

April 5, 2017

#### VIA CERTIFIED MAIL

Current President or CEO 99 CENTS ONLY STORES 4000 UNION PACIFIC AVE CITY OF COMMERCE, CA 90023 Copy to its Registered Agent of Service of Process: C T CORPORATION SYSTEM 1999 BRYAN STREET, SUITE 900 DALLAS, TX 75201-3136

#### VIA ELECTRONIC FILING & PRIORITY MAIL

Office of the California Attorney General **Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting** 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland CA 94612-0550

Filing link: https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

#### VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

District Attorneys of All California Counties and Select City Attorneys (See Attached – Certificate of Service)

# RE: 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET. SEQ.

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

We represent Chemical Toxin Working Group, Inc. ("CTWG") acting in the interest of the public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability.

CTWG has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Heath & Safety Code §25249.5 et. seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with the identified products.

This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, CTWG intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to Page 1



rectify these violations.

### General Information about Proposition 65.

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is an attachment with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violator. identified below.

#### Alleged Violator.

The name of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter "the Violator") is:

99 CENTS ONLY STORES

#### **Consumer Product and Listed Chemicals.**

The product that is the subject of this notice is:

Island Sun Fancy Whole Smoked Baby Clams in Sunflower Oil - Lead & Cadmium

Island Sun Pieces Smoked Oysters in Sunflower Oil- Lead & Cadmium

The Violator manufactured, marketed, distributed and/or sold the listed product which has exposed and continues to expose numerous individuals within California to lead and cadmium. Lead was listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1,1992 and as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity on February 27,1987. Cadmium was listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1987, and as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity on May 1, 1997.

#### Route of Exposure.

The primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion but may also have occurred through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

#### **Approximate Time Period of Violations.**

Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least January 5, 2017, as well as every day since the product was introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the product.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The Violator is in violation of Proposition 65 because the company failed to provide a warning to consumers that they are being exposed to cadmium and lead. While in the



course of doing business, the company is knowingly and intentionally exposing consumers to this chemical without first providing a clear and reasonable warning. (Health and Safety Code § 25249.6.) The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. (Cal. Code Regs, tit.27, §25603.1, subd. (a).) The company has not provided any Proposition 65 warnings on the company's label or any other appropriate warnings that persons handling, ingesting and/or otherwise using this product is being exposed to cadmium and lead.

Proposition 65 requires that notice and intent to sue be given to a violator 60-days before the suit is filed. With this letter, CTWG gives notice of the alleged violation to the noticed party and the appropriate governmental authorities.

CTWG intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by Violator, unless Violator agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed product so as to eliminate further exposure to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for product sold in the future or reformulate such product to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 CTWG is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites Violator, should they seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with CTWG's attorneys. Such resolution with avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Howard Miller (213-977-0211 ext. 319; hmiller@girardikeese.com) and/or Avery Behrle (213-977-0211 ext. 107; abehrle@girardikeese.com).

With kind regards,

HOWARD MILLER, Esq. AVERY A. BEHRLE, Esq.

Girardi Keese

Attorneys for Chemical Toxin Working Group, Inc.

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Additional Supporting information for certificate of merit (for Attorney General only)
Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (proposition 65): A Summary (for Violator only)



# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Notice of Proposition 65 Violations**

## I, Avery A. Behrle, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day Notice of Violation in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party The Chemical Toxin Working Group, Inc. The Notice of Violation alleges that the party identified has exposed persons in California to the listed chemical that is the subject of this Notice. Please refer to the Notice of Violation for additional details regarding the product name(s) and alleged violations;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 5, 2017

Avery A. Behrle, Esq.



#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Avery A. Behrle, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct;

I am over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is 1126 Wilshire Boulevard, Los Angeles, CA 90017.

On April 5, 2017,1 served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE UNDER CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET. SEQ.,

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT: HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d),

"THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office in Los Angeles, California for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO 99 CENTS ONLY STORES 4000 UNION PACIFIC AVE CITY OF COMMERCE, CA 90023 Copy to its Registered Agent of Service of Process: C T CORPORATION SYSTEM 1999 BRYAN STREET, SUITE 900 DALLAS, TX 75201-3136

On April 5, 2017, I served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE UNDER CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET. SEQ.,

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT: HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d),

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTORNEY GENERAL COPY: FACTUAL INFORMATION SUFFICIENT TO ESTABLISH THE BASIS OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MERIT (Served to the Attorney General only)

on the following parties by uploading the foregoing documents at the webpage listed below and by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the address listed below, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland CA 94612-0550



https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

On April 5, 2017 I served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE UNDER CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET. SEQ.,

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT: HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d)

on each of the parties on the service list attached hereto (see attached "Service List") by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the District Attorney and City Attorney offices listed on the attached service list, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail, except for the Contra Costa County District Attorney, Lassen County District Attorney, Riverside County District Attorney, Sacramento County District Attorney, San Francisco County District Attorney, Napa County District Attorney, San Joaquin County District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County District Attorney, Santa Clara County District Attorney, Sonoma County District Attorney, Tulare County District Attorney, Ventura County District Attorney, Monterey County District Attorney, and Yolo County District Attorney, which have requested electronic service only via the following email addresses, respectively (as listed on the Service List): SGrassini@contracostada.org: mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us: Gregory.alker@sfqov.org: prop65@rivcoda.org: prop65@sacda.org: cepd@countvofnapa.org: daconsumer.environmental@sicda.org: edobroth@co.slo.ca.us: epu@da.sccqov-org: ibames@sonomacountv.orq: prop65@co.tulare.ca.us: daspecialops@ventura.org; Prop65DA@co.monterev.ca.us; and cfepd@volocountv.org.

Executed on April 5, 2017, at Los Angeles, California.

Avery A. Behrle

# SERVICE LIST

principal magazina (Magazina na manana) kamandan damana ana manana financial

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Terese Drabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markieeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable John Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Mark Peterson Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresho County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresho, CA 93721

The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA. 95988

The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Altorney 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Altorney 1215 Truxlun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Keith Fagundas Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Bouleverd Hanford, CA 93230.

The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 The Honorable Stacey Monigomery Lassen County District Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable David Linn Madera County District Altorney 209 West Yosemile Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Edward Berberlan Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafeel, CA 94903

The Honorable Thomas Cooke Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Uklah, CA 95482

The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney \$50 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S, Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo Monterey County District Attorney P O, Box 1131 Sallnas, CA 93902

The Honorable Gary Lleberstein Napa County District Attorney Carithers Bulfding 931 Parkway Mall P.O Box 720 Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civio Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable R Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Michael Hestrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Rivoraldo, CA 92501

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

The Honorable Bonnie Oumanis Sen Diego County District Attorney 330 W Broadway Street Sen Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable George Gascon San Francisco County District Altorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco. OA 94103

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Altorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201

The Honorable Dan Dow San Luls Obispo County District Attorney 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luls Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Slephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Hunarable Jeffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 96110

The Honorable Jeff Rosell Santa Cruz County District Altorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Stephen Carllon Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Radding, CA 96001

The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downleville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Jlll Ravilch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354

The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95981 The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable Eric Heryford Trinity County District Altorney P O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291-4593

The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Altorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 96695

The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Altorney Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Streel Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Altorney, Sacramento 915 | Sireet, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, GA 92101

The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Or Carlfon B Gondlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the Callfornia Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550