NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Furfuryl Alcohol in Barbeque-Flavored or Jalapeño-Flavored Fried or Baked Potato or Sweet Potato Based Snack Foods

December 14, 2017

This Notice of Violation is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice of Violation is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Charlie Pizarro is the Associate Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- <u>Violators</u>: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least September 30, 2017, and are ongoing.
- <u>Provision of Proposition 65</u>: This Notice of Violation covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- <u>Chemical(s) Involved</u>: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is furfuryl alcohol. Exposures to furfuryl alcohol occur from consumption of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations is barbeque-flavored or jalapeño-flavored fried or baked potato or sweet potato based snack foods ("Snack Foods"). Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1. With respect to Pak 'N Save, Inc., the type of product causing these violations is limited to Snack Foods sold by Pringles, LLC. With respect to Safeway Inc., the type of product causing these violations is limited to Snack Foods sold by Inventure Foods, Inc. With respect to Save Mart Supermarkets, the type of product causing these violations is limited to Snack Foods sold by Pinnacle Foods Group LLC. With respect to Target Corporation, the type of product causing these violations is limited to

Snack Foods sold by Frito-Lay, Inc., Kettle Foods, Inc. or Popchips, Inc., or sold under the Simply Balanced or Archer Farms brands.

• <u>Description of Exposure</u>: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to furfuryl alcohol. Consumption of the products subject to this Notice results in human exposures to furfuryl alcohol. The products contain furfuryl alcohol. The primary route of exposure for the violations is direct ingestion when consumers eat the products. These exposures occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout California where the products are consumed. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic hazards of furfuryl alcohol.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the furfuryl alcohol exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of furfuryl alcohol in Snack Foods; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of furfuryl alcohol in such products; and representative exemplars of each lot of each variety of any such products sold by each alleged violator since September 30, 2017, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Howard Hirsch at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com.

EXHIBIT 1 December 14, 2017 Notice of Violation Furfuryl Alcohol in Barbeque-Flavored or Jalapeño-Flavored Fried or Baked Potato or Sweet Potato Based Snack Foods

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Further Limitation on Type of Product	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products
Frito-Lay, Inc. 7701 Legacy Drive Plano, TX 75024	n/a	Lay's Potato Chips in Barbeque Flavor, Family Size SKU No. 0-28400-64524-9
Inventure Foods, Inc. 5415 E. High Street, #350 Phoenix, AZ 85054	n/a	Boulder Canyon Kettle Cooked Potato Chips in Jalapeño Cheddar SKU No. 7-08163-11833-3
Kettle Foods, Inc. 3125 Kettle Court SE Salem, OR 97301	n/a	Kettle Potato Chips in Backyard Barbeque SKU No. 0-84114-11391-7
Pak 'N Save, Inc. 11555 Dublin Canyon Road Pleasanton, CA 94588	Sold by Pringles LLC	Pringles Potato Crisps in BBQ Flavor SKU No. 0-38000-13854-6
Popchips, Inc. 5510 Lincoln Blvd, Suite 425 Playa Vista, CA 90094	n/a	Popchips Potato Chips in Barbeque SKU No. 0-82666-50090-2
Pinnacle Foods Group LLC 399 Jefferson Road Parsippany, NJ 07054	n/a	Tim's Cascade Style Potato Chips, Jalapeño Seasoned SKU No. 0-11594-10037-3
Pringles LLC One Kellogg Square Battle Creek, MI 49016	n/a	Pringles Potato Crisps in BBQ Flavor SKU No. 0-38000-13854-6
Safeway Inc. 11555 Dublin Canyon Road Pleasanton, CA 94588	Sold by Inventure Foods, Inc.	Boulder Canyon Kettle Cooked Potato Chips in Jalapeño Cheddar SKU No. 7-08163-11833-3

Save Mart Supermarkets 1800 Standiford Avenue Modesto, CA 95350	Sold by Pinnacle Foods Group LLC	Tim's Cascade Style Potato Chips, Jalapeño Seasoned SKU No. 0-11594-10037-3
Target Corporation 1000 Nicollet Mall Minneapolis, MN 55403	Sold by Frito-Lay, Inc., Kettle Foods, Inc., or Popchips, Inc., or sold under the Simply Balanced or Archer Farms brands	Lay's Potato Chips in Barbeque Flavor, Family Size SKU No. 0-28400-64524-9
		Kettle Potato Chips in Backyard Barbeque SKU No. 0-84114-11391-7
		Popchips Potato Chips in Barbeque SKU No. 0-82666-50090-2
		Simply Balanced Organic Potato Chips in Barbeque Flavor SKU No. 4-90710-60634-8
		Archer Farms Potato Chips in Jalapeño SKU No. 0-85239-61818-9
Utz Quality Foods, LLC 900 High Street Hanover, PA 17331	n/a	Simply Balanced Organic Potato Chips in Barbeque Flavor SKU No. 4-90710-60634-8

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Howard Hirsch, hereby declare:

 This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

December 14, 2017

Howard Hirsch

Attorney for CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL AND ELECTRONIC MAIL

I declare that:

I am employed in San Francisco County, California; my business address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, California 94117. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within cause and my electronic notification address is medgar@lexlawgroup.com.

