KAWAHITO LAW GROUP APC 222 North Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 2222 El Segundo, CA 90245

Phone: 310-746-5300 Fax: 310-593-2520

JAMES K. KAWAHITO Direct Dial: 310-746-5302 jkawahito@kawahitolaw.com

January 11, 2018

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET. SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violator(s) and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

The Kawahito Law Group APC represents the Center for Advanced Public Awareness, Inc. ("CAPA"). CAPA is a California a non-profit company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, improving human health, and environmentally sound practices. CAPA has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. This letter serves to provide CAPA's Notice of these violations. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the Act, CAPA intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

<u>General Information and Summary of Proposition 65</u>. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65 prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached to this letter.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The name of the entity or entities covered by this Notice and who are alleged to be in violation of Proposition 65 (collectively the "Violators") are:

ESI Cases and Accessories Elliot Azoulay, OCB 44 East 32<sup>nd</sup> St., Room 601 New York, NY 10016 Marshalls TJ Maxx of CA, LLC c/o CT Corporation System 818 W 7th St., Ste. 930 Los Angeles, CA 90017

<u>Consumer Product</u>. The products ("Products") which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are:

| Product(s)  | Retailer(s) | Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)/ Importer(s) |
|---|-------------|---|
| Billboard Headphones<br>UPC: 680988137792<br>SKU: BB779 | Marshalls   | ESI Cases and Accessories                   |

January 11, 2018 Page 2

<u>Listed Chemical and Route of Exposure</u>. The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is Di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP"). The consumer exposures at issue result from the use of the Products in accordance with their intended use including the handling of the Products by hand. The primary routes of exposure are ingestion and dermal absorption. The types of harm from the chemicals at issue include Developmental Toxicity, Reproductive Toxicity, and Cancer.

Period of Exposure and Violation. Exposures to DEHP, from the use of the Products have occurred each day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, but at a minimum since November 1, 2017. Moreover, these exposures will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Resolution of Noticed Claims. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, CAPA is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter to have the ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified. To that end, CAPA intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed Products or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such Products; (2) reformulate the Products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals or affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for products sold in the future; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, and avoid costly and time-consuming litigation.

To the extent you are interested in discussing a potential early resolution of this matter, you may communicate directly with CAPA's attorneys using the below contact information.

<u>Contact Information</u>. Please direct al questions or issues concerning this Notice to CAPA's counsel at the following address:

James Kawahito
Kawahito Law Group APC
222 North Sepulveda Blvd Suite 2222
El Segundo, CA 90245
tel. 310-746-5300
email jkawahito@kawahitolaw.com

January 11, 2018 Page 3

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Violators only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

January 11, 2018 Page 4

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Center for Advanced Public Awareness, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65
Violations

- I, James Kawahito, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: January 11, 2018

Japaes Kawahito

January 11, 2018 Page 5

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 222 North Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 2222, El Segundo, CA 90245.

On January 11, 2018, I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d) 3. The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary on the alleged Violators listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

ESI Cases and Accessories Elliot Azoulay, OCB 44 East 32<sup>nd</sup> St., Room 601 New York, NY 10016 Marshalls of CA, LLC TJ Maxx of CA, LLC c/o CT Corporation System 818 W 7th St., Ste. 930 Los Angeles, CA 90017

TJ Maxx of CA, LLC 770 Cochituate Rd. Gramingham, MA 01701

On January 11, 2018, I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6; 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d); 3. Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit On the following parties by uploading the foregoing documents at the webpage listed below:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement

https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

On January 11, 2018, I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6; 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d) to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed

January 11, 2018 Page 6

envelope, with postage fully prepaid with the U.S. Postal Service, addressed to the parties listed on the attached **Service List**.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: January 11, 2018

