



October 15, 2014

Mr. William S. Presti
Vice President and Chief Legal Counsel
Sidney Frank Importing Co., Inc.
20 Cedar Street, Suite 203
New Rochelle, NY 10801

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST SIDNEY FRANK IMPORTING CO., INC., OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

Jesse Garrett ("Garrett") is a citizen of the state of California acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Mr. Garrett has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* by Sidney Frank Importing Co., Inc., a New York corporation (the "Violator"). This letter serves to provide Mr. Garrett's notification of these violations to the Violator and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Mr. Garrett intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are alcoholic beverages manufactured, distributed, offered for sale, and/or served to California consumers by Violator ("Products"). The location of the violations include Safeway, 2350 Noriega St., San Francisco, CA 94122, where the Products were sold without a warning on or before September 30, 2014, and continuing thereafter.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violator.

Vineet Dubey, Esq.
dubey@CD-Lawyers.com

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Alcoholic beverages, when associated with alcohol abuse; 2) Ethyl alcohol in alcoholic beverages; and 3) Ethanol in alcoholic beverages.

Pursuant to Title 27, CCR § 25603.3(e)(7): “For alcoholic beverages, the placement and maintenance of the warning shall be the responsibility of the manufacturer or its distributor at no cost to the retailer, and any consequence for failure to do the same shall rest solely with the manufacturer or its distributor, provided that the retailer does not remove, deface, or obscure the requisite signs or notices, or obstruct, interfere with, or otherwise frustrate the manufacturer’s reasonable efforts to post, maintain, or periodically replace said materials.”

Mr. Garrett intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violator, unless California agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Mr. Garrett is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites violator, should it seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Garrett’s attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Mr. Garrett’s attorneys, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com) or Miguel A. Custodio, Jr.(custodio@cd-lawyers.com), 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101, 213-785-2909.

Sincerely,



Vineet Dubey
Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:
Proposition 65 summary
Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Jesse Garrett's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Sidney Frank Importing Co., Inc.

I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.


2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience, extensively reviewed Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2), and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibits 1 and 2 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.

4. Based on the information obtained; Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2); and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: October 15, 2014



Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (*only sent to Attorney General*)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Mr. William S. Presti
Vice President and Chief Legal Counsel
Sidney Frank Importing Co., Inc.
20 Cedar Street, Suite 203
New Rochelle, NY 10801

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

October 15, 2014



Vineet Dubey

Distribution List

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St. Room 900 Oakland. CA 94612	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St. 18th Floor Los Angeles. CA 90012	Mono County District Attorney PO Box 617 Bridgeport. CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248 Markleeville. CA 96120	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave Madera. CA 93637	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990 Stockton. CA 95201 -0990
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court. Suite 202 Jackson. CA 95642	Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa. CA 95338	San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant St. Rm 322 San Francisco. CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Dr. Oroville. CA 95965-3385	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive. #130 San Rafael. CA 94903	San Diego County District Attorney 220 W Broadway, Ste 1200 San Diego. CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas. CA 95249	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah. CA 95482	San Bernardino County District Attorney 316 N Mountain View Ave San Bernardino. CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 70550 Oakland. CA 94612-0550	Los Angeles City Attorney 200 N Main St Ste 1800 Los Angeles CA 90012	San Francisco City Attorney # 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234 San Francisco, CA 94102
Colusa County District Attorney Courthouse. 547 Market St Colusa. CA 95932	Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence. CA 93526	Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive Suite 240 Roseville. CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney 725 Court St., Room 402 Martinez. CA 94553	Orange County District Attorney PO Box 808 Santa Ana. CA 92702	Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main St. Merced. CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 "H" St. Crescent City. CA 95531	Nevada County District Attorney 10075 Levon Ave. Truckee. CA 96161	Napa County District Attorney PO Box 720 Napa. CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main St. Placerville. CA 95667-5697	Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street. Rm 404 Quincy. CA 95971	Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street, Suite 6 Riverside. CA 92501
Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare St. Ste. 1000 Fresno. CA 93721	Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento. CA 95814	San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th St Hollister. CA 95023
Glenn County District Attorney PO Box 430 Willows. CA 95988	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney County Government Center. Rm 450 San Luis Obispo. CA 93408	Siskiyou County District Attorney PO Box 986 Yreka. CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th St., 4th Floor Eureka. CA 95501	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center Redwood City. CA 94063	Solano County District Attorney 600 Union Ave Fairfield. CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney 939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor El Centro. CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara. CA 93101	Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr. Rm 212-J Santa Rosa. CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Ave. Bakersfield. CA 93301	Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St. San Jose. CA 95110	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West St. Redding. CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford. CA 93230	Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060	Sierra County District Attorney PO Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport. CA 95453-4790	Stanislaus County District Attorney PO Box 442 Modesto. CA 95353	Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville. CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas. CA 96101-4020	Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City. CA 95991	Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego. CA 92101	Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8 Susanville. CA 96130	Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas. CA 93902
Tuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora. CA 95370	Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia. CA 93291	Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St Woodland. CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura. CA 93009	Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff. CA 96080	San Jose City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara St 16th Floor San Jose. CA 95110