Metzger Law Group

Practice Concentrated in Toxic Tort & Environmental Litigation

401 E Ocean Blvd., Ste. 800 Long Beach, CA 90802 phone: 562.437.4499 fax: 562.436.1561

www.toxictorts.com

Raphael Metzger Kimberly Miller Sarah Hodgson Kathryn Saldana Kenneth Holdren Bryan Castaneda Molshree Gupta

December 20, 2013

VIA FIRST-CLASS U.S. MAIL

Chief Executive Officer Fast Forward Energy, Inc. 2101 Rexford Road, Suite 236 Charlotte, NC 28211 Robert C. Bowers, Esq. Moore & Van Allen PLLC 100 North Tryon Street, Suite 4700 Charlotte, NC 28202

RE: NOTICE OF PROPOSITION 65, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6, VIOLATIONS: EXPOSURE OF CONSUMERS TO CARCINOGENIC SUBSTANCES WITHOUT FIRST GIVING WARNINGS

Dear Gentlepersons:

This firm represents the Council for Education and Research on Toxics ("CERT"), a California public benefit corporation whose charitable purposes are education and research regarding toxic substances.

This letter constitutes notice that Fast Forward Energy, Inc., has violated and continues to violate provisions of the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq (commonly known as California's Proposition 65). Specifically, the above named entity has violated and continues to violate Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, which provides: "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual"

General Information: Pursuant to 27 California Code of Regulations § 25903(b)(1), attached hereto is a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary," as prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment of the California Environmental Protection Agency.

<u>Description of Violation</u>: Since March 2006, and continuing to the present, the above named entity has exposed and continues to expose California consumers purchasing coffee to high levels

Fast Forward Energy, Inc. December 20, 2013 Page 2

of acrylamide - a toxic chemical contained in the coffee produced, distributed and/or sold by the above named entity. As used herein, the term "coffee" means roasted coffee beans, coffee grounds, freeze-dried coffee, flakes/instant coffee, and coffee mixtures used to become drinkable coffee. As used herein, the term "coffee mixtures" refers to products where coffee is the first ingredient listed on the label of the product. Exposures to acrylamide unavoidably occurred via ingestion whenever a consumer purchased and thereafter consumed the above named entity's acrylamide-containing, coffee. Testing of coffee has shown that even a single, small (12-ounce) serving of coffee contains anywhere from 4 to well over 100 times more acrylamide than the No Significant Risk Level ("NSRL") for acrylamide established by California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). Acrylamide is a toxic chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and has been listed since January 1990 as a carcinogen on the list of carcinogenic chemicals published by the Governor of the State of California at 27 California Code of Regulations § 27001. Because acrylamide is listed in Proposition 65 as a carcinogen, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, the above named entity was, and is, required to warn California consumers purchasing its coffee that its coffee contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause cancer before exposing said consumers to acrylamide contained therein. Since March 2006, the above named entity violated and continues to violate California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by exposing numerous individuals within the State of California to acrylamide without first giving clear and reasonable warnings to said individuals that its coffee contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause cancer.

Noticing Entity: The noticing entity is the Council for Education and Research on Toxics ("CERT"), a California public benefit corporation whose charitable purposes are education and research regarding toxic substances. The responsible person within the noticing entity is Raphael Metzger, CERT's General Counsel, to whom all communications should be directed at the following address and telephone number:

Metzger Law Group Raphael Metzger, Esq. 401 E. Ocean Blvd., Suite 800 Long Beach, CA 90802 ph: 562-437-4499 fax: 562-436-1561

Names of Violator(s): The violator is: Fast Forward Energy, Inc.

<u>Time of Violations</u>: The violations of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 are numerous and have been continuous and uninterrupted since approximately March 2006 to the present throughout the State of California. The timing of the violations is such that they occurred

Fast Forward Energy, Inc. December 20, 2013 Page 3

every moment that every individual within the State of California purchased and thereafter ingested acrylamide from the coffee produced, distributed, and/or sold by the above named entity, without first receiving the required Proposition 65 warnings.

<u>Listed Chemicals</u>: The carcinogenic chemical in the coffee produced, distributed, and/or sold by the above named entity which is the subject of the named entity's Proposition 65 violations is acrylamide, CAS No. 79-06-1, which was first listed at 27 California Code of Regulations § 27001 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer on January 1, 1990.

