### ADAMS BROADWELL JOSEPH & CARDOZO

A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

#### ATTORNEYS AT LAW

601 GATEWAY BOULEVARD, SUITE 1000 SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94080-7037

TEL: (650) 589-1660 FAX: (650) 589-5062 ccaro@adamsbroadwell.com SACRAMENTO OFFICE

520 CAPITOL MALL, SUITE 350 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-4721

TEL: (916) 444-6201 FAX: (916) 444-6209

#### **VIA CERTIFIED MAIL**

DANIEL L. CARDOZO

CHRISTINA M. CARO

THOMAS A. ENSLOW

TANYA A. GULESSERIAN

LAURA E. HORTON

MARC D. JOSEPH

RACHAEL E. KOSS JAMIE L. MAULDIN

ELLEN L. WEHR

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. 2503 South Hanley Road Saint Louis, MO 63144

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 2503 South Hanley Road Saint Louis, MO 63144

Robert V. Vitale or Current Manager Paul Rode or Current President Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 3717 Commerce Place, Suite E Bedford, TX 76021

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 3717 Commerce Place, Suite E Bedford, TX 76021

Robert V. Vitale or Current Manager Paul Rode or Current President Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 13737 North Stemmons Freeway Farmers Branch, TX 75234

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 13737 North Stemmons Freeway Farmers Branch, TX 75234

#### **VIA CERTIFIED MAIL**

Corporate Creations Network, Inc. (Post Holdings, Inc.'s Registered Agent for Service of Process) 12747 Olive Boulevard, Suite 300 Saint Louis, MO 63141

Corporate Creations Network, Inc. (Dymatize Enterprises, LLC's Registered Agent for Service of Process) 4265 San Felipe Street, Suite 1100 Houston, TX 77027

Corporate Creations Network, Inc. (Dynatize Enterprises, LLC's Registered Agent for Service of Process) 3411 Silverside Road, #104 Rodney Building Wilmington, DE 19810

Corporate Creations Network Inc. (Post Holdings, Inc. which will do business in California as Post Foods' Registered Agent for Service of Process)
1430 Truxtun Avenue, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor
Bakersfield, CA 93301

### **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Yolo County District Attorney 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

#### **VIA PRIORITY MAIL**

District Attorneys of Select California Counties and Select City Attorneys (See Attached Certificate of Service)

#### **VIA ONLINE SUBMISSION**

Office of the California Attorney General

Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.

Dear Addressees:

I represent the Environmental Research Center, Inc. ("ERC") in connection with this Notice of Violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 *et seq.* and also referred to as Proposition 65.

ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

The names of the Companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Post Holdings, Inc.
Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC
Dymatize Enterprises, LLC

The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- 1. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition ISO-100 Fudge Brownie Lead
- 2. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Mass Double Chocolate Lead
- 3. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite 100% Whey Protein Cookies & Cream Lead
- 4. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Cappuccino Rush Lead
- 5. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Super Mass Gainer Gourmet Vanilla Lead
- 6. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Super Mass Gainer Rich Chocolate Lead

- 7. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Super Mass Gainer Strawberry
- 8. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Super Mass Gainer Cookies & Cream Lead
- 9. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Cookies & Cream Lead
- 10. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Creamy Vanilla Shake Lead
- 11. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Rich Chocolate Shake Lead
- 12. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Chocolate Peanut Butter Lead
- 13. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Orange Dreamsicle Lead
- 14. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Strawberry Banana Lead
- 15. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Gourmet Swiss Chocolate Lead
- 16. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite Fusion7 Banana Smoothie Lead
- 17. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite XT Rich Chocolate Lead
- 18. Dymatize Enterprises LLC Dymatize Nutrition Elite XT Fudge Brownie Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

This letter is a notice to the Violators and the appropriate governmental authorities of the Proposition 65 violations concerning the listed products. This notice covers all violations of Proposition 65 involving the Violators currently known to ERC from the information now available. ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations. A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with the copy of this letter to the Violators.

The Violators have manufactured, marketed, distributed, and/or sold the listed products, which have exposed and continue to expose numerous individuals within California to the identified chemical, lead. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and/or recommended use of these products by consumers. The primary route of exposure to lead has been through ingestion, but may have also occurred through inhalation and/or dermal contact. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to lead. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide an appropriate warning to persons using and/or handling these products that they are being exposed to lead. Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since November 5, 2012, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users.

Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a citizen enforcement action sixty days after effective service of this notice unless the Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) reformulate the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and my client's objectives in pursuing this notice, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical and expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall, and is located at 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. 619-500-3090. ERC has retained me in connection with this matter. We suggest that communications regarding this Notice of Violations should be directed to my attention at the above listed law office address and telephone number.

Sincerely,

Christina M. Caro

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Post Holdings, Inc., Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC, Dymatize Enterprises, LLC and their Registered Agents for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Post Holdings, Inc., Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC, and Dymatize Enterprises, LLC

#### I, Christina Caro, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: November 5, 2015

Christina M. Caro

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On November 5, 2015, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY"** on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. 2503 South Hanley Road Saint Louis, MO 63144

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 2503 South Hanley Road Saint Louis, MO 63144

Robert V. Vitale or Current Manager Paul Rode or Current President Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 3717 Commerce Place, Suite E Bedford, TX 76021

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 3717 Commerce Place, Suite E Bedford, TX 76021

Robert V. Vitale or Current Manager Paul Rode or Current President Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 13737 North Stemmons Freeway Farmers Branch, TX 75234

Robert V. Vitale or Current CEO Post Holdings, Inc. dba Dymatize Enterprises, LLC 13737 North Stemmons Freeway Farmers Branch, TX 75234 Corporate Creations Network, Inc. (Post Holdings, Inc.'s Registered Agent for Service of Process) 12747 Olive Boulevard, Suite 300 Saint Louis, MO 63141

Corporate Creations Network, Inc. (Dymatize Enterprises, LLC's Registered Agent for Service of Process) 4265 San Felipe Street, Suite 1100 Houston, TX 77027

Corporate Creations Network, Inc. (Dymatize Enterprises, LLC's Registered Agent for Service of Process) 3411 Silverside Road, #104 Rodney Building Wilmington, DE 19810

Corporate Creations Network Inc. (Post Holdings, Inc. which will do business in California as Post Foods' Registered Agent for Service of Process) 1430 Truxtun Avenue, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301

On November 5, 2015, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1)** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was

uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice :

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On November 5, 2015, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS**, **CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ*.; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to the party listed below:

Yolo County District Attorney 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

On November 5, 2015, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on November 5, 2015, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Phyllis Dunwoody

**Service List** 

Page 8

District Attorney, Alameda County
1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900
Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004 District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291 District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 95113