# **60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION**

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)

#### **DATE:** August 25, 2016

TO: Ning He, President – Blue Ridge Home Fashions, Inc.; Steven Temares, CEO – Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc.; Leonard Marcus, President – Macy's Merchandising Group, Inc.; Jeffrey Kantor, President – Macy's West Stores, Inc.; Terry J. Lundgren, CEO – Macy's Inc.; California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

#### FROM: Susan Davia

## **RE:** Vinyl Bedding Storage/Packaging Cases

# I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Susan Davia. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the alleged violators Blue Ridge Home Fashions, Inc., Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc., Macy's Merchandising Group, Inc., Macy's West Stores, Inc. and Macy's Inc. (collectively, "Violator"). The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposure, and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below, as follows:

| Product Exposure:   | See Section VII. Exhibit A                                    |
|---------------------|---|
| Listed Chemical:    | di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP), diisononyl phthalate (DINP) |
| Routes of Exposure: | Ingestion, Dermal, Inhalation                                 |
| Types of Harm:      | Cancer, Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm             |

## **II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)**

The specific types of products that are causing consumer and occupational exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VII below. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as "products." The sales of these products in California dating at least as far back as August 2014, are subject to this Notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to each identified listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposure to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate ( or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

#### **CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE**

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemical. Children, men and women of childbearing age ingest the listed chemical when they directly contact the product with their mouth or place or hold the product in their mouths. Children, men and women of childbearing age are exposed to the listed chemical through direct dermal contact

when they, among other activities, handle or touch the products during use of the products. Children, men and women of childbearing age are exposed to the listed chemical through indirect dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch objects or items stored on the products. Children, men and women of childbearing age ingest the listed chemical when they transfer the listed chemical from the products, or intermediate objects, to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the products stops.

#### **OCCUPATIONAL EXPOSURE**

Similarly, men and women in California retail locations that sell the products handle the products and their packaging as a part of their jobs and are, therefore, subject to occupational exposures to the listed chemical. Employees are exposed at any California business location of the noticed retailer(s) as well as all other California locations where the products, or the component parts thereof that include the listed chemical are, by way of example but not limitation, used, packed, unpacked, labeled, arranged, displayed, cleaned, stocked, stored, repaired or otherwise handled. These tasks cause employee exposure directly and/or indirectly to the listed chemical through the routine touching of the parts or portions of the products containing readily available amounts of the listed chemical on the surface or through the inhalation of vapors emanating from the products and product packaging. These products are also used by sole proprietors and other persons in settings not covered by the federal Occupational Safety Health Act ("OSHA").

# **III. CONTACT INFORMATION**

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address:

Susan Davia c/o Gregory Sheffer Sheffer Law Firm 81 Throckmorton Ave., Suite 202 Mill Valley, CA 94941 Email: sheffesq@aol.com

## **IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION**

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator's reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which summary has been prepared by OEHHA.

# V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the listed chemical exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7 (b). If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this

Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

# VI. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

Identified below is a specific example of a product recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that is within the category or type of offending product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the examples within the categories or types of product are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalog by the Violator and other retailers and distributors of the manufacturer.

| Product*                | Retailer           | Manufacturer/Distributor               |
|-------------------------|--------------------|--|
| vinyl bedding           | Macy's, Bed Bath & | Blue Ridge Home Fashions, Inc., Macy's |
| storage/packaging cases | Beyond             | Merchandising Group, Inc., Macy's      |
|                         |                    | West Stores, Inc. and Macy's Inc.      |

# VII. EXHIBIT A

| Product Category/Type   | Such As*                                 | Toxins     |  |
|-------------------------|--|------------|--|
| vinyl bedding           | Cases for Charter Club Sleep Cloud       | DEHP, DINP |  |
| storage/packaging cases | Comforters (all sizes and weights), Real |            |  |
|                         | Simple Down and Down Alternative         |            |  |
|                         | Comforters (all sizes and weights)       |            |  |

