

June 2, 2015

True Value Company c/o CT Corporation System 818 W. 7th St. #930 Los Angeles, CA 90017

Denault's Hardware-Home Centers, Inc. c/o Ruth E. Denault 23281 Antonio Pkwy Rancho Santa Margarita, CA 92688

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST TRUE VALUE COMPANY AND DENAULT'S HARDWARE-HOME CENTERS, INC., OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

Ecological Alliance, LLC, a California limited liability company ("Alliance") is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Alliance has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* by True Value Company, a Delaware corporation and Denault's Hardware-Home Centers, Inc., a California corporation (collectively the "Violators"). This letter serves to provide Alliance's notification of these violations to the Violators and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Alliance intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this amended notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are Brass Locks, UPC #052088071847 ("Products") manufactured by True Value Company and offered for sale by Denault's Hardware-Home Centers, Inc., to California consumers.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violators.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Lead. The routes of exposure for this chemical are ingestion and dermal. Such exposure can cause birth defects and other reproductive harm. Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the clear and reasonable warnings required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as June 2, 2014, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Alliance intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violaters agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Alliance is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites Violators, should they seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Alliance's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Alliance's attorney, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com), Custodio & Dubey LLP, 448 S. Hill St., Suite 850, Los Angeles, CA 90013, 213-785-2909.

Sincerely,

Vineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:
Proposition 65 summary
Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Ecological Alliance, LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by True Value Company and Denault's Hardware-Home Centers, Inc.

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: June 2, 2015

Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 448 S. Hill St., Ste 850, Los Angeles, CA 90013.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) Amended 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

True Value Company c/o CT Corporation System 818 W. 7th St. #930 Los Angeles, CA 90017

Denault's Hardware-Home Centers, Inc. c/o Ruth E. Denault 23281 Antonio Pkwy Rancho Santa Margarita, CA 92688

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

June 2, 2015

Vineet Dubey

## **Distribution List**

	Distribution List	
Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St, Room 900	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St, 18th Floor	Mono County District Attorney P0 Box 617
Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990
Amador County District Attorney	Madera, CA 93637 Mariposa County District Attorney	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990 San Francisco County District Attorney
708 Court, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642	P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	850 Bryant St, Rm 322 San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Dr.	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, #130	San Diego County District Attorney
Oroville, CA 95965-3385	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000	San Bernardino County District Attorney 316 N Mountain View Ave
San Andreas. CA 95249	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 70550	Los Angeles City Attorney 200 N Main St Ste 1800	San Francisco City Attorney # 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
Oakland, CA 94612-0550 Colusa County District Attorney	Los Angeles CA 90012	San Francisco, CA 94102
Courthouse, 547 Market St	Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D	Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive
Colusa, <i>CA</i> 95932	Independence, CA 93526	Suite 240 Roseville. CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney
725 Court St., Room 402 Martinez, CA 94553	PO Box 808 Santa Ana, CA 92702	550 W. Main St. Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 "H" St.	Nevada County District Attorney 10075 Levon Ave.	Napa County District Attorney P0 Box 720
Crescent City, CA 95531	Truckee, CA 96161	Nana. CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main St.	Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Rm 404	Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
Placerville, CA 95667-5697 Fresno County District Attorney	Ouiney, CA 95971 Sacramento County District Attorney	Riverside, CA 92501
2220 Tulare St. Ste. 1000	901 G Street	San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th St
Fresno, CA 93721 Glenn County District Attorney	Sacramento, CA 95814 San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Hollister, CA 95023 Siskiyou County District Attorney
PO Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	County Government Center, Rm 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	PO Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney	San Mateo County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
825 5th St., 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501	400 County Center Redwood City, CA 94063	600 Union Ave Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney 939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor	Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St.	Sonoma County District Attorney
El Centro, CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	600 Administration Dr. Rm 212-J
Kern County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Santa Rosa, CA 95403 Shasta County District Attorney
1215 Truxtun Ave.	70 W Hedding St. San Jose, CA 95110	1355 West St.
Bakersfield, CA 93301 Kings County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Redding, CA 96001-1632 Sierra County District Attorney
Gov't Ctr, 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230	701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	P0 Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St	Stanislaus County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353	PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street Alturas. CA 96101-4020	446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza	Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8	Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131
1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101	Susanville. CA 96130	Salinas, CA 93902
Tuolumne County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney
2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370	County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	SanJose City Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009	P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff: CA 96080	200 E. Santa Clara St 16th Floor
		San Jose, CA 95110