

## NOTICE OF VIOLATION

### California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

August 5, 2013

Listed chemicals: benzophenone, and coconut oil diethanolamine condensate (cocamide diethanolamine) (hereinafter DEA).

This notice of violation is provided pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d). The provider of this notice is ProtectConsumers, LLC a limited liability corporation of the State of California, acting in the interest of the general public. This corporation is dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health and supporting environmentally sound practices.

Attached with this Notice is a Summary of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act (Prop 65) provided by the California EPA.

#### DESCRIPTION OF VIOLATION

Violators are John Paul Mitchell Systems, a California corporation, and John Paul Mitchell Products, LLC.

The violations have been occurring since at least June 22, 2013, are continuing and will continue to occur as long as the products subject to this notice continue to be sold to California consumers.

This notice of violation covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

The chemicals are benzophenone, and coconut oil diethanolamine condensate (cocamide diethanolamine) (hereinafter DEA). Products containing these chemicals are shampoo, soaps and salon products, and also pet grooming products. The attached Exhibit 1 lists examples of the products containing these chemicals.

Consumer exposure to the listed chemicals include dermal absorption and ingestion by consumers through reasonably foreseeable use of the products. Consumers may be exposed when involved products are applied to hair, scalp or skin, or used for bathing and grooming of animal pets. The Proposition 65 chemicals included in these products are listed as carcinogens.

#### RESOLUTION OF NOTICE TO CLAIMS

Based on the allegations contained in this notice, ProtectConsumers, LLC intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each of the alleged violators unless such violator

agrees in an enforceable and binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the benzophenone, DEA exposures, and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b).

If any of the alleged violators is interested in resolving this dispute before engaging in expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact ProtectConsumers, LLC through its counsel listed below.

It should be noted that ProtectConsumers, LLC cannot (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this notice. Therefore, while reaching agreement with ProtectConsumers, LLC\_ will resolve its claims, such an agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this notice to the attorney for ProtectConsumers, LLC, Charles Schoemaker, Jr., 78-365 Highway 111, #441, La Quinta, CA 92253. Telephone: (818) 300-0311. Email: [chaslawla@earthlink.net](mailto:chaslawla@earthlink.net).

Exhibit 1 to Notice of Violation

John Paul Mitchell Systems products containing benzophenone

Awapuhi Wild Ginger Finishing Spray  
Color Shots  
Extra Body Finishing Spray  
Extra Body Firm Finishing Spray  
Flash Finish  
Flash Back  
Hot Off The Press  
Hold Me Tight  
Super Clean Spray  
Super Clean Light  
Super Clean Extra  
The Cream  
Worked Up  
Stay Strong

John Paul Mitchell Systems products containing DEA

PM Shines  
Springloaded Friz- Fighting Shampoo  
Tea Tree Hand Soap  
Tea Tree Lavender Mint Shampoo  
Tea Tree Lemon Sage Shampoo  
Tea Tree Special Shampoo  
The Wash

John Paul Mitchell Products, LLC products containing DEA

Awapoochi Shampoo  
Calming Moisturizing Shampoo  
Oatmeal Shampoo  
Super Bright Dog Shampoo  
Tearless Gentle Shampoo  
Waterless Foam Shampoo

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT  
Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Charles Schoemaker, Jr., hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

August 5, 2013

  
\_\_\_\_\_

Charles Schoemaker, Jr.  
Attorney for ProtectConsumer, LLC

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT  
CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986  
(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA's implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. The statute is available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html>. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.<sup>1</sup> These implementing regulations are available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html>.

*WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?*

**The "Governor's List."** Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. This means that chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: [http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\\_list/Newlist.html](http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65_list/Newlist.html).

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the following:

**Clear and reasonable warnings.** A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies; for example, when exposures are sufficiently low (see below). The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of listing of the chemical under certain circumstances discussed below.

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

*DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?*

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (<http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

**Grace Period.** Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less

---

<sup>1</sup>All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>.

than 20 months after the listing of a chemical.

**Governmental agencies and public water utilities.** All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

**Businesses with nine or fewer employees.** Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

**Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer.** For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer ("carcinogens"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify chemical-specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question.** For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in a Food.** Certain exposures to chemicals that occur in foods naturally (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

**Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water.** The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

#### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of the regulations and in Title 11, sections 3100-3103. A private party may not pursue an enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

#### FOR FURTHER INFORMATION...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. Or via email at [P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov](mailto:P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov)

---

<sup>2</sup>See Section 25501(a)(4)

**PROOF OF SERVICE OF DOCUMENT**

I declare that:

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this action. My business address is 78-365 Highway 111, #441, La Quinta California 92253.

On August 5 2013, I served true copies of the following documents:

**NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

**THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY**

On this date, I deposited fully prepaid and sealed envelopes containing the above-mentioned documents with the United States Postal Service, addressed to the following individuals:

Rick Battaglini, ASOP  
John Paul Mitchell Systems  
1888 Century Park East, Ste 1600  
Century City, CA 90067

John Capra, ASOP  
John Paul Mitchell Products  
495 Mariposa Drive  
Ventura, CA 93001

*Please see attached service list for additional service.*

Also on this date, I uploaded a true and correct copy of the above documents as a PDF file at the Attorney General's website. No error message was received.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

8-5-2013

  
Charles Schoemaker, Jr.

