

November 3, 2014

Spottswoode Winery, Inc. c/o Beth Milliken 1902 Madrona Ave. St. Helena, CA 94574

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST SPOTTSWOODE WINERY, INC., OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

John Bonilla ("Bonilla") is a citizen of the state of California acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Mr. Bonilla has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. by Spottswoode Winery, Inc., a California corporation (the "Violator"). This letter serves to provide Mr. Bonilla's notification of these violations to the Violator and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Mr. Bonilla intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are alcoholic beverages manufactured, distributed, offered for sale, and/or served to California consumers by Violator ("Products"). The location of the violations include Vintage Wine & Spirits, 82 Throckmorton Ave., Mill Valley, CA 94941, where the Products were sold without a warning on or before October 7, 2014, and continuing thereafter.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violator.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Alcoholic beverages, when associated with alcohol abuse;

2) Ethyl alcohol in alcoholic beverages; and 3) Ethanol in alcoholic beverages.

Pursuant to Title 27, CCR § 25603.3(e)(7): "For alcoholic beverages, the placement and maintenance of the warning shall be the responsibility of the manufacturer or its distributor at no cost to the retailer, and any consequence for failure to do the same shall rest solely with the manufacturer or its distributor, provided that the retailer does not remove, deface, or obscure the requisite signs or notices, or obstruct, interfere with, or otherwise frustrate the manufacturer's reasonable efforts to post, maintain, or periodically replace said materials."

Mr. Bonilla intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violator, unless Violator agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Mr. Bonilla is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites violator, should it seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Bonilla's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Mr. Bonilla's attorneys, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com) or Miguel A. Custodio, Jr.(custodio@cd-lawyers.com), 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101, 213-785-2909.

Sincerely,

Vineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:
Proposition 65 summary
Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: John Bonilla's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Spottswoode Winery, Inc.

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience, extensively reviewed Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2), and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained; Title 22, CCR §12601(b)(1)(D)(2); and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: November 3, 2014

Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 766 E. Colorado Blvd., Ste 108, Pasadena, CA 91101.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Spottswoode Winery, Inc. c/o Beth Milliken 1902 Madrona Ave. St. Helena, CA 94574

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

November 3, 2014

Vineet Dubey

## **Distribution List**

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St. Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St. 18th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Mono County District Attorney PO Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera. CA 93637	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990
Amador County District Attorney	Mariposa County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney
708 Court, Suite 202	P.O. Box 730	850 Bryant St, Rm 322
Jackson, CA 95642	Mariposa, CA 95338	San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
25 County Center Dr.	3501 Civic Center Drive, #130	220 W Denadurar eta 1200
Oroville, CA 95965-3385	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road	P.O. Box 1000	316 N Mountain View Ave San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
San Andreas, CA 95249	Ukiah. CA 95482	
Office of the Attorney General	Los Angeles City Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney
P.O. Box 70550	200 N Main St Ste 1800	# 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
Oakland, CA 94612-0550 Colusa County District Attorney	Los Angeles CA 90012	San Francisco, CA 94102
Courthouse, 547 Market St	Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D	Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive
Colusa, CA 95932	Independence, CA 93526	Suite 240
	independence: CA 5.520	Roseville, CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney
725 Court St., Room 402	P0 Box 808	550 W. Main St.
Martinez, CA 94553	Santa Ana. CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney
450 "H" St.	10075 Levon Ave.	P0 Box 720
Crescent City, CA 95531	Truckee, CA 96161	Nana, CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney
515 Main St.	520 Main Street, Rm 404	3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
Placerville, CA 95667-5697 Fresno County District Attorney	Ouincy, CA 95971 Sacramento County District Attorney	Riverside, CA 92501 San Benito County District Attorney
2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000	901 G Street	419 4th St
Fresno, CA 93721	Sacramento, CA 95814	Hollister, CA 95023
Glenn County District Attorney	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Siskiyou County District Attorney
PO Box 430	County Government Center, Rm 450	PO Box 986
Willows, CA 95988	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Yreka, CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney	San Mateo County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
825 5th St., 4th Floor	400 County Center	600 Union Ave
Eureka, CA 95501 Imperial County District Attorney	Redwood City, CA 94063	Fairfield, CA 94533
939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor	Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St.	Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr.
El Centro. CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Rm 212-J
	Santa Barbara. C.1 75101	Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
1215 Truxtun Ave.	70 W Hedding St.	1355 West St.
	San Jose, CA 95110	Dadding CA 06001 1622
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd	701 Ocean St., Room 200	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney PO Box 442	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney PO Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 Yuba County District Attorney
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney L55 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney L04 S. Court Street	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney LO4 S. Court Street Muras, CA 96101-4020	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060  Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353  Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney P0 Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060  Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353  Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991  Lassen County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060  Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353  Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991  Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060  Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353  Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991  Lassen County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas. CA 93902
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130 Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 Gan Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130 Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney P0 Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville. CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney P0 Box 1131 Salinas. CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370 Ventura County District Attorney	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060  Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353  Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991  Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130  Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291  Tehama County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas. CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St
Bakersfield, CA 93301 Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr. 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Tuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370 Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz. CA 95060  Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353  Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991  Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St. Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130  Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457 Downieville. CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas. CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695