

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

This 60-Day Notice of Violation Supplements the following 60-Day Notices of Violation:

- 1) **AG#: 2016-00468**
- 2) **AG#: 2015-00317**

DATE: June 10, 2016

To: The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.; Physicians Formula, Inc.; Markwins Beauty Products, Inc.; The Hain Celestial Group, Inc.; Beiersdorf, Inc.; Boots Retail USA, Inc.; Kiss My Face, LLC; Cosmetic Dermatology, Inc.; StriVectin Operating Co., Inc.; Niadyne, Inc.; Peter Thomas Roth LLC; First Aid Beauty, LLC; Galderma Laboratories LP; Origin Natural Resources, Inc.; Clinique Laboratories, Inc., and;

California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorney's Office for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose and San Francisco.

From: Shefa LMV, LLC

I. INTRODUCTION

We are citizens of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. We seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve public health and safety by reducing the hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the parties listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6, et seq. ("Proposition 65"). The violations alleged by this Notice consist of product exposures, routes of exposures, and types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below:

Product Exposure:	See Section VII, Exhibit A
Listed Chemical:	Benzophenone;
Routes of Exposure:	Dermal absorption;
	Ingestion; and Inhalation
Types of Harm:	Carcinogen

II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific type of product that is causing consumer and occupational exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and which is the subject of this Notice, is listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit

A in Section VII below. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the “products.” The sales of these products in California dating at least as far back as **August 12, 2014** are subject to this Notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to the listed chemical have been occurring without clear and responsible warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical, resulting from contact with the products from dermal and ingestion exposure as well as inhalation, California citizenry lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

Through the act of buying, acquiring and using the products, citizens of California are exposed to the listed chemical in homes, workplaces and elsewhere throughout California. Exposure to consumers includes, but is not limited to, application to their bodies, their pets or their children. Benzophenone exposure to consumers includes dermal exposure when consumers handle the product (including through cuts and breaks in the skin) and other migration pathways, including but not limited to incidental ingestion after one touches the chemical and then touches food or otherwise places his hands on or near his lips where his tongue can or will continue this pathway to ingestion exposure. Exposure may continue to occur for a significant period after the initial contact. People likely to be exposed are women, men, and children. These violations and threatened violations pertain to Proposition 65 chemicals that are listed by the state as known to cause cancer.

III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to us through our counsel’s offices at the following address:

Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.
Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum
7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320
Van Nuys, CA 91406
Main: (818) 809-2199
Fax: (424) 243-7689
Email: dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com

IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) in the Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the alleged Violator(s), I have attached a copy of “Proposition 65 in Plain Language” which has been prepared by OEHHA.

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, we intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator(s), unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall

products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those whom have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future, or reformulate such products to eliminate the Benzophenone exposures.

If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day Notice period elapses; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District Attorney or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement that will resolve my claims, such an agreement may not be approved by the Attorney General after referral to them, or by the court as the last voice on settlements.

VI. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

<u>Product</u>	<u>Retailer(s)</u>	<u>Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)</u>
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)		The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.; Physicians Formula, Inc.; Markwins Beauty Products, Inc.; The Hain Celestial Group, Inc.; Beiersdorf, Inc.; Boots Retail USA, Inc.; Kiss My Face, LLC; Cosmetic Dermatology, Inc.; StriVectin Operating Co., Inc.; Niadyne, Inc.; Peter Thomas Roth LLC; First Aid Beauty, LLC; Galderma Laboratories LP; Origin Natural Resources, Inc.; Clinique Laboratories, Inc.,

VII. EXHIBIT A

Identified below are named products which contain the alleged chemicals at issue, and this reference is supportive of the material facts that are a part of my counsel's Certificate of Merit that is attached hereto as being available for purchase or use in California that is within the category or type of offending product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the example within the category or type of product are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business to business, through the internet, and/or via catalog by the alleged Violator(s) and other distributors and retailers of the product.

