

October 13, 2014

Williams & Selyem, LLC 6575 Westside Rd. Healdsburg, CA 95448

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST WILLIAMS & SELYEM, LLC, OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

John Bonilla ("Bonilla") is a citizen of the state of California acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Mr. Bonilla has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. by Williams & Selyem, LLC, a California limited liability company (the "Violator"). This letter serves to provide Mr. Bonilla's notification of these violations to the Violator and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Mr. Bonilla intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are alcoholic beverages manufactured, distributed, offered for sale, and/or served to California consumers by Violator ("Products"). The location of the violations include Vertical Wine Bistro, 70 N. Raymond Ave., Pasadena, CA 91103, where the Products were sold without a warning on or before July 10, 2014, and continuing thereafter.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violator.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Alcoholic beverages, when associated with alcohol abuse; 2) Ethyl alcohol in alcoholic beverages; and 3) Ethanol in alcoholic beverages.

Pursuant to Title 27, CCR § 25603.3(e)(7): "For alcoholic beverages, the placement and maintenance of the warning shall be the responsibility of the manufacturer or its distributor at no cost to the retailer, and any consequence for failure to do the same shall rest solely with the manufacturer or its distributor, provided that the retailer does not remove, deface, or obscure the requisite signs or notices, or obstruct, interfere with, or otherwise frustrate the manufacturer's reasonable efforts to post, maintain, or periodically replace said materials."

Mr. Bonilla intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violator, unless California agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Mr. Bonilla is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites violator, should it seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Bonilla's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Mr. Bonilla's attorneys, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com) or Miguel A. Custodio, Jr.(custodio@cd-lawyers.com), 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101, 213-785-2909.

Sincerely,

Vineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments: Proposition 65

Proposition 65 summary Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: John Bonilla's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Williams & Selyem, LLC.

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience, extensively reviewed Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2), and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained; Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2); and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: October 13, 2014

Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Williams & Selyem, LLC 6575 Westside Rd. Healdsburg, CA 95448

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

October 13, 2014

Vineet Dubey

## **Distribution List**

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St. Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St. 18th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Mono County District Attorney PO Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera, CA 93637	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court, Suite 202	Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730	San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant St, Rm 322
Jackson, CA 95642	Mariposa, CA 95338	San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
25 County Center Dr.	3501 Civic Center Drive, #130	220 M Decodurer etc 1200
Oroville. CA 95965-3385	San Rafael. CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road	P.O. Box 1000	316 N Mountain View Ave San Bernardino. CA 92415-0004
San Andreas, CA 95249	Ukiah, CA 95482	
Office of the Attorney General	Los Angeles City Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney
P.O. Box 70550	200 N Main St Ste 1800	# 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
Oakland, CA 94612-0550	Los Angeles CA 90012	San Francisco, CA 94102
Colusa County District Attorney	Inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
Courthouse, 547 Market St Colusa, CA 95932	P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Drive
Colusa, OA 93932	Independence, CA 93526	Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney
725 Court St., Room 402	PO Box 808	550 W. Main St.
Martinez, CA 94553	Santa Ana. CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney
450 "H" St.	10075 Levon Ave.	P0 Box 720
Crescent City, CA 95531	Truckee, CA 96161	Nana, CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney
515 Main St.	520 Main Street, Rm 404	3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
Placerville, CA 95667-5697	Ouincy, CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501
Fresno County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th St
2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000	901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	Hollister, CA 95023
Fresno, CA 93721 Glenn County District Attorney	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Siskiyou County District Attorney
PO Box 430	County Government Center, Rm 450	PO Box 986
Willows. CA 95988	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Yreka, CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney	San Mateo County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
825 5th St., 4th Floor	400 County Center	600 Union Ave
Eureka, CA 95501	Redwood City, CA 94063	Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney
939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor	1112 Santa Barbara St.	600 Administration Dr.
El Centro, CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Rm 212-J
Van County District Attomas	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Santa Rosa, CA 95403 Shasta County District Attorney
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Ave.	70 W Hedding St.	1355 West St.
Bakersfield, CA 93301	San Jose, CA 95110	Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney
Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd	701 Ocean St., Room 200	PO Box 457
Hanford, CA 93230	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Downieville, CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
255 N Forbes St	P0 Box 442	PO Box 310
Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	Modesto, CA 95353	Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street	446 Second Street	215 5th St
Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Yuba City, CA 95991	Marysville, CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney	Monterey County District Attorney
City Center Plaza	200 S Lassen St. Suite 8	PO Box 1131
1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101	Susanville, CA 96130	Salinas. CA 93902
Tuolumne County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney
2 S Green St	County Civic Center, Rm 224	310 Second St
Sonora, CA 95370	Visalia, CA 93291	Woodland, CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	SanJose City Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave	P.O. Box 519	200 E. Santa Clara St
Ventura, CA 93009	Red Bluff; CA 96080	16th Floor
Tontara, Cri 7.1007		San Jose, CA 95110