

June 10, 2015

Orbit Irrigation Products, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 1108 E. South Union Ave. Midvale, UT 84047

Ace Hardware Corporation c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST ORBIT IRRIGATION PRODUCTS, INC. AND ACE HARDWARE CORPORATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

Ecological Alliance, LLC, a California limited liability company ("Alliance") is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Alliance has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* by Orbit Irrigation Products, Inc., a Utah corporation and Ace Hardware Corporation, a Delaware corporation (collectively the "Violators"). This letter serves to provide Alliance's notification of these violations to the Violators and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Alliance intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this amended notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are Brass Mist Nozzles, UPC #718455101219 ("Products") manufactured by Orbit Irrigation Products, Inc. and offered for sale by Ace Hardware Corporation, to California consumers.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violators.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Lead. The routes of exposure for this chemical are ingestion and dermal. Such exposure can cause birth defects and other reproductive harm. Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the clear and reasonable warnings required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as June 10, 2014, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Alliance intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violaters agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Alliance is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites Violators, should they seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Alliance's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Alliance's attorney, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com), Custodio & Dubey LLP, 448 S. Hill St., Suite 850, Los Angeles, CA 90013, 213-785-2909.

Sincerely,

Vineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:
Proposition 65 summary
Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Ecological Alliance, LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Orbit Irrigation Products, Inc. and Ace Hardware Corporation.

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: June 10, 2015

Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 448 S. Hill St., Ste 850, Los Angeles, CA 90013.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) Amended 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Orbit Irrigation Products, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 1108 E. South Union Ave. Midvale, UT 84047

Ace Hardware Corporation c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

June 10, 2015

Vineet Dubey

## **Distribution List**

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St, 18th Floor Los Angeles. CA 90012	Mono County District Attorney PO Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney
PO Box 248	209 W Yosemite Ave	PO Box 990
Markleeville, CA 96120 Amador County District Attorney	Madera, CA 93637  Mariposa County District Attorney	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990 San Francisco County District Attorney
708 Court, Suite 202	P.O. Box 730	850 Bryant St, Rm 322
Jackson, CA 95642	Mariposa, CA 95338	San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Dr.	Marin County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
Oroville, CA 95965-3385	3501 Civic Center Drive, #130 San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road	P.O. Box 1000	316 N Mountain View Ave
San Andreas, CA 95249	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General	Los Angeles City Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney
P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550	200 N Main St Ste 1800 Los Angeles CA 90012	# 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
Colusa County District Attorney	Inyo County District Attorney	San Francisco, CA 94102 Placer County District Attorney
Courthouse, 547 Market St	P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Drive
Colusa, <i>CÁ</i> 95932	Independence, CA 93526	Suite 240
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Oranga County Dioteiat Assessment	Roseville, CA 95678-6231
725 Court St., Room 402	Orange County District Attorney PO Box 808	Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main St.
Martinez. CA 94553	Santa Ana, CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney
450 "H" St.	10075 Levon Ave.	P0 Box 720
Crescent City, CA 95531 El Dorado County District Attorney	Truckee, CA 96161 Plumas County District Attorney	Nana, CA 94559-0720 Riverside County District Attorney
515 Main St.	520 Main Street, Rm 404	3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
Placerville, CA 95667-5697	Ouinev. CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501
Fresno County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney
2220 Tulare St. Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	419 4th St Hollister, CA 95023
Glenn County District Attorney	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Siskiyou County District Attorney
PO Box 430	County Government Center, Rm 450	PO Box 986
Willows, CA 95988	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Yreka, CA 96097
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th St., 4th Floor	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center	Solano County District Attorney 600 Union Ave
Eureka, CA 95501	Redwood City, CA 94063	Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney
939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor	1112 Santa Barbara St.	600 Administration Dr.
El Centro, CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Rm 212-J Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
1215 Truxtun Ave.	70W Hedding St.	1355 West St.
Bakersfield, CA 93301	San Jose, CA 95110	Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr, 1400 W Lacey Blvd	Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean St., Room 200	Sierra County District Attorney PO Box 457
Hanford, CA 93230	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Downieville, CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
255 N Forbes St	PO Box 442	PO Box 310
Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	Modesto, CA 95353	Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street Alturas. CA 96101-4020	446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney	Monterey County District Attorney
City Center Plaza	200 S Lassen St, Suite 8	PO Box 1131
1200 3rd Ave # 1100	Susanville. CA 96130	Salinas, CA 93902
San Diego, CA 92101 Tuolumne County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney
2 S Green St	County Civic Center, Rm 224	310 Second St
Sonora, CA 95370	Visalia. CA 93291	Woodland, CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	San Jose City Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009	P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff; CA 96080	200 E. Santa Clara St
* Cintara, C/1 /300/	INCO DIOIT. CA 70000	16th Floor San Jose, CA 95110