We are identifying a number of products herein for all recipients' benefit to assist in investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposure to the listed chemical from other items within the Product Category listed in Exhibit A. It is important to note that this

example list does not represent an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of any or all specific products. Further, it is our position that the alleged Violator(s) are obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the type or category described below that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violator(s)' custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Product Category	Specific Product	UPC	Manufacturer/Distributor
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Bobbi Brown SPF 50 Protective Face Base SPF 50 (E8XK)	716170106335	The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Estee Lauder Daywear Advanced Multi-Protection Anti-Oxidant & UV Defense Broad Spectrum SPF 30 Lotion (YCL3)	027131990413	The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	La Mer The Reparative Body Sun Lotion Broad Spectrum SPF 30 Lotion (53ER)	747930042570	The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Alba Botanica, Sea Moss Moisturizer, SPF 15	724742003128	The Hain Celestial Group, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Alba Botanica Hawaiian Greentea SPF 45	724742008277	The Hain Celestial Group, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Jason Sun Sport Sunscreen SPF 45	078522083207	The Hain Celestial Group, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Physicians Formula Super CC All Over Blur Primer Stick	044386066649	Physicians Formula, Inc.
Octocrylene containing	Physicians Formula Wrinkle Corrector SPF 15	044386075276	Physicians Formula, Inc.

Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)			
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Wet n Wild Juicy Lip Balm	077802528322	Markwins Beauty Products, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Black Radiance BB Cream SPF 15	077802645340	Markwins Beauty Products, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Kiss my Face Kids defense spray SPF 50	028367841975	Kiss My Face, LLC
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Nivea Men Original Protective Lotion SPF 15	072140016302	Beiersdorf, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Aquaphor Broad Spectrum SPF 30	072140010119	Beiersdorf, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Eucerin Daily Protection Body Lotion SPF 15	072140012083	Beiersdorf, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Nivea Smoothness Hydrating Lip Care SPF 15	072140014216	Beiersdorf, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Botanics Organic Hydrating Day Cream	5000167157727	Boots Retail USA, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen	Dr. Brandt BB cream	663963008249	Cosmetic Dermatology, Inc.

(products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)			
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Strivectin CC plum SPF 20	817777007183	Strivectin Operating Co., Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	NIA24 Niacin-Powered Skin Therapy	852103000773	Niadyne, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Peter Thomas Roth Max Sheer All Day Moisture Defense	670367013243	Peter Thomas Roth LLC
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Cetaphil w/ SPF 15	302993928041	Galderma Laboratories L.P.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	5 in 1 Face Cream SPF 30	851939002081	First Aid Beauty LLC
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Origins VitaZing SPF 15	717334162488	Origins Natural Resources, Inc.
Octocrylene containing Sunscreen (products claiming a Sun Protection Factor)	Clinique even better SPF 20	020714395230	Clinique Laboratories, Inc.

PROOF OF SERVICE OF DOCUMENT

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case or action. My business address is: **7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 320, Van Nuys CA 91406**. A True and Correct copy of the documents entitled 60 DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY will be served or was served in the manner stated below:

I. Interested Parties (Served via Email): On June 10, 2016, I caused to be served the following persons and/or entities via the valid email address(es) below.

The Estee Lauder Companies, Inc. / Origins Natural Resource, Inc. / Clinique Laboratories, Inc.	Alejandro Bras	ABras@mofocom
The Hain Celestial Group, Inc.	Trenton H. Norris	Trent.Norris@aporter.com
Physicians Formula, Inc.	Trenton H. Norris	Trent.Norris@aporter.com
Markwins Beauty Products, Inc.	Trenton H. Norris	Trent.Norris@aporter.com
Kiss My Face LLC	Peg Toledo	peg@toledolawcorp.com
Beiersdorf, Inc.	Greg Sperla	sperlag@gtlaw.com
Boots Retail USA, Inc.	Greg Sperla	sperlag@gtlaw.com
Cosmetic Dermatology, Inc.	Vilma Palma-Solana	VPalma@perkinscoie.com
StriVectin Operating Co., Inc.	Jeson Kerr	jasonkerr@ppktrial.com
Niadyne, Inc.	Jason Kerr	jasonkerr@ppktrial.com
First Aid Beauty LLC / Peter Thomas Roth	Brad Scheller	bmscheller@mintz.com
Galderma Laboratories LP	Sarah Choi	sarah.choi@dentons.com

II. California Attorney General (via website Portal): On June 10, 2016, I uploaded a true and correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website.