District Attorney  
ALAMEDA COUNTY  
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900  
Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney  
ALPINE COUNTY  
PO Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney  
AMADOR COUNTY  
708 Court Street, #202  
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney  
BUTTE COUNTY  
25 County Center Drive —  
Administration Building  
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney  
CALAVERAS COUNTY  
891 Mountain Ranch Road  
San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney  
COLUSA COUNTY  
346 5th Street, Suite. 101  
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney  
CONTRA COSTA COUNTY  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney  
DEL NORTE COUNTY  
450 H Street, Room 171  
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney  
EL DORADO COUNTY  
515 Main Street  
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney  
FRESNO COUNTY  
2220 Tulare Street, Suite. 1000  
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney  
GLENN COUNTY  
PO Box 430  
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney  
HUMBOLDT COUNTY  
825 5th Street  
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney  
IMPERIAL COUNTY  
940 West Main Street, Suite. 102  
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney  
INYO COUNTY  
168 North Edwards  
Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney  
KERN COUNTY  
1215 Truxtun Avenue  
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney  
KINGS COUNTY  
1400 West Lacey Blvd.  
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney  
LAKE COUNTY  
255 N. Forbes Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney  
LASSEN COUNTY  
220 S. Lassen Street, Suite. 8  
Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney  
LOS ANGELES COUNTY  
210 W. Temple Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney  
MADERA COUNTY  
209 West Yosemite Avenue  
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney  
MARIN COUNTY  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130  
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney  
MARIPOSA COUNTY  
PO BOX 730  
Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney  
MENDOCINO COUNTY  
PO BOX 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney  
MERCED COUNTY  
550 West Main Street  
Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney  
MODOC COUNTY  
204 S. Court Street, Room 202  
Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney  
MONO COUNTY  
PO BOX 2053  
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney  
MONTEREY COUNTY  
PO BOX 1131  
Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney  
NAPA COUNTY  
PO BOX 720  
Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney  
NEVADA COUNTY  
110 Union Street  
Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney  
ORANGE COUNTY  
401 Civic Center Drive West  
Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney  
PLACER COUNTY  
10810 Justice Center Drive  
Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney  
PLUMAS COUNTY  
520 Main Street, Room 404  
Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney  
RIVERSIDE COUNTY  
3960 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney  
SACRAMENTO COUNTY  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95812

District Attorney  
SAN BENITO COUNTY  
419 4th Street  
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney  
SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY  
303 W. Third Street  
San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney  
SAN DIEGO COUNTY  
330 W. Broadway  
Suite 1300  
San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney  
SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY  
880 Bryant Street, Third  
Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94103

District Attorney  
SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY  
PO BOX 990  
Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney  
SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY  
Courthouse Annex, 4th Floor  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney  
SAN MATEO COUNTY  
400 County Center  
Third Floor  
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney  
SANTA BARBARA COUNTY  
1112 Santa Barbara Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney  
SANTA CLARA COUNTY  
70 West Hedding Street  
West Wing  
San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney  
SANTA CRUZ COUNTY  
701 Ocean Street, Room  
200  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney  
SHASTA  
COUNTY  
1355 West Street  
Redding, CA  
96001

District Attorney  
SIERRA COUNTY  
100 Courthouse  
Square  
Downieville, CA  
95936

District Attorney  
SISKIYOU  
COUNTY  
POBOX 986  
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney  
SOLANO  
COUNTY  
675 Texas Street, Suite  
4500  
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney  
SONOMA COUNTY  
600 Administration Drive  
Room 212J  
Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney  
STANISLAUS COUNTY  
832 12th Street, Suite  
300  
Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney  
SUTTER COUNTY  
446 Second Street, Suite  
102  
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney  
TEHAMA COUNTY  
170 BOX 519  
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney  
TRINITY COUNTY  
POBOX 310  
Weaverville, CA  
96093

District Attorney  
TULARE COUNTY  
221 South Mooney Blvd., Suite  
224  
Visalia, CA 93291

District Attorney  
TUOLUMINE COUNTY  
423 No. Washington  
Street  
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney  
VENTURA COUNTY  
800 South Victoria  
Avenue  
Ventura, CA 93009

District  
Attorney  
YOLO  
COUNTY  
30J Second Street  
Woodland, CA  
95695

District  
Attorney  
YUBA COUNTY  
215 Fifth Street, Suite.  
152  
Marysville, CA 9590J

Carmen  
Trutanich  
City Attorney  
CITY OF LOS ANGELES  
200 N. Main Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

Jan  
Goldsmith  
City  
Attorney  
CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
1200 Third Avenue, 3rd  
Floor  
San Diego, CA 92101

Richard  
Doyle  
City Attorney  
CITY OF SAN JOSE  
200 East Santa Clara  
Street  
San Jose, CA 95113

Dennis J.  
Herrera  
City Attorney  
CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
City Hall, Room 234  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett  
Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Office of Attorney General  
Prop 65 Enforcement  
1515 Clay St., Suite 2000  
P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Ricardo Battaglini, ASOP  
John Paul Mitchell Systems  
1888 Century Park East,  
Suite 1600  
Century City, CA 90067

John Paul Mitchell Products,  
LLC  
John Capra, ASOP  
495 Mariposa Dr.  
Ventura, CA 93001