NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Acrylamide in Ginger Snap Cookies

July 21, 2017

This Notice of Violation is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice of Violation is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health and supporting environmentally sound practices. Charlie Pizarro is the Associate Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- <u>Violators</u>: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least July 21, 2014, and are continuing to this day.
- <u>Provision of Proposition 65</u>: This Notice of Violation covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- <u>Chemical(s) Involved</u>: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is acrylamide. Exposures to acrylamide occur from consumption of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations is ginger snap cookies ("Ginger Snaps"). Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1. With respect to Gelson's Markets, the type of product causing these violations is limited to Ginger Snaps sold by HannahMax Baking, Inc. or Thin Delicious LLC. With respect to Jet.com, Inc., the type of product causing these violations is limited to Ginger Snaps sold by Dewey's Bakery, Inc. or Salem Baking Company, Inc. With respect to WinCo Foods, LLC, the type of product causing these violations is limited to Ginger Snaps sold by Kellogg USA Inc., Kellogg Sales Company or Murray Biscuit Company, L.L.C. or sold under the WinCo Foods brand.

Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to acrylamide. Consumption of the products subject to this Notice results in human exposures to acrylamide. The products contain acrylamide, which is formed during the manufacturing process when the products are cooked at high temperatures. The primary route of exposure for the violations is direct ingestion when consumers eat the products. These exposures occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout California where the products are consumed. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic hazards of acrylamide.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the acrylamide exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of acrylamide in Ginger Snaps; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of acrylamide in such products; and representative exemplars of each lot of each variety of any such products sold by each alleged violator since one year prior to the date of this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Howard Hirsch at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, hhirsch at lexlawgroup.com.

EXHIBIT 1 July 21, 2017 Notice of Violation Acrylamide in Ginger Snap Cookies

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Further Limitation on Type of Product	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products
Dewey's Bakery, Inc. 3840 Kimwell Drive Winston Salem, NC 27103 Salem Baking Company, Inc. 66 Robinhood Circle Winston Salem, NC 27106	n/a	Salem Baking Co. Triple Ginger Moravian Cookie Thins SKU No. 7-63027-70187-8
Gelson's Markets 13833 Freeway Drive Santa Fe Springs, CA 90670	Sold by HannahMax Baking, Inc. or Thin Delicious LLC	HannahMax Baking Gluten Free Snappy Ginger Crunchy Cookie Chips SKU No. 8-33657-00735-7
HannahMax Baking, Inc. 14601 S. Main Street Gardena, CA 90248 Thin Delicious LLC 14601 S. Main Street Gardena, CA 90248	n/a	HannahMax Baking Gluten Free Snappy Ginger Crunchy Cookie Chips SKU No. 8-33657-00735-7
J & J Snack Foods Sales Corp. 6000 Central Highway Pennsauken, NJ 08109 J & J Snack Foods Corp. of California 6000 Central Highway Pennsauken, NJ 08109	n/a	Newman's Own Family Recipe Cookie Ginger Snap SKU No. 7-57645-02128-9
Jet.com, Inc. 221 River Street, Floor 8 Hoboken, NJ 07030	Sold by Dewey's Bakery, Inc. or Salem Baking Company, Inc.	Salem Baking Co. Triple Ginger Moravian Cookie Thins SKU No. 7-63027-70187-8

Kellogg USA Inc. One Kellogg Square Battle Creek, MI 49016 Kellogg Sales Company One Kellogg Square Battle Creek, MI 49016 Murray Biscuit Company, L.L.C. One Kellogg Square Battle Creek, MI 49016	n/a	Murray Old Fashioned Ginger Snaps SKU No. 0-82011-10007-8
WinCo Foods, LLC 650 N. Armstrong Place Boise, ID 83704	Sold by Kellogg USA Inc., Kellogg Sales Company or Murray Biscuit Company, L.L.C. or sold under the WinCo Foods brand	Murray Old Fashioned Ginger Snaps SKU No. 0-82011-10007-8
		WinCo Foods Ginger Snaps SKU No. 0-70552-50136-2

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Howard Hirsch, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.
- 3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

July 21, 2017

Howard Hirsch Attorney for CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL AND ELECTRONIC MAIL

I declare that:

I am employed in San Francisco County, California; my business address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, California 94117. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within cause and my electronic notification address is medgar@lexlawgroup.com.

On July 21, 2017, I served true copies of the following documents:

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT:

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY (only sent to those on service list marked with an asterisk).

On this date, I deposited fully prepaid and sealed envelopes containing the abovementioned documents with the United States Postal Service, addressed to the following individuals:

Please see attached service list.

