reproductive toxicants"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000

times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level (NOEL)," divided by a 1,000-fold safety or uncertainty factor. The "no observable effect level" is the highest dose level which has not been associated with an observable adverse reproductive or developmental effect.

Discharge that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply If the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the list chemical has not, does not, or will not enter any drinking water source, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" or "no observable effect" test if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

#### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys(those in cities with a population exceeding 750,000). Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. A notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in regulations (Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25903). A private party may not pursue an enforcement action directly under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

#### FOR FURTHER INFORMATION...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

#### Flashlights with Rubber Grips containing Lead

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

#### I, Reuben Yeroushalmi, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the party(s) identified in the notice(s) has violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with at least one person with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: 3/4/13

By:

Reuben Yeroushalmi

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 610E, Beverly Hills, CA 90212.

#### ON THE DATE SHOWN BELOW, I SERVED THE FOLLOWING:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy): Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary by enclosing copies of the same in a sealed envelope, along with an unsigned copy of this declaration, addressed to each person shown below and depositing the envelope in the U.S. mail with the postage fully prepaid. Place of Mailing: Los Angeles, CA

#### Name and address of each party to whom documents were mailed:

James Brower Chief Executive Officer/CEO Howard Berger Company, Inc. 324 A Half Acre Road Cranbury, NJ 08512

James Brower Chief Executive Officer/CEO Howard Berger Company, LLC 324 A Half Acre Road Cranbury, NJ 08512

Michael Balmuth, CEO, or Current President/CEO Ross Stores, Inc. 4440 Rosewood Drive Pleasanton, CA 94588-3051

Michael Balmuth, CEO, or Current President/CEO Ross Dress for Less, Inc. dba dd's Discounts 4440 Rosewood Drive Pleasanton, CA 94588-3051

See Distribution List

Michael Balmuth, CEO, or Current President/CEO dd's DISCOUNTS 230 N. Market Street Inglewood, CA 90301-1217

#### Name and address of each public prosecutor to whom documents were mailed:

Distribution List		
I declare under penalty correct.	of perjury under the laws o	of the State of California that the foregoing is true
Date of Mailing: 3_/	<u>/</u> /13	
	Dy:	Hva Ginovon

#### Distribution List

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St, Room 900	Los Angeles County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney
Oakland, CA 94612	210 W Temple St, 18th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	PO Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney
PO Box 248	209 W Yosemite Ave	PO Box 990
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera, CA 93637	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court, Suite 202	Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730	San Francisco County District Attorney
Jackson, CA 95642	Mariposa, CA 95338	850 Bryant St, Rm 322 San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
25 County Center Dr. Oroville, CA 95965-3385	3501 Civic Center Drive, #130	330 W. Broadway, Ste 1300
Calaveras County District Attorney	San Rafael, CA 94903  Mendocino County District Attorney	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
891 Mountain Ranch Road	P.O. Box 1000	San Bernardino County District Attorney 316 N Mountain View Ave
San Andreas, CA 95249	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General	Los Angeles City Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney
P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550	200 N Main St Ste 1800	# 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
Colusa County District Attorney	Los Angeles CA 90012 Inyo County District Attorney	San Francisco, CA 94102  Placer County District Attorney
Courthouse, 547 Market St.	P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Drive
Colusa, CA 95932	Independence, CA 93526	Suite 240
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Roseville, CA 95678-6231
725 Court St., Room 402	PO Box 808	Merced County District Attorney 650 W. 20 <sup>th</sup> Street
Martinez, CA 94553	Santa Ana, CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 "H" St.	Nevada County District Attorney 201 Church St, Suite 8	Napa County District Attorney
Crescent City, CA 95531	Nevada City, CA 95959-2504	PO Box 720 Napa, CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney
515 Main St. Placerville, CA 95667-5697	520 Main Street, Rm 404 Quincy, CA 95971	3960 Orange St. Ste. 5
Fresno County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney	Riverside, CA 92501 San Benito County District Attorney
2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000	901 G Street	419 4th St
Fresno, CA 93721 Glenn County District Attorney	Sacramento, CA 95814 San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Hollister, CA 95023
PO Box 430	County Government Center, Rm 450	Siskiyou County District Attorney PO Box 986
Willows, CA 95988	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Yreka, CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th St., 4th Floor	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center	Solano County District Attorney
Eureka, CA 95501	Redwood City, CA 94063	600 Union Ave Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney
939 W. Main St., 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor El Centro, CA 92243-2860	1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101	600 Administration Dr.,
	Santa Barbara, CA 95101	Rm 212-J Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
l 215 Truxtun Ave. Bakersfield, CA 93301	70 W Hedding St. San Jose, CA 95110	1525 Court St, 3rd Floor
Kings County District Attorney	San Jose, CA 95110 Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Redding, CA 96001-1632 Sierra County District Attorney
Gov't Ctr, 1400 W Lacey Blvd	PO Box 1159	PO Box 457
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney	Santa Cruz, CA 95061	Downieville, CA 95936-0457
255 N Forbes St	Stanislaus County District Attorney PO Box 442	Trinity County District Attorney
Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	Modesto, CA 95353	PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street	446 Second Street	215 5th St
Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney	Yuba City, CA 95991	Marysville, CA 95901
City Center Plaza	Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8	Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131
200 3rd Ave # 1100	Susanville, CA 96130	Salinas, CA 93902
an Diego, CA 92101 uolurnne County District Attorney	Tuloro Courte Division	
S Green St	Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224	Yolo County District Attorney
onora, CA 95370	Visalia, CA 93291	310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	San Jose City Attorney
00 S Victoria Ave /entura, CA 93009	P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff CA 06080	151 W. Mission St.
	Red Bluff, CA 96080	San Jose, CA 95110