LAW OFFICE OF MICHAEL FREUND

1919 ADDISON STREET, SUITE 105 BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA 94704-1101

> TEL (510) 540-1992 FAX (510) 540-5543 EMAIL FREUND1@AOL.COM

March 5, 2013

VIA CERTIFIED MAIL

Sam Duncan, President & CEO SuperValu, Inc. 7075 Flying Cloud Drive Eden Prairie, MN 55344

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

VIA PRIORITY MAIL

District Attorneys of All California Counties and Select City Attorneys (See Attached Certificate of Service)

Re: Notice of Violation Against SuperValu, Inc. for Violation of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.

Dear Addressees:

I represent The Chemical Toxin Working Group, a California non-profit corporation dedicated to reducing the amount of chemical toxins in consumer products. The Chemical Toxin Working Group was created by David Steinman, a committed environmentalist, journalist, consumer health advocate, publisher and author. His major books include Diet for a Poisoned Planet (1990, 2007); The Safe Shopper's Bible (1995); Living Healthy in a Toxic World (1996); and Safe Trip to Eden: Ten Steps to Save the Planet Earth from Global Warming Meltdown (2007). Through this Notice of Violation, The Chemical Toxin Working Group seeks to reduce exposures to lead in products ingested by consumers.

This letter constitutes notification that SuperValu, Inc. has violated the warning requirement of Proposition 65, the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act (commencing with Section 25249.5 of the Health and Safety Code). The product that is the subject of this Notice of Violation and the chemical in this product identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

Essential Everyday Clam Chowder Chunky Soup, New England Style – lead

SuperValu, Inc. has manufactured, marketed, distributed and/or sold this product that has exposed and continues to expose numerous individuals within California to lead. This chemical was listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1992 and as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity on February 27, 1987. The time period of these violations commenced one

year after the listed dates above. The primary route of exposure has been through ingestion.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to certain listed chemicals. SuperValu, Inc. is in violation of Proposition 65 because the company failed to provide a warning to persons ingesting the noticed product that they are being exposed to lead. (22 C.C.R. section 12601.) While in the course of doing business, this company is knowingly and intentionally exposing consumers to lead without first providing a clear and reasonable warning. (Health and Safety Code section 25249.6.) The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. 22 C.C.R. section 12601 (b)(1) (A). There are no warnings currently present on the company's label for this product.

Proposition 65 requires that notice and intent to sue be given to a violator 60-days before the suit is filed. With this letter, The Chemical Toxin Working Group gives notice of the alleged violation to the noticed party and the appropriate governmental authorities. This Notice of Violation covers all violations of Proposition 65 that are currently known to The Chemical Toxin Working Group from information now available to us. The Chemical Toxin Working Group is continuing its investigation that may reveal further violations. A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, and referenced as Appendix A, has been provided to the noticed party.

If you have any questions, please contact my office at your earliest convenience.

Sincerely,

Michael Freund

cc: David Steinman

Attachments:

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary to SuperValu, Inc.
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to Attorney General only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7 (d)

- I, Michael Freund hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached Notice of Violation in which it is alleged that the party identified in the Notice has violated Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party The Chemical Toxin Working Group. The Notice of Violation alleges that the party identified has exposed persons in California to lead from specified consumer products without providing a Proposition 65 warning. Please refer to the Notice of Violation for additional details regarding the product names and alleged violations.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. In particular, I have consulted with the laboratory who conducted the testing for lead regarding these products and I have relied on the testing results. The testing was conducted by a reputable testing laboratory by experienced scientists. These facts, studies or other data derived through this investigation overwhelmingly demonstrate that the party identified in the Notice of Violation exposes persons to lead through ingestion.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through the testing laboratory and on other information in my possession, I believe there is sufficient evidence that human exposures exist from exposure to the listed products from the noticed party. Furthermore, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the

plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the California Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7 (h) (2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: March 5, 2013

Michael Freund

Attorney for The Chemical Toxin Working Group

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am a citizen of the United States and a resident of the County of Alameda. I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 1919 Addison Street, Suite 105, Berkeley, California 94704. On March 5, 2013 I served the within:

Notice of Violation Against SuperValu, Inc., for Violation of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. and Certificate of Merit; (Supporting Documentation sent to Attorney General only)

on the parties in said action, via electronic mail to the California Attorney General and by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the United States Post Office mail box in Berkeley, California addressed as follows:

See attached Service List

I, Michael Freund, declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on March 5, 2013 at Berkeley, California

Michael Freund

Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendœino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004 District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 · San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jòse, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291 District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2nd Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113