Also on this date, I transmitted via electronic mail the documents listed above to the electronic mail addresses set forth below at ____: ①4 \(\) .m. on July 21, 2017:

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Yen Dang
Supervising Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County
70 West Hedding Street, West Wing
San Jose, CA 95110
epu@da.sccgov.org

Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Rm. 224 Visalia, CA 93291 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 4075 Main Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Montere, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento Country 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
San Luis Obispo County
County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

The transmission was reported as complete and without error.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on July 21, 2017, at San Francisco, California.

ianed: ////(

/ Molly Eda

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alameda County District Attorney of Kern County District Attorney of Placer County 1225 Fallon Street, Rm. 900 1215 Truxtun Avenue 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste. Oakland, CA 94612 Bakersfield, CA 93301 Roseville, CA 95678 District Attorney of Alpine County District Attorney of Kings County P.O. Box 248 1400 West Lacey Blvd. District Attorney of Plumas Markleeville, CA 96120 Hanford, CA 93230 County 520 Main Street, Rm. 404 District Attorney of Amador County District Attorney of Lake County Quincy, CA 95971 708 Court Street, Ste. 202 255 N. Forbes Street Jackson, CA 95642 Lakeport, CA 95453 District Attorney of San Benito County District Attorney of Butte County District Attorney of Los Angeles 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl. Administration Building County Hollister, CA 95023 25 County Center Drive Hall of Justice Oroville, CA 95965 211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200 District Attorney of San Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210 Bernardino County District Attorney of Calaveras 316 N. Mountain View Avenue County District Attorney of Madera County San Bernardino, CA 92415 891 Mountain Ranch Road 209 West Yosemite Avenue San Andreas, CA 95249 Madera, CA 93637 District Attorney of San Diego County District Attorney of Colusa County District Attorney of Marin County 330 West Broadway, Ste. 1300 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130 San Diego, CA 92101 Colusa, CA 95932 San Rafael, CA 94903 District Attorney of San Mateo District Attorney of Del Norte County District Attorney of Mariposa County County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 400 County Center, 3rd Fl. P.O. Box 730 Crescent City, CA 95531 Redwood City, CA 94063 Mariposa, CA 95338 District Attorney of El Dorado District Attorney of Mendocino District Attorney of Santa Cruz County County County 515 Main Street P.O. Box 1000 701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200 Placerville, CA 95667 Ukiah, CA 95482 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 District Attorney of Fresno County District Attorney of Merced County District Attorney of Santa 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 2222 "M" Street **Barbara County** Fresno, CA 93721 Merced, CA 95340 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 District Attorney of Glenn County District Attorney of Modoc County P.O. Box 430 204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202 District Attorney of Shasta Alturas, CA 96101-4020 Willows, CA 95988 County 1355 West Street District Attorney of Mono County District Attorney of Humboldt County Redding, CA 96001 825 5th Street P.O. Box 617 Eureka, CA 95501 Bridgeport, CA 93546 District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2nd Fl. District Attorney of Imperial County District Attorney of Nevada County 939 Main Street, Ste. 102 201 Commercial Street Downieville, CA 95936 El Centro, CA 92243 Nevada City, CA 95959 District Attorney of Siskiyou

District Attorney of Orange County

401 Civic Center Drive West

Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Inyo County

Independence, CA 93526

P.O. Drawer D

County

P.O. Box 986

Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste. 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County P.O. Box 310 11 Court Street Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Avenue, Ste. 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

California Attorney General's Office Attention: Proposition 65 Coordinator and Robert Thomas 1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 Scott A. Livengood, CEO* Dewey's Bakery, Inc. 3840 Kimwell Drive Winston Salem, NC 27103

President*
Gelson's Markets
13833 Freeway Drive
Santa Fe Springs, CA 90670

Joanne Adirim, CEO* HannahMax Baking, Inc. 14601 S. Main Street Gardena, CA 90248

President *
J & J Snack Foods Sales Corp.
6000 Central Highway
Pennsauken, NJ 08109

President *
J & J Snack Foods Corp. of
California
6000 Central Highway
Pennsauken, NJ 08109

President*
Jet.com, Inc.
221 River Street, Floor 8
Hoboken, NJ 07030

President*
Kellogg USA Inc.
One Kellogg Square
Battle Creek, MI 49016

President*
Kellogg Sales Company
One Kellogg Square
Battle Creek, MI 49016

President*
Murray Biscuit Company, L.L.C.
One Kellogg Square
Battle Creek, MI 49016

President*
Murray Biscuit Company, L.L.C.
1550 Marvin Griffin Road
Augusta, GA 30906

President*
Salem Baking Company, Inc.
66 Robinhood Circle
Winston Salem, NC 27106

President*
Salem Baking Company, Inc.
102 W. 3rd Street, Suite Lp5
Winston Salem, NC 27101

President*
Thin Delicious LLC
14601 S. Main Street
Gardena, CA 90248

Steven Goddard, CEO* WinCo Foods, LLC 650 N. Armstrong Place Boise, ID 83704

Steven Goddard, CEO* WinCo Foods, LLC P.O. Box 5756 Boise, ID 83705