### NOTICE OF VIOLATION

# California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Lead in Clothing Made With Leather, Vinyl or Imitation Leather Materials

September 21, 2015

This Notice of Violation is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice of Violation is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health and supporting environmentally sound practices. Charlie Pizarro is the Associate Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

## **Description of Violation:**

- <u>Violators</u>: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least September 21, 2012, and are continuing to this day.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice of Violation covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- <u>Chemical(s) Involved</u>: The names of the listed chemicals involved in these violations are lead and lead compounds ("Lead"). Exposures to Lead occur from use of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations is clothing made with leather, vinyl or imitation leather materials. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to Lead. Use of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to Lead. Lead is found in the products as a stabilizer in the vinyl or imitation leather materials, as a chemical ingredient in some of the dies, paints and other coloring agents used in the products and in the chemicals used in the leather tanning process. The routes of exposure for the violations are direct ingestion when consumers (including children) place the products in their mouths; ingestion via hand to mouth contact after consumers wear, touch or handle the products; and dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers wear, touch or handle the products. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards of Lead.

### Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the Lead exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

### Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in clothing made with leather, vinyl or imitation leather materials; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by the alleged violators in the year preceding this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Howard Hirsch at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, hhirsch at lexlawgroup.com.

# EXHIBIT 1 September 21, 2015 Notice of Violation Lead in Clothing Made with Leather, Vinyl or Imitation Leather Materials

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	Item or SKU # or Further Description
Forever 21 Retail, Inc. 3880 N. Mission Road Room 3030 Los Angeles, CA 90031	Forever 21 Iconic Faux Leather Mini Skirt in Seashell Pink	SKU No. 00126788024 Item No. 2000126788
LCEL Collectibles Inc. 530 Seventh Avenue 23 <sup>rd</sup> Floor New York, NY 10018	Carmen Marc Valvo Carmen Cut & Sew Rope Dress in Black	Ross SKU No. 400127713713 Style No. CD400015
Neiman Marcus Group LTD LLC 1618 Main Street Dallas, TX 75201  The Neiman Marcus Group LLC 1618 Main Street Dallas, TX 75201	Neiman Marcus Leather Mesh Front Scoop Sleeveless Top in Ginger	SKU No. 1103-5124 Item No. LCS15_T7V0J
OASAP (US) Limited 702 N. West Street Suite 101 Wilmington, DE 19801	OASAP Sexy Faux Leather Skirt in Brown	Product No. OP47081 SKU No. 47081H206077
	OASAP Sultry Sunrise PU Leather Crop Jacket in Red	Product No. OP52820
Ross Stores, Inc. 5130 Hacienda Drive Dublin, CA 94568	Carmen Marc Valvo Carmen Cut & Sew Rope Dress in Black	Ross SKU No. 400127713713 Style No. CD400015

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Howard Hirsch, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is

alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by

failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing

party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant

and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data

regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other

information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the

private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action"

means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can

be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to

establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it

factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information

identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted

with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those

persons.

September 21, 2015

Howard Hirsch

Attorney for CENTER FOR

**ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH** 

## PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL AND ELECTRONIC MAIL

I declare that:

I am employed in San Francisco County, California; my business address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, California 94117. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within cause and my electronic notification address is cfisher@lexlawgroup.com.

On September 21, 2015, I served true copies of the following documents:

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**; and

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY (only sent to those on service list marked with an asterisk).

On this date, I deposited fully prepaid and sealed envelopes containing the abovementioned documents with the United States Postal Service, addressed to the following individuals:

### Please see attached service list.

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Yeng Dang
Supervising Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County
70 West Hedding Street, West Wing
San Jose, CA 95110
epu@da.sccgov.org

Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Rm. 224 Visalia, CA 93291 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 4075 Main Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

The transmission was reported as complete and without error.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on September 21, 2015, at San Francisco, California.

Signed:

Casev Fishe

### SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Rm. 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney of Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Ste. 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney of Colusa County 547 Market Street, Ste. 102 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney of Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County 939 Main Street, Ste. 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Invo County P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney of Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles 210 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1800 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mariposa County District Attorney of San P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney of Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney of Modoc County 204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93546

District Attorney of Monterey County 230 Church Street, Bldg. 2 & 3 Salinas, CA 93901 P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney of Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney of Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste. 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney of Plumas County 520 Main Street, Rm. 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney of Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney of San Benito 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl. Hollister, CA 95023

Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney of San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Ste. 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney of San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Rm. 325 San Francisco, CA 94103

District Attorney of San Joaquin County P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney of San Luis Obispo County 1050 Monterey Street, Rm. 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3rd Fl. Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney of Santa Barbara County Attn: Jerry Lule-Jian 312-D E. Cook Street Santa Maria, CA 93454

District Attorney of Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2<sup>nd</sup> Fl. Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County LCEL Collectibles Inc. 832 12th Street, Ste. 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County P.O. Box 310 11 Court Street Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Avenue, Ste. 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

California Attorney General's Office Attention: Proposition 65 Coordinator and Robert Thomas 1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

President\* Forever 21 Retail, Inc. 3880 N. Mission Road Room 3030 Los Angeles, CA 90031

Carmen M. Valvo, CEO\* 530 Seventh Avenue 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor New York, NY 10018

Carmen M. Valvo, CEO\* LCEL Collectibles Inc. 132 W. 36th Street 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor New York, NY 10018

Karen W. Katz. CEO\* Neiman Marcus Group LTD LLC 1618 Main Street Dallas, TX 75201

President\* The Neiman Marcus Group LLC 1618 Main Street Dallas, TX 75201

President\* OASAP (US) Limited 702 N. West Street Suite 101 Wilmington, DE 19801 Michael O'Sullivan, President\* Ross Stores, Inc. 5130 Hacienda Drive Dublin, CA 94568