Consumer Product Exposure Description: Since March 2006, and continuing to the present. the above named entity has exposed and continues to expose California consumers purchasing coffee to high levels of acrylamide — a toxic chemical contained in the coffee produced, distributed and/or sold by the above named entity. As used herein, the term "coffee" means roasted coffee beans, coffee grounds, freeze-dried coffee, flakes/instant coffee, and coffee mixtures used to become drinkable coffee. As used herein, the term "coffee mixtures" refers to products where coffee is the first ingredient listed on the label of the product. Exposures to acrylamide unavoidably occurred via ingestion whenever a consumer purchased and thereafter consumed the coffee produced, distributed, and/or sold by the above named entity. Tests have shown that even a single, small (12-ounce) serving of coffee contains anywhere from 4 to well over 100 times more acrylamide than the No Significant Risk Level ("NSRL") for acrylamide established by California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). Acrylamide is a toxic chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and has been listed since January 1990 as a carcinogen on the list of carcinogenic chemicals published by the Governor of the State of California at 27 California Code of Regulations § 27001. Because acrylamide is listed in Proposition 65 as a carcinogen, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, the above named entity was, and is, required to warn consumers of coffee in California that the coffee that it produces, distributes, and/or sells contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause cancer before exposing said consumers to acrylamide contained therein. Since March 2006, the above named entity violated and continues to violate California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by exposing numerous individuals within the State of California to acrylamide without first giving clear and reasonable warnings to said individuals that its coffee contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause cancer. The above named entity's Proposition 65 violations are particularly egregious and hazardous given the high concentrations of acrylamide contained in its coffee and given the fact that most consumers of coffee drink more than a single, small (12-ounce) serving of coffee per day.

<u>Conclusion</u>. Proposition 65 requires that notice and intent to sue be given to a violator sixty (60) days before suit is filed. By this letter, CERT gives notice of the foregoing violations to the above named entity, and to the appropriate governmental authorities. If the above named entity wishes to resolve this matter before CERT files suit, it should contact counsel at the above-

Fast Forward Energy, Inc. December 20, 2013 Page 4

mentioned address and telephone number. Otherwise, suit will be filed after sixty (60) days have elapsed. We look forward to your prompt action terminating the exposures of California consumers to the toxic hazards of acrylamide contained in your coffee, or providing the required and necessary warnings regarding the acrylamide contained in your coffee.

Very truly yours,

METZGER LAW GROUP

A Professional Law Corporation

By: Raphael Metzger, Esq. General Counselof CERT

cc: all governmental authorities per attached proof of service

attachments: Exhibit "A" - List of Alleged Violators; Summary of Proposition 65; Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service by Mail

Exhibit A (List of Alleged Violators)

Chief Executive Officer Fast Forward Energy, Inc. 2101 Rexford Road, Suite 236 Charlotte, NC 28211

<u>CERTIFICATE OF MERIT</u> Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6

I, Raphael Metzger, hereby declare:

- 1. I am an attorney at law, duly licensed and authorized to practice law in the State of California.
- 2. Unless the context indicates otherwise, I have personal knowledge of the matters set forth hereinafter and, if called as a witness, I would competently testify thereto.
- 3. I am General Counsel for the noticing party, Council for Education and Research on Toxics, a California corporation whose charitable purposes are education and research regarding toxic substances.
- 4. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings regarding the acrylamide contained in its coffee.
- 5. Council for Education and Research on Toxics alleges that since March 2006, and continuing to the present, the entity identified in the attached sixty-day notice has exposed and continues to expose California consumers purchasing coffee to high levels of acrylamide a toxic chemical contained in the coffee produced, distributed and/or sold by the entity identified in the attached sixty-day notice. Exposures to acrylamide unavoidably occurred via ingestion whenever a consumer purchased and thereafter consumed the acrylamide-containing coffee of the entity identified in the attached sixty-day notice. Testing of the coffee has shown that even a single, small (12-ounce) serving of coffee contains anywhere from 4 to well over 100 times more acrylamide than the No Significant Risk Level ("NSRL") for acrylamide established by California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). Acrylamide is a toxic chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and has been listed since January 1990 as a carcinogen on the list of carcinogenic chemicals published by the Governor of the State of California at 27 California

Code of Regulations § 27001. Because acrylamide is listed in Proposition 65 as a carcinogen, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, the entity named in the attached sixty-day notice was, and is, required to warn California consumers purchasing its coffee that its coffee contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause cancer before exposing said consumers to acrylamide contained therein. Since March 2006, the entity identified in the attached sixty-day notice violated and continues to violate California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by exposing numerous individuals within the State of California to acrylamide without first giving clear and reasonable warnings to said individuals that its coffee contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause cancer.