\*The specifically identified example of the category or type of product that is subject to this Notice is for the recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposure to the listed chemical from other items within the product category/type listed in Exhibit A. *It is important to note that this example is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product of the type listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A*. Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violator is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

# VIII. SPECIAL NOTICE REGARDING OCCUPATIONAL EXPOSURES

Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, Title 8, Section 338(b), please be advised that this notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Gregory M. Sheffer, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The California sale of the subject products was completed without the communication of any compliant statutory warning regarding the alleged chemical exposure. In-store investigation at the noticed retailer indicated the occupational exposure to California employees at such stores was done without providing them a compliant statutory warning regarding such occupational exposure.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (*i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

Dated: August 25, 2016

Sheffer Law Firm

Gregory M. Sheffer

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I am employed in the County of Marin, State of California. I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action. My business address is 81 Throckmorton Avenue, Suite 202, Mill Valley, CA 94941.

On the date indicated below, I served the following documents, described as:

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

#### PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (SERVED ONLY ON VIOLATORS);

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

(1) on each entity or other mandatory recipient listed below with a complete postal mailing address by placing a true and correct copy of the foregoing document(s) in a sealed envelope addressed to each interested party as set forth hereafter and depositing each such envelope, with postage thereon fully prepaid, for collection and mailing with the United States Postal Service or agent authorized to accept mail on behalf of the United States Postal Service and (2) on each entity or other mandatory recipient listed below with an electronic mail address by electronically mailing PDF copies of the foregoing documents to them at such designated electronic address (with delivery confirmation requested and without receiving any unresolved return message of failed delivery).

| Ning He, President<br>Blue Ridge Home Fashions, Inc.<br>15761 Tapia Street | Steven H. Temares, CEO<br>Bed Bath & Beyond Inc.<br>650 Liberty Avenue | Mr. Leonard Marcus, President<br>Macy's Merchandising Group, Inc.<br>11 Penn Plaza |
|--|--|--|
| Irwindale, CA 91706-2009   | Union, New Jersey 07083  | New York, NY 10001   |
| Terry J. Lundgren, CEO   | Jeffrey Kantor, President  | The City Attorney for Los Angeles,   |
| Macy's Inc.  | Macy's West Stores, Inc.   | San Diego, San Jose, San Francisco   |
| 7 West Seventh Street  | 7 West Seventh Street  | and Sacramento   |
| Cincinnati, OH 45202   | Cincinnati, OH 45202   | (see attached list of addresses)   |
| 151 West 34 <sup>th</sup> Street   |  | The District Attorney for Each of  |
| New York, NY 10001   |  | the 58 counties in California  |
|  |  | (see attached list of addresses)   |

I also caused to be served the same documents on the Attorney General of the State of California by electronically uploading a copy to the California Attorney General's Website at <u>https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice</u>,

Executed this 25<sup>th</sup> day of August 2016, at Mill Valley, California. I declare under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

And/

Heidi Boissonneau

# SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Terese Drabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable John Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Stacey Grassini, DDA Contra Costa County District Attorney c/o Stacey Grassini sgrassini@contracosta.da.org

The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Keith Fagundas Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County District Attorney c/o Michelle Latimer mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable David Linn Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Thomas Cooke Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo Monterey County District Attorney c/o Dije Andreu, Deputy DA <u>Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us</u>

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein Napa County District Attorney <u>CEPD@countyofnapa.org</u>

The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach Riverside County District Attorney <u>Prop65@rivcoda.org</u>

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Gregory Alker, ADA San Francisco County District Attorney gregory.alker@sfgov.org

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201

The Honorable Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Attorney 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable Yen Dang DDA Santa Clara County District Attorney EPU@da.sccgov.org

The Honorable Jeff Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Stephan R. Passalacqua Sonoma County District Attorney jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354 The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable Eric Heryford Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Phillip J. Cline Tulare County District Attorney <u>Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us</u>

The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney daspecialops@ventura.org

The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney <u>cfepd@yolocounty.org</u>

The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting Via Electronic filing https://oac.a.gov/prop65/add-60day-notice