FRED H. ALTSHULER
FOUNDING PARTNER EMERITUS
RACHEL J. ZWILLINGER

FELLOW

STEPHEN P. BERZON FRICP RROWN HAMILTON CANDEE EVE H. CERVANTEZ CONNIEK, CHAN BARBARA J. CHISHOLM CAROLINE P. CINCOTTA JEFFREY B. DEMAIN JAMES M. FINBERG FILEEN R GOLDSMITH SCOTT A. KRONLAND DANIELLE, E, LEONARD MATTHEW J. MURRAY PETER D. NUSSBAUM P. CASEY PITTS DANIELT, PURTELL MICHAELRUBIN PEDER J. THOREEN

LAURAS, TRICE

#### ALTSHULER BERZON LLP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW
177 POST STREET, SUITE 300
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94108
(415) 421-7151
FAX (415) 362-8064

www.aitshulerberzon.com

Via First Class Certified Mail Return Receipt Requested

April 15, 2014

Michael Ghesser IMS Trading LLC 6010 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 400 Los Angeles, CA 90036

Re: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.

To Whom It May Concern:

Altshuler Berzon LLP ("Firm") represents As You Sow, a 501(c)(3) non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion of and improvement of human health, the improvement of worker and consumer rights, environmental education, and corporate accountability. As You Sow is based in Oakland, California and was incorporated in 1992 under the laws of the State of California.

As You Sow has documented violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., by IMS Trading, LLC (the "Company"). This letter constitutes notice by As You Sow and the Firm to the Company of these violations. Specifically, the Company has violated and is violating Section 25249.6, which provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual . . . ."

Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, this Firm intends to bring an enforcement action on behalf of As You Sow sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify the violations discussed in this letter. The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this notice of violations are identified in the attached Certificate of Service.



Michael Ghesser April 15, 2014 Page 2

Alleged Violator: The name of the alleged violator covered by this notice is IMS Trading, LLC.

<u>Listed Chemicals:</u> These violations involve exposures to *p*-dichlorobenzene (also referred to as 1,4-dichlorobenzene or *para*-dichlorobenzene) from the product listed below. On January 1, 1989, the State of California officially listed *p*-dichlorobenzene as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.

<u>Consumer Product:</u> The product that is the subject of this notice is IMS Moth Balls.

<u>Violations:</u> The alleged violator knowingly and intentionally has exposed and continues knowingly and intentionally to expose consumers within the State of California to *p*-dichlorobenzene at levels that, upon reasonable use of the product, exceed the No Significant Risk Level without providing clear and reasonable warning of this exposure. In particular, the product does not warn that it contains chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer.

Route of Exposure: Use of the product identified in this notice results in human exposures to *p*-dichlorobenzene. The routes of exposure include: inhalation when consumers breathe near the product; and absorption through skin, including but not limited to through handling of the product.

<u>Duration of Violations</u>: Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since at least April 15, 2013; as well as every day since the product was introduced in the California marketplace and following the one-year anniversary date of the listing at issue; and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the product.

Pursuant to Title 11, C.C.R. §3100, a certificate of merit is attached hereto. Pursuant to Title 27, C.C.R. §25903(b), a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" is also enclosed.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to rectify expeditiously these ongoing violations of California law, As You Sow is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. You may communicate directly with As You Sow by contacting Danielle Fugere, President and Chief Counsel, at: 1611 Telegraph Avenue, Suite 1450, Oakland, CA 94612, telephone: 510-735-8158. If you wish to contact me, my contact information is below:

Barbara J. Chisholm Altshuler Berzon LLP 177 Post Street, Suite 300 San Francisco, CA 94108 Telephone: 415-421-7151 Michael Ghesser April 15, 2014 Page 3

Facsimile: 415-362-8064

E-mail: bchisholm@altber.com

Sincerely,

Barbara J. Chisholm

## Enclosures

cc: Attorney General (without "Proposition 65: A Summary" attachment) (with additional confidential factual information supporting Certificate of Merit)

District Attorneys for California's 58 Counties (see list attached to Certificate of Service) (without "Proposition 65: A Summary" attachment)

City Attorneys for the Cities of Los Angeles, San Diego, San Francisco, and San Jose (see list attached to Certificate of Service) (without "Proposition 65: A Summary" attachment)

### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

## I, Barbara J. Chisholm, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, As You Sow.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

(5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 15, 2014

Barbara J. Chisholm

Attorney for As You Sow

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am employed in the City and County of San Francisco, California. I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within action; my business address is 177 Post Street, San Francisco, California 94108.

On April 15, 2014, I served the following document(s):

Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq., including attachment "Proposition 65: A Summary"; and Certificate of Merit.

on the entity listed below and the individuals identified in the list attached hereto as Appendix A, by placing true copies thereof in sealed envelopes addressed as indicated below and in Appendix A for service by enclosing them in an envelope and placing the envelope for collection and mailing by United States Mail following our ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is planned for collection and mailing it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the U.S. Postal Service in a sealed envelope with postage fully paid.

## **ADDRESSEES**

Michael Ghesser IMS Trading LLC 6010 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 400 Los Angeles, CA 90036

and:

Individuals identified in list attached as Appendix A (without attachment "Proposition 65: A Summary").