- data regarding the presence of, concentration of, and exposure to acrylamide from coffee. The expert that I consulted has the relevant and appropriate experience and expertise to review said facts, studies, and data because this expert holds a Ph.D. in toxicology, has published a number of peer-reviewed articles regarding risk assessment in general and acrylamide risk assessment in particular, and is employed as a senior researcher who regularly performs risk assessments and who supervises and lectures Ph.D. and masters thesis students in the areas of toxicology and risk assessment.
- 7. Based on the information obtained through my consultation, and on all other information in my possession, I believe that exposures to high levels of acrylamide unavoidably occurred via ingestion whenever a consumer purchased and consumed the coffee of the entity identified in the attached sixty-day notice from approximately March 2006, and continuing to the present. I also believe, based on my consultation and the information in my possession, that there is a reasonable and meritorious case for a private action, pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d). I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that information provides a credible basis that all elements of the private action can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

8. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the person consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts and other data reviewed by that person.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed December 20, 2013, at Long Beach, California.

Raphael Metzger

PROOF OF SERVICE BY U.S. MAIL

(Our File No. 9703)

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this matter. My business address is 401 E. Ocean Blvd., Suite 800, Long Beach, CA 90802. On December 20, 2013, I served the within Notice of Proposition 65, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 Violations: Exposure of Consumers to Carcinogenic Substances Without First Giving Warnings; Certificate of Merit; and Statement entitled "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" on the following violators and governmental attorneys who are required to be served copies of said notice, by placing true copies thereof enclosed in sealed envelopes with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the U.S. mail at Long Beach, CA, addressed as follows:

Kamala D. Harris Office of the Attorney General 1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Douglas Sloan Office of the City Attorney 2600 Fresno Street, Room 2031 Fresno, CA 93721-3600

Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney Civic Center Plaza 1200 Third Ave., #1620 San Diego, CA 92101

Dennis J. Herrera Office of the City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara St., 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113- 1905

District Attorney Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612 District Attorney Alpine County 270 Laramie Street P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney Colusa County 346 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667 District Attorney
Fresno County
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney Glenn County P. O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney Humboldt County 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney Imperial County 940 Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney Inyo County P.O. Box D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney
Kern County
1215 Truxtun Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney
Lake County
255 North Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney Los Angeles County 210 West Temple St., Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Dr., Rm. 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney Mariposa County 5101 Jones Street P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney Merced County 650 W. 20th St. Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney Modoc County 204 S. Court St., STE. 202 Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney Monterey County P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney Napa County Carithers Building P.O. Box 720 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 District Attorney Nevada County 110 Union St. Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Dr., Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main St., Rm. 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney San Benito County 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023-3801

District Attorney
San Bernardino County
303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor
San Bernardino, CA 92425-0502

District Attorney San Diego County Hall of Justice 330 W. Broadway San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney San Francisco County Hall of Justice 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103

District Attorney
San Joaquin County
P.O. Box 990
Stockton, CA 95201-0990

District Attorney San Luis Obispo 1035 Palm St., Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding St., West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square, 2nd Floor P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney Solano County 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533-6340

District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr., Room 212-J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354 District Attorney Sutter County 446 2nd Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney Tehama County 444 Oak St., Rm. L Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney Trinity County 11 Court St. P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291

District Attorney Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington St. Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney Ventura County 800 S. Victoria Ave. Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney Yuba County 215 5th Street Marysville, CA 95901 Chief Executive Officer Fast Forward Energy, Inc. 2101 Rexford Road, Suite 236 Charlotte, NC 28211

Robert C. Bowers, Esq. Moore & Van Allen PLLC 100 North Tryon Street, Suite 4700 Charlotte, NC 28202

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed December 20, 2013, at Long Beach, California.

Nina S. Vidal, Declarant