III. District and City Attorneys (via U.S. Mail): I caused to be served on June 10, 2016 the following persons and/or entities at the last known addresses by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope in the United States Mail, first class, postage prepaid, and addressed as follows: SEE BELOW

IV. District and City Attorneys (via email): On June 10, 2016, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known electronic addresses via email. The transmission was reported as sent without error.

cfepd@yolocounty.org; sgrassini@contracosta.org; Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us; epu@da.sccgov.org; CEPD@countyofnapa.org; jbarnes@sonoma-county.org; Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us;

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California and the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

June 10, 2016

Nathan Ford

Date

Name



Signature

District Attorney
ALAMEDA COUNTY
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900
Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney
ALPINE COUNTY
PO Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney
AMADOR COUNTY
708 Court Street, #202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney
BUTTE COUNTY
25 County Center Drive —
Administration Building
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney
CALAVERAS COUNTY
891 Mountain Ranch Road
San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney
COLUSA COUNTY
346 5th Street, Suite. 101
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney
DEL NORTE COUNTY
450 H Street, Room 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney
EL DORADO COUNTY
515 Main Street
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney
FRESNO COUNTY
2220 Tulare Street, Suite. 1000
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney
GLENN COUNTY
PO Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney
HUMBOLDT COUNTY
825 5th Street
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney
IMPERIAL COUNTY
940 West Main Street, Suite. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney
INYO COUNTY
168 North Edwards
Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney
KERN COUNTY
1215 Truxtun Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney
KINGS COUNTY
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney
LAKE COUNTY
255 N. Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney
LASSEN COUNTY
220 S. Lassen Street, Suite. 8
Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney
LOS ANGELES COUNTY
210 W. Temple Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney
MADERA COUNTY
209 West Yosemite Avenue
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney
MARIN COUNTY
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney
MARIPOSA COUNTY
PO BOX 730
Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney
MENDOCINO COUNTY
PO BOX 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney
MERCED COUNTY
550 West Main Street
Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney
MODOC COUNTY
204 S. Court Street, Room 202
Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney
MONO COUNTY
PO BOX 2053
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney
NEVADA COUNTY
201 Commercial Street
Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney
ORANGE COUNTY
401 Civic Center Drive West
Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney
PLACER COUNTY
10810 Justice Center Drive
Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney
PLUMAS COUNTY
520 Main Street, Room 404
Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney
RIVERSIDE COUNTY
3960 Orange Street
Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney
SACRAMENTO COUNTY
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95812

District Attorney
SAN BENITO COUNTY
419 4th Street
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney
SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY
303 W. Third Street
San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney
SAN DIEGO COUNTY
330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300
San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney
SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY
880 Bryant Street, Third Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

District Attorney
SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY
PO BOX 990
Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney
SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY
Courthouse Annex, 4th Floor
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney
SAN MATEO COUNTY
400 County Center, Third Floor
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney
SANTA BARBARA COUNTY
1112 Santa Barbara Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney
SANTA CLARA COUNTY
70 West Hedding Street, West Wing
San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney
SHASTA COUNTY
1355 West Street
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney
SIERRA COUNTY
100 Courthouse Square
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney
SISKIYOU COUNTY
PO BOX 986
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney
SOLANO COUNTY
675 Texas Street, Suite 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney
SONOMA COUNTY
600 Administration Drive, Room 212J
Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney
STANISLAUS COUNTY
832 12th Street, Suite 300
Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney
SUTTER COUNTY
446 Second Street, Suite 102
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney
TEHAMA COUNTY
PO BOX 519
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney
TRINITY COUNTY
PO BOX 310
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney
TUOLUMNE COUNTY
423 No. Washington Street
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney
VENTURA COUNTY
800 South Victoria Avenue
Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney
YUBA COUNTY
215 Fifth Street, Suite. 152
Marysville, CA 95901

Mike Feuer
City Attorney
CITY OF LOS ANGELES
200 N. Main Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012

Jan Goldsmith
City Attorney
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
1200 Third Avenue, 3rd Floor
San Diego, CA 92101

Richard Doyle
City Attorney
CITY OF SAN JOSE
200 East Santa Clara Street
San Jose, CA 95113

Dennis J. Herrera
City Attorney
CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO
City Hall, Room 234
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, Daniel N. Greenbaum, hereby declare:

(1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

(2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.

(3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

(4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

(5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

June 10, 2016

Date

Daniel N. Greenbaum

Name



Signature