I declare under penalty of perjury under laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed April 15, 2014, at San Francisco, California.

Sally Mendez Arevalo

# APPENDIX A SERVICE LIST

Kamala D. Harris Attorney General for the State of California PO Box 944255 Sacramento, CA 94244 The Honorable Tom Hardy, District Attorney INYO COUNTY PO Box D Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Birgit Fladager, District Attorney STANISLAUS COUNTY 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354 The Honorable Bob Lee, District Attorney SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis, District Attorney SAN DIEGO COUNTY 330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Ronald Scott Owens, District Attorney
PLACER COUNTY
10810 Justice Center Drive Suite #240
Roseville, CA 95678

The Honorable Candice Hooper-Mancino, District Attorney SAN BENITO COUNTY 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023-3801 The Honorable Carl Adams, District Attorney SUTTER COUNTY 446 2nd Street Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Joyce E. Dudley, District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable Clifford Newell, District Attorney NEVADA COUNTY 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Donald A. du Bain, District Attorney SOLANO COUNTY 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Dean Flippo, District Attorney MONTEREY COUNTY PO BOX 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

The Honorable Dennis J. Herrera, Office of the City Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102 The Honorable Jeffrey F. Rosen, District Attorney SANTA CLARA COUNTY
70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Michael Knowles, Acting District Attorney TUOLUMNE COUNTY 423 No. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Lisa Green, District Attorney KERN COUNTY 1215 Truxtun Avenue, Fourth Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Michael R. Keitz, District Attorney MADERA COUNTY 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Jordan Funk, Interim District Attorney MODOC COUNTY 204 S. Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable Stephen Carlton, District Attorney SHASTA COUNTY
1355 West Street
Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Gilbert Otero, District Attorney IMPERIAL COUNTY 940 West Main Street, Ste. 102 El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Gregory Totten, District Attorney VENTURA COUNTY 800 South Victoria Avenue, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable Edward Berberian, District Attorney MARIN COUNTY 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Elizabeth Egan, District Attorney FRESNO COUNTY 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney NAPA COUNTY PO BOX 720 Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Tim Kendall, District Attorney MONO COUNTY PO BOX 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

The Honorable Gerald Shea, District Attorney SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY 1035 Palm Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Gregg Cohen, District Attorney TEHAMA COUNTY 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable Stephen M. Wagstaffe, District Attorney SAN MATEO COUNTY 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus, District Attorney SISKIYOU COUNTY PO BOX 986
Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable James Willett, District Attorney SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY PO BOX 990 Stockton, CA 95202

The Honorable Jan Goldsmith, Office of the City Attorney SAN DIEGO 1200 Third Ave., Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101 The Honorable Jan Scully, District Attorney SACRAMENTO COUNTY 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable David Hollister, District Attorney PLUMAS COUNTY 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Jeff Reisig, District Attorney YOLO COUNTY 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

The Honorable Barbara Yook, District Attorney CALAVERAS COUNTY 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 The Honorable John Poyner, District Attorney COLUSA COUNTY 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Donald Anderson, District Attorney LAKE COUNTY 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

The Honorable George Gascón, District Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY 850 Bryant Street, Room 325 San Francisco, CA 94103

The Honorable Larry Morse II, District Attorney MERCED COUNTY 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Lawrence Allen, District Attorney SIERRA COUNTY
100 Courthouse Square, Second Floor, Post Office Box 457
Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable C. David Eyster, District Attorney MENDOCINO COUNTY PO BOX 1000 Ukiah,, CA 95482 The Honorable Michael Harper, District Attorney TRINITY COUNTY PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 The Honorable Michael Ramos, District Attorney SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY 303 W. Third Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415

The Honorable Jon Alexander, District Attorney DEL NORTE COUNTY 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Paul Gallegos, District Attorney HUMBOLDT COUNTY 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Richard Doyle, Office of the City Attorney City of San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113- 1905

The Honorable Robert Burns, District Attorney LASSEN COUNTY 220 S. Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Mark A. Peterson, District Attorney CONTRA COSTA COUNTY 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Paul Zellerbach, District Attorney RIVERSIDE COUNTY 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Michael Ramsey, District Attorney BUTTE COUNTY
25 County Center Drive - Administration Building Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Patrick McGrath, District Attorney YUBA COUNTY 215 Fifth Street, Ste. 152 Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Tim Ward, District Attorney TULARE COUNTY 221 South Mooney Blvd., Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Thomas K Cooke, District Attorney MARIPOSA COUNTY 5101 Jones St., P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable Robert J. Maloney, District Attorney GLENN COUNTY PO Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Mike Feuer, City Attorney City of Los Angeles 800 City Hall East, 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Greg Strickland, District Attorney KINGS COUNTY 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Jill Ravitch, District Attorney SONOMA COUNTY 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney ALAMEDA COUNTY 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas, District Attorney ORANGE COUNTY 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable Terese Drabec, District Attorney ALPINE COUNTY 270 Laramie Street, P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Jackie Lacey, District Attorney's Office LOS ANGELES COUNTY 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

The Honorable Todd Riebe, District Attorney AMADOR COUNTY 708 Court Street #202 Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Vernon Pierson, District Attorney EL DORADO COUNTY 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667