#### **60 DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION**

## SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

**DATE:** August 14, 2013

**To:** CVS Pharmacy, Inc.; Softsoap Enterprises Inc.; Advanced Healthcare

Distributors, LLC; Kao USA Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; L'Oreal U.S.A., Inc.; Schwarzkopf & Henkel Inc.; Ilex Consumer Products Group, LLC; Fantasia Industries Corp; Neutrogena Corporation; Colgate-Palmolive Company; Newhall

Laboratories, Inc.;

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorney's Office for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose and San Francisco.

From: Shefa LMV, LLC

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Our name is Shefa LMV, LLC. We are citizens and a Limited Liability Company of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. We seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve public health and safety by reducing the hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the parties listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6, et seq. ("Proposition 65"). The violations alleged by this Notice consist of product exposures, routes of exposures, and types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below:

Product Exposure: See Section VI, Exhibit A

Listed Chemical:

Routes of Exposure:

Types of Harm:

Benzophenone

Touch, Oral

Carcinogen

## II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific type of product that is causing consumer and occupational exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and which is the subject of this Notice, is listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VII below. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "products." The sales of these products in California dating at least as far back as **June 22, 2013** are subject to this Notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to the listed chemical have been occurring without clear

and responsible warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical, resulting from contact with the products, California citizenry lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

Through the act of buying, acquiring and using the products, citizens of California are exposed to the listed chemical in homes, workplaces and elsewhere throughout California where these products are used. Exposure to consumers includes, but is not limited to, bathing their bodies, their pets or their children. Exposure in the line of occupation can be in a salon-type setting or pet grooming, or any similar occupation. Exposure may continue to occur for a significant period after the initial contact because it may be absorbed through pores in the skin. These activities cause men, women, pregnant women, children and infants to be exposed directly through migration of the listed chemical from the products. These violations and threatened violations pertain to Proposition 65 chemicals that are listed as carcinogens.

#### III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to our counsel's offices at the following address:

Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq. 1467 South Holt Avenue #2 Los Angeles, CA 90035

Phone: 310.200.2631

Email: danielgreenbaumesq@gmail.com

### IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") in the Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the alleged Violator(s), I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65 in Plain Language" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

#### V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, we intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator(s), unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those whom have received such products; (2)

provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future, or reformulate such products to eliminate the Coconut Oil Diethanolamine Condensate exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b).

If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III. It should be noted that neither counsel nor we can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day Notice period elapses; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District Attorney or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement that will resolve my claims, such as agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

### VI. EXHIBIT A

Identified below are specific examples of products recently purchased and witnesses as being available for purchase or use in California that is within the category or type of offending product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the example within the category or type of product are also provided below. We believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business to business, through the internet, and/or via catalog by the alleged Violator(s) and other distributors and retailers of the product.

Product Category	Specific Product <sup>1</sup>	<u>UPC</u>	Retailer	Manufacturer/Distributor
Face Soap	deep cleaning astringent	050428104873	CVS	CVS Pharmacy, Inc.
Body Wash	Softsoap Citrus Splash & Berry Fusion	074182281878	CVS	Softsoap Enterprises Inc.
Shower Gel	essence of beauty Citrus Coconut	050428813959	CVS	Advanced Healthcare Distributors, LLC
Acne Soap	Biore Blemish Treating Astringent	019100169906	CVS	Kao USA Inc.
Acne Soap	Clean & Clear essentials	381370033776	CVS	Johnson & Johnson
Hair Gel	Styling Gel Firm & Flexible Hold	050428175811	CVS	CVS Pharmacy, Inc.
Skin Toner	L'Oreal Hydrafresh Toner	071249672044	CVS	L'Oreal U.S.A., Inc.
Hair Gel	Smooth 'N Shine Curl Activator Gel	052336607910	CVS	Schwarzkopf & Henkel Inc.
Shower Gel	Calgon Morning Glory	852205002675	CVS	Ilex Consumer products group, LLC
Hair Gel	Fantasia Hair Polisher Syling Gel	011313019924	CVS	Fantasia Industries Corp
Sunburn lotion	Aftersun Aloe Vera	050428094099	CVS	CVS Pharmacy, Inc.
Acne Soap	Neutrogena Clear Pore	070501116906	CVS	Neutrogena Corporation
Hand Soap	instant hand sanitizer	050428078983	CVS	CVS Pharmacy, Inc.
Body Wash	Irish Spring Clear & Clean Fresh Skin	035000270078	CVS	Colgate-Palmolive Company
Hair Gel	L.A. Looks Sport activity proof power gel	041670139904	CVS	Newhall Laboratories, Inc.

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The specific example identified above is of the type of product which is the subject of this Notice. We are identifying herein for all recipients' benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposure to the listed chemical from other items within the product category listed in Exhibit A.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE OF DOCUMENT

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case or action. My business address is: 1467 S Holt Ave #2 Los Angeles CA 90035

A true and Correct copy of the foregoing document entitled <u>60 Day Notice of Violation</u> will be served or was served in the manner stated below (listing a name and date of service means that entity was served no later than 24 hours of the date listed):

I. <u>Interested Parties (Served via Certified Mail)</u>: On August 14, 2013, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known addresses by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope in the United States Mail, Certified mail, postage prepaid, and addressed as follows:

CVS Pharmacy, Inc.	Attn: General Counsel	1 CVS Drive	Woonsocket	RI	02895
Softsoap Enterprises Inc. c/o Colgate-Palmolive Company	Attn: Legal	300 Park Avenue	New York	NY	10022
Advanced Healthcare Distributors, LLC	Attn: Legal	9 CAPITOL STREET	Concord	NH	03301
Kao USA Inc.	Attn: Legal	2535 Spring Grove Avenue	Cincinnati	ОН	45214
Johnson & Johnson Services, Inc.	Attn: General Counsel	One Johnson & Johnson Plaza	New Brunswick	NJ	08933
Johnson & Johnson Services, Inc.	Attn: General Counsel	199 Grandview Rd.	Skillman	NJ	08558-9418
L'Oreal U.S.A., Inc.	Attn: Legal	575 Fifth Ave.	New York	NY	10017
L'oreal Usa, Inc	Attn: Legal	133 Loreal Way	Clark	NJ	07066-1340
Schwarzkopf & Henkel Inc.	Attn: Legal	1063 McGaw Avenue, Suite 100	Irvine	CA	92614
Henkel Consumer Goods, Inc.	Attn: Legal	19001 N Scottsdale Rd.	Scottsdale	AZ	85255
Ilex Consumer products group, LLC	Attn: Legal	323 W Camden St Ste 700	Baltimore	MD	21201
Parfums De Coeur Ltd.	Attn: Legal	85 Old Kings Highway	N Darien	CT	06820-4724
Fantasia Industries Corp	Attn: Legal	20 Park Place	Paramus	NJ	07652
Neutrogena Corporation	Attn: General Counsel	5760 W 96th St	Los Angeles	CA	90045
Newhall Laboratories, Inc.	Attn: Legal	5 High Ridge Park, Suite 100	Stamford	CT	06905

- II. <u>California Attorney General (via website Portal):</u> On August 14, 2013, I uploaded a true and correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website.
- III. <u>District and City Attorneys (via U.S. Mail)</u>: On August 14, 2013, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known addresses by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope in the United States Mail, first class, postage prepaid, and addressed as follows

See attached pages for full service list

1 7 1	erjury under the laws of the State of California and the	United States of America that the foregoing is
true and correct.		0-10
August 14, 2013	Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.	Jan On
Date	Printed Name	Signature

District Attorney ALAMEDA COUNTY 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900

Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney ALPINE COUNTY PO Box 248

Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney AMADOR COUNTY 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney
BUTTE COUNTY
25 County Center Drive —
Administration Building
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney CALAVERAS COUNTY 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney COLUSA COUNTY 346 5th Street, Suite. 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney
CONTRA COSTA COUNTY

900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney DEL NORTE COUNTY 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney
EL DORADO COUNTY
515 Main Street
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney FRESNO COUNTY

2220 Tulare Street, Suite. 1000

Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney GLENN COUNTY PO Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney HUMBOLDT COUNTY

825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501 District Attorney
IMPERIAL COUNTY

940 West Main Street, Suite. 102

El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney INYO COUNTY 168 North Edwards Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney KERN COUNTY 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney KINGS COUNTY 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney LAKE COUNTY 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney LASSEN COUNTY 220 S. Lassen Street, Suite. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney LOS ANGELES COUNTY 210 W. Temple Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney MADERA COUNTY 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney
MARIN COUNTY

3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130

San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney MARIPOSA COUNTY PO BOX 730

PO BOX 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney MENDOCINO COUNTY PO BOX 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney MERCED COUNTY 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 District Attorney MODOC COUNTY

204 S. Court Street, Room 202

Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney MONO COUNTY PO BOX 2053

Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney MONTEREY COUNTY PO BOX 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney NAPA COUNTY PO BOX 720 Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney NEVADA COUNTY 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney ORANGE COUNTY 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney PLACER COUNTY 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney PLUMAS COUNTY 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney RIVERSIDE COUNTY 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney

SACRAMENTO COUNTY

901 G Street

Sacramento, CA 95812

District Attorney SAN BENITO COUNTY 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney

SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY

303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415 District Attorney SAN DIEGO COUNTY 330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY 880 Bryant Street, Third Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

District Attorney SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY PO BOX 990 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY Courthouse Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney SAN MATEO COUNTY 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara. CA 93101

District Attorney SANTA CLARA COUNTY 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney
SANTA CRUZ COUNTY
701 Ocean Street, Room 200
Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney SHASTA COUNTY 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney SIERRA COUNTY 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney SISKIYOU COUNTY PO BOX 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney SOLANO COUNTY 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 District Attorney SONOMA COUNTY 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney STANISLAUS COUNTY 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney SUTTER COUNTY 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney TEHAMA COUNTY PO BOX 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney TRINITY COUNTY PO BOX 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney TULARE COUNTY 221 South Mooney Blvd., Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291

District Attorney TUOLUMNE COUNTY 423 No. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney VENTURA COUNTY 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney YOLO COUNTY 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney YUBA COUNTY 215 Fifth Street, Suite. 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Carmen Trutanich City Attorney CITY OF LOS ANGELES 200 N. Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Jan Goldsmith City Attorney CITY OF SAN DIEGO 1200 Third Avenue, 3rd Floor San Diego, CA 92101 Richard Doyle City Attorney CITY OF SAN JOSE 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

Dennis J. Herrera City Attorney CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

## I, Daniel N. Greenbaum, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

August 14, 2013	Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.	Inil M
Date	Printed Name	Signature

1 10