60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

(Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code, § 2549.7(d)) Re: 4-methylimidazole (4-MEI) Found in Carbonated Drinks with Caramel Coloring

Date: February 10, 2015

 To: Camalia Valdés, President and CEO of Compañía Cervecera de Puerto Rico, Inc. California Attorney General's Office;
Each California District Attorney's Office (see service list below)
Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, and San Francisco City Attorneys' Offices

From: Rudy Cantoran

I, Rudy Cantoran, provide this Notice of Violation to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7, subsection d. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to increase the public's awareness and the safety regarding products sold for consumption in California that expose the public to unsafe levels of carcinogens. I can be reached at 15072 Christina Ct., Lake Elsinore, CA 92530, (310) 701-3053. The violations covered by this Notice consist of the products' exposures, routes of exposure, and type of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical identified below, as follows:

Description of Violation:

• Violators:

Compañía Cervecera de Puerto Rico, Inc. 100 Blvd. Alfonso Valdes Mayaguez, PR 00680

- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least January 7, 2012, and are ongoing.
- <u>Proposition 65 Provision Violated:</u> This Notice of Violation involves violation of California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 for failure to provide a "warning provision" required by Proposition 65.
- <u>Listed Chemical Involved:</u> 4-methylimidazol ("4-MEI"), a carcinogen.

- <u>Description of Exposure</u>: Consumers ingest the products identified by this Notice, which contain 4-MEI. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products identified by this Notice regarding carcinogen hazards associated with 4-MEI exposure.
- <u>Type of Product:</u> Carbonated beverages containing caramel coloring. Non-exclusive example is: Malta India

Resolution of Notice Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged violator 60 days after effective service unless such alleged violator enters into a binding written agreement to remedy the violations alleged herein by:

(1) Recalling products already sold;

(2) Reformulating such products to eliminate the 4-MEI exposure or taking appropriate measures to otherwise comply with Proposition 65; and

(3) Paying an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b).

If any of the alleged violators is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to litigation, please feel free to contact me through my counsel identified below. It should be noted that I and my counsel may not: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received my 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with myself will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to my counsel: Wade Miller at 235 E. Broadway, Ste. 424, Long Beach, CA 90802, (562) 437-6300, wmiller@wademillerlaw.com.

Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health & Safety Code§ 25249.7(d)

I, Wade Miller, hereby declare:

(1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

(2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.

(3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

(4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

(5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: February 6, 2015

Wade Miller

PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL AND ELECTRONIC MAIL

I declare that:

I am employed in Long Beach, California; my business address is 235 E. Broadway, Ste. 424, Long Beach, CA 90802. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within cause and my electronic notification address is btucker@wademillerlaw.com.

On February 10, 2015, I served true copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 2549.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (only served on Attorney General)

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY (only served on Compañía Cervecera de Puerto Rico, Inc.)

On this date, I transmitted the above documents via electronic mail to the electronic mail addresses set forth below at 133 pm pst on February 10, 2015:

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County sgrassini@contracostada.org

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

District Attorney Napa County CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County Prop65@rivcoda.org Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County EPU@da.sccgov.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County Jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County daspecialops@ventura.org

The transmission was reported as complete and without error.

On February 10, 2015, I deposited fully prepaid and sealed envelopes containing the above mentioned documents with the United States Postal Service, addressed to the individuals in the attached service list.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on February 10, 2015 at Long Beach, California.

Dated: February 10, 2015

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Rm. 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney of Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Ste. 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney of Colusa County 547 Market Street, Ste. 102 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney of Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County 939 Main Street, Ste. 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Inyo County P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney of Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney of Los Angeles County 210 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1800 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637 District Attorney of Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney of Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney of Modoc County 204 S. Court Street, Ste. 202 Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93546

District Attorney of Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney of Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste. 240. Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney of Plumas County 520 Main Street, Rm. 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney of Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney of San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl. Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney o f San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Ste. 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney of San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Rm. 325 San Francisco, CA 94103

District Attorney of San Joaquin County P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney of San Luis Obispo County 1050 Monterey Street, Rm. 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3'd Fl. Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 District Attorney of Santa Barbara County Attn: Jerry Lule-Jian 312-D E. Cook Street Santa Maria, CA 93454

District Attorney of Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2nd Fl. Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County P.O. Box 310, 11 Court Street Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney of Yuba County 21 5 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Avenue, Ste. 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

District Attorney of Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, California 95354

Carmen A Valdes Compañía Cervecera de Puerto Rico, Inc. P.O. Box 1690 Mayaguez, PR 00681-1690