

October 21, 2014

Mr. Leo J. Gibson General Counsel WhistlePig, LLC 2139 Quite Valley Road Shoreham, Vermont 05770

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST WHISTLEPIG, LLC, OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

Jesse Garrett ("Garrett") is a citizen of the state of California acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Mr. Garrett has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. by WhistlePig, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company (the "Violator"). This letter serves to provide Mr. Garrett's notification of these violations to the Violator and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Mr. Garrett intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are alcoholic beverages manufactured, distributed, offered for sale, and/or served to California consumers by Violator ("Products"). The location of the violations include Northgate Wine & Spirits, 274 Northgate One, San Rafael, CA 94903, where the Products were sold without a warning on or before October 6, 2014, and continuing thereafter.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violator.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the

proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Alcoholic beverages, when associated with alcohol abuse; 2) Ethyl alcohol in alcoholic beverages; and 3) Ethanol in alcoholic beverages.

Pursuant to Title 27, CCR § 25603.3(e)(7): "For alcoholic beverages, the placement and maintenance of the warning shall be the responsibility of the manufacturer or its distributor at no cost to the retailer, and any consequence for failure to do the same shall rest solely with the manufacturer or its distributor, provided that the retailer does not remove, deface, or obscure the requisite signs or notices, or obstruct, interfere with, or otherwise frustrate the manufacturer's reasonable efforts to post, maintain, or periodically replace said materials."

Mr. Garrett intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violator, unless California agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Mr. Garrett is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites violator, should it seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Garrett's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Mr. Garrett's attorneys, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com) or Miguel A. Custodio, Jr.(custodio@cd-lawyers.com), 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101, 213-785-2909.

Sincerely,

Vineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:

Proposition 65 summary Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Jesse Garrett's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by WhistlePig, LLC.

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience, extensively reviewed Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2), and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibits 1 and 2 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained; Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2); and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: October 21, 2014

Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Mr. Leo J. Gibson General Counsel WhistlePig, LLC 2139 Quite Valley Road Shoreham, Vermont 05770

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

October 21, 2014

Vineet Dubey

## **Distribution List**

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St. Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St. 18th Floor Los Angeles. CA 90012	Mono County District Attorney PO Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990
Markleeville, CA 96120 Amador County District Attorney	Madera. CA 93637  Mariposa County District Attorney	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990 San Francisco County District Attorney
708 Court. Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642	P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	850 Bryant St, Rm 322 San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Dr.	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, #130	San Diego County District Attorney
Oroville. CA 95965-3385	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah. CA 95482	316 N Mountain View Ave San Bernardino. CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 70550	Los Angeles City Attorney 200 N Main St Ste 1800	San Francisco City Attorney
Oakland, CA 94612-0550	Los Angeles CA 90012	# 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234 San Francisco, CA 94102
Colusa County District Attorney	Inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
Courthouse, 547 Market St Colusa, CA 95932	P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526	10810 Justice Center Drive Suite 240
		Roseville, CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney 725 Court St., Room 402	Orange County District Attorney PO Box 808	Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main St.
Martinez, CA 94553	Santa Ana. CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney
450 "H" St. Crescent City, CA 95531	10075 Levon Ave. Truckee, CA 96161	PO Box 720 Nana, CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney
515 Main St.	520 Main Street, Rm 404	3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
Placerville, CA 95667-5697 Fresno County District Attorney	Ouincy, CA 95971 Sacramento County District Attorney	Riverside, CA 92501 San Benito County District Attorney
2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000	901 G Street	419 4th St
Fresno, CA 93721 Glenn County District Attorney	Sacramento, CA 95814 San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Hollister, CA 95023 Siskiyou County District Attorney
PO Box 430	County Government Center, Rm 450	PO Box 986
Willows, CA 95988 Humboldt County District Attorney	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Yreka, CA 96097
825 5th St., 4th Floor	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center	Solano County District Attorney 600 Union Ave
Eureka, CA 95501	Redwood City. CA 94063	Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney 939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor	Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr.
El Centro. CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Rm 212-J
		Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Ave.	Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St.	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West St.
Bakersfield, CA 93301	San Jose, CA 95110	Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney
Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353	PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020	446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney	Monterey County District Attorney
City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100	200 S Lassen St. Suite 8	PO Box 1131
San Diego, CA 92101	Susanville, CA 96130	Salinas, CA 93902
Tuolumne County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney
2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370	County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	310 Second St
Ventura County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	Woodland, CA 95695 SanJose City Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave	P.O. Box 519	200 E. Santa Clara St
Ventura, CA 93009	Red Bluff; CA 96080	16th Floor San Jose, CA 95110