On December 14, 2017, I served true copies of the following documents:

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT:

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY (only sent to those on service list marked with an asterisk).

On this date, I deposited fully prepaid and sealed envelopes containing the abovementioned documents with the United States Postal Service, addressed to the following individuals:

Please see attached service list.

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Yen Dang Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110 epu@da.sccgov.org Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Rm. 224 Visalia, CA 93291 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 4075 Main Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Montere, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento Country 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

The transmission was reported as complete and without error.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on December 14, 2017, at San Francisco, California.

Signed:

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alameda County District Attorney of Kern County District Attorney of Placer County 1225 Fallon Street, Rm. 900 1215 Truxtun Avenue 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste. Oakland, CA 94612 Bakersfield, CA 93301 Roseville, CA 95678 District Attorney of Alpine County District Attorney of Kings County P.O. Box 248 1400 West Lacey Blvd. District Attorney of Plumas Markleeville, CA 96120 Hanford, CA 93230 County 520 Main Street, Rm. 404 District Attorney of Amador County District Attorney of Lake County Quincy, CA 95971 708 Court Street, Ste. 202 255 N. Forbes Street Jackson, CA 95642 Lakeport, CA 95453 District Attorney of San Benito County District Attorney of Butte County District Attorney of Los Angeles 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl. Administration Building County Hollister, CA 95023 25 County Center Drive Hall of Justice Oroville, CA 95965 211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200 District Attorney of San Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210 Bernardino County District Attorney of Calaveras 316 N. Mountain View Avenue County District Attorney of Madera County San Bernardino, CA 92415 891 Mountain Ranch Road 209 West Yosemite Avenue San Andreas, CA 95249 Madera, CA 93637 District Attorney of San Diego County District Attorney of Colusa County District Attorney of Marin County 330 West Broadway, Ste. 1300 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130 San Diego, CA 92101 Colusa, CA 95932 San Rafael, CA 94903 District Attorney of San Mateo District Attorney of Del Norte County District Attorney of Mariposa County County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 400 County Center, 3rd Fl. P.O. Box 730 Crescent City, CA 95531 Redwood City, CA 94063 Mariposa, CA 95338 District Attorney of El Dorado District Attorney of Mendocino District Attorney of Santa Cruz County County County 515 Main Street P.O. Box 1000 701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200 Placerville, CA 95667 Ukiah, CA 95482 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 District Attorney of Fresno County District Attorney of Merced County District Attorney of Santa 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 2222 "M" Street **Barbara County** Fresno, CA 93721 Merced, CA 95340 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 District Attorney of Glenn County District Attorney of Modoc County P.O. Box 430 204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202 District Attorney of Shasta Alturas, CA 96101-4020 Willows, CA 95988 County 1355 West Street District Attorney of Mono County District Attorney of Humboldt County Redding, CA 96001 825 5th Street P.O. Box 617 Eureka, CA 95501 Bridgeport, CA 93546 District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2nd Fl. District Attorney of Imperial County District Attorney of Nevada County 939 Main Street, Ste. 102 201 Commercial Street Downieville, CA 95936 El Centro, CA 92243 Nevada City, CA 95959 District Attorney of Siskiyou

District Attorney of Orange County

401 Civic Center Drive West

Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Inyo County

Independence, CA 93526

P.O. Drawer D

County

P.O. Box 986

Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste. 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County P.O. Box 310 11 Court Street Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Avenue, Ste. 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

California Attorney General's Office Attention: Proposition 65 Coordinator and Robert Thomas 1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 Vivek Sankaran, CEO* Frito-Lay, Inc. 7701 Legacy Drive Plano, TX 75024

Terry McDaniel, CEO* Inventure Foods, Inc. 5415 E. High Street, #350 Phoenix, AZ 85054

Brian Driscoll, President* Kettle Foods, Inc. 3125 Kettle Court SE Salem, OR 97301

Brian Driscoll, President* Kettle Foods, Inc. P.O. Box 32368 Charlotte, NC 28232

David Ritterbush, CEO* Popchips, Inc. 5510 Lincoln Blvd, Suite 425 Playa Vista, CA 90094

President*
Pringles LLC
One Kellogg Square
Battle Creek, MI 49016

President*
Pringles LLC
c/o The Corporate Company
40600 Ann Arbor Road E
Suite 201
Plymouth, MI 48170

Robert Miller, CEO* Safeway Inc. 11555 Dublin Canyon Road Pleasanton, CA 94588

Robert Miller, CEO* Pak 'N Save, Inc. 11555 Dublin Canyon Road Pleasanton, CA 94588

Pinnacle Foods Finance LLC* As member of Pinnacle Foods Group LLC 399 Jefferson Road Parsippany, NJ 07054 President*
Pinnacle Foods Group LLC
399 Jefferson Road
Parsippany, NJ 07054

Brian Cornell, CEO* Target Corporation 1000 Nicollet Mall Minneapolis, MN 55403

Dylan Lissette, President* Utz Quality Foods, LLC 900 High Street Hanover, PA 17331

Nicole Pesco, CEO* Save Mart Supermarkets 1800 Standiford Ave Modesto, CA 95350

Nicole Pesco, CEO* Save Mart Supermarkets P.O. Box 4278 Modesto, CA 95352