

Michael Freund & Associates

1919 Addison Street, Suite 105
Berkeley, CA 94704
Voice: 510.540.1992 • Fax: 510.540.5543

Michael Freund, Esq.
Ryan Hoffman, Esq.

OF COUNSEL:
Denise Ferkich Hoffman, Esq.

May 23, 2014

**NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF
CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.
(PROPOSITION 65)**

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center (“ERC”), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC’s Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California’s Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (“Proposition 65”), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violator identified below.

Alleged Violator. The name of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the “Violator”) is:

Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC

Consumer Products and Listed Chemicals. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

1. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star GERD Defense – Lead**
2. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Beautiful Skin - Lead**
3. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Anti-Flam – Lead**
4. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Natural HST- Lead**
5. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Depress-ex – Lead**
6. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Tinkle-eze - Lead**
7. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Men’s Healthy Libido – Lead**
8. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Systems Strength – Lead**
9. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Sugar Craver’s Control Weight Loss Kit #2 - Lead**
(kit includes the below products)
 - a. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Sugar Craver’s Control Weight Loss Kit #2 Will Power**

- b. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Sugar Craver's Control Weight Loss Kit #2 Fat & Sugar Detox**
 - c. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Sugar Craver's Control Weight Loss Kit #2 Sugar Control High**
- 10. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Easy Change – Lead**
- 11. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Relax – Lead**
- 12. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Female Harmony – Lead**
- 13. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Parasite Purge - Lead**
- 14. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Beautiful Hair & Nails – Lead**
- 15. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Nature's Fibroid Control - Lead**
- 16. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Est-Aid – Lead**
- 17. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Red Skin Relief - Lead**
- 18. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Stone Defense – Lead**
- 19. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Healthy Prostate - Lead**
- 20. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Night Caps – Lead**
- 21. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Vari-Vein – Lead**
- 22. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Heartsease HBP – Lead**
- 23. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Hemr-eze – Lead**
- 24. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Cellulite Detox Weight Loss Kit #3 - Lead**
(kit includes the below products)
 - a. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Cellulite Detox Weight Loss Kit #3 Cellulite Release**
 - b. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Cellulite Detox Weight Loss Kit #3 Liver Renew**
 - c. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Cellulite Detox Weight Loss Kit #3 Tummy Control**
- 25. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Women's Best Friend - Lead**
- 26. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Liver Renew - Lead**
- 27. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Addiction Withdrawal - Lead**
- 28. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Muscle Relaxer - Lead**
- 29. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Bladder Comfort - Lead**
- 30. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Thin After 40 - Lead**
- 31. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Energy Green Renewal Drink Mix - Lead**
- 32. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Bladder Control - Lead**
- 33. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Tummy Control - Lead**
- 34. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Women's Healthy Libido - Lead**
- 35. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Cellulite Release - Lead**
- 36. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Herbal Laxa Caps - Lead**
- 37. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Blood Detox - Lead**
- 38. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star BWL-Tone I.B.S. - Lead**
- 39. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Systems Strength Broth Mix - Lead**
- 40. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Herp Defense - Lead**
- 41. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Toxin Detox - Lead**
- 42. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Candida Detox - Lead**
- 43. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Anti-Bio - Lead**
- 44. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Male Performance - Lead**
- 45. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Adrenal Energy - Lead**
- 46. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Ocean Minerals - Lead**
- 47. **Healthy Healing Enterprises LLC Crystal Star Thyroid Meta Max - Lead**

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion, but may have also occurred and may continue to occur through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least May 23, 2011, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violator to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as an expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.**

Sincerely,



Michael Freund

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC and its Registered Agent for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Environmental Research Center's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC

I, Michael Freund, declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: May 23, 2014



Michael Freund

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On May 23, 2014, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; “THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY”** on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO
Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC
9821 Valley View Road
Eden Prairie, MN 55344

Tony Tortore
(Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC’s Registered
Agent for Service of Process)
9821 Valley View Road
Eden Prairie, MN 55344

Current President or CEO
Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC
2600 Garden Road, Suite 111
Monterey, CA 93940

Current President or CEO
Healthy Healing Enterprises, LLC
2600 Garden Road, Suite 111
Monterey, CA 93940

On May 23, 2014, I electronically served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1)** on the following party by uploading a true and correct copy thereof on the California Attorney General’s website, which can be accessed at <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>:

Office of the California Attorney General
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On May 23, 2014, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on May 23, 2014, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.



Tiffany Capehart

Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*

May 23, 2014

Page 6

Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612	District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012	District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101	District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francisco, CA 94103	District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009
District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642	District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202	District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2 nd Street Woodland, CA 95695
District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901
District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3 rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012
District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101
District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553	District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020	District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102
District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 th Floor San Jose, CA 95113
District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667	District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902	District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	
District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559	District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936	
District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	
District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4 th Floor Eureka, CA 95501	District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701	District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	
District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243	District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678	District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403	
District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514	District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12 th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501	District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	
District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814	District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	
District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2 nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023	District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093	
District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130	District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004	District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291	