Sebastian Burnside

January 11, 2018 Page 7

#### **SERVICE LIST**

| SERVICE DIST  |  |   |  |  |
|---|--|---|--|--|
| Alameda County District Attorney<br>1225 Fallon Street, Room 900  | Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 | Amador County District Attorney<br>708 Court Street, #202 |  |  |
| Oakland, CA 94612   | Markleeville, CA 96120                       | Jackson, CA 95642   |  |  |
| Butte County District Attorney                                    | Calaveras County District Attorney           | Colusa County District Attorney                           |  |  |
| 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245                                 | 891 Mountain Ranch Road                      | 346 5th Street, Suite 101                                 |  |  |
| Oroville, CA 95965  | San Andreas, CA 95249                        | Colusa, CA 95932  |  |  |
| Contra Costa County District                                      | Del Norte County District Attorney           | El Dorado County District Attorney                        |  |  |
| Attorney  | 450 H Street, Room 171                       | 515 Main Street   |  |  |
| 900 Ward Street   | Crescent City, CA 95531                      | Placerville, CA 95667                                     |  |  |
| Martinez, CA 94553  | Croscont City, Crt 95551                     | racer vine, err 75007                                     |  |  |
| sgrassini@contracostada.org                                       |  |   |  |  |
| Fresno County District Attorney                                   | Glenn County District Attorney               | Humboldt County District Attorney                         |  |  |
| 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000                                    | P.O. Box 430                                 | 525 5th Street, 4th Floor                                 |  |  |
| Fresno, CA 93721  | Willows, CA 95988                            | Eureka, CA 95501  |  |  |
| Imperial County District Attorney                                 | Inyo County District Attorney                | Kern County District Attorney                             |  |  |
| 940 West Main Street, Suite 102                                   | 230 W. Line Street                           | 1215 Truxtun Avenue                                       |  |  |
| El Centro, CA 92243   | Bishop, CA 93514                             | Bakersfield, CA 93301                                     |  |  |
| Kings County District Attorney                                    | Lake County District Attorney                | Lassen County District Attorney                           |  |  |
| 1400 West Lacey Blvd.   | 255 N. Forbes Street                         | 220 S. Lassen Street                                      |  |  |
| Hanford, CA 93230   | Lakeport, CA 95453                           | Susanville, CA 96130                                      |  |  |
|   |  | [field_prop65ctacts_title]                                |  |  |
|   |  | mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us                                  |  |  |
| Los Angeles County District                                       | Madera County District Attorney              | Marin County District Attorney                            |  |  |
| Attorney  | 209 West Yosemite Avenue                     | 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130                         |  |  |
| 210 W. Temple St., 18 <sup>th</sup> Floor                         | Madera, CA 93637                             | San Rafael, CA 94903                                      |  |  |
| Los Angeles, CA 90012   |  |   |  |  |
| Mariposa County District Attorney                                 | Mendocino County District Attorney           | Merced County District Attorney                           |  |  |
| P.O. Box 730  | P.O. Box 1000                                | 550 West Main Street                                      |  |  |
| Mariposa, CA 95338  | Ukiah, CA 9548                               | Merced, CA 95340  |  |  |
| Modoc County District Attorney                                    | Mono County District Attorney                | Monterey County District Attorney                         |  |  |
| 204 S. Court Street Room 202                                      | P.O. Box 2053                                | 1200 Aguajito Road  |  |  |
| Alturas, CA 96101   | Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546                      | Monterey, CA 93940  |  |  |
|   |  | Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us                                |  |  |
| Napa County District Attorney                                     | Nevada County District Attorney              | Orange County District Attorney                           |  |  |
| 931 Parkway Mall  | 201 Commercial Street                        | 401 Civic Center Drive West                               |  |  |
| Napa, CA 94559  | Nevada City, CA 95959                        | Santa Ana, CA 92701                                       |  |  |
| CEPD@countyofnapa.org   |  |   |  |  |
| Placer County District Attorney                                   | Plumas County District Attorney              | Riverside County District Attorney                        |  |  |
| 10810 Justice Center Drive  | 520 Main Street, Room 404                    | 3072 Orange Street  |  |  |
| Roseville, CA 95678   | Quincy, CA 95971                             | Riverside, CA 92501                                       |  |  |
| Court Division  | G. Parks District Att                        | Prop65@rivcoda.org  |  |  |
| Sacramento County District Attorney                               | San Benito District Attorney                 | San Bernardino County District                            |  |  |
| 901 G Street  | 419 4th Street                               | Attorney  |  |  |
| Sacramento, CA 95814  | Hollister, CA 95023                          | 303 W. Third Street                                       |  |  |
| Prop65@sacda.org  | G. Francisco G. Division                     | San Bernardino, CA 92415                                  |  |  |
| San Diego County District Attorney<br>330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300 | San Francisco County District                | San Joaquin County District Attorney                      |  |  |
| San Diego, CA 92101   | Attorney 732 Brannan Street                  | 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202                             |  |  |
| San Diego, CA 72101   | San Francisco, CA 94103                      | Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org     |  |  |
|   | gregory.alker@sfgov.org                      | DACONSUMCI, ENVIRONMENTALWIS SCIA, OF g                   |  |  |
|   | giogory.ainci@oigov.oig                      |   |  |  |
|   |  |   |  |  |
|   |  |   |  |  |
|   |  |   |  |  |
|   |  |   |  |  |
|   |  |   |  |  |
|   | L  | <del></del>   |  |  |

January 11, 2018 Page 8

| San Luis Obispo County District Attorney County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 [field_prop65ctacts_title] edobroth@co.slo.ca.us | San Mateo County District Attorney<br>400 County Center, Third Floor<br>Redwood City, CA 94063                 | Santa Barbara County District Attorney<br>1112 Santa Barbara Street<br>Santa Barbara, CA 93101                            |
|---|--|---|
| Santa Clara County District Attorney<br>70 W Hedding St<br>San Jose, CA 95110<br>EPU@da.sccgov.org  | Santa Cruz County District Attorney<br>701 Ocean Street, Room 200<br>Santa Cruz, CA 95060                      | Shasta County District Attorney<br>1355 West Street<br>Redding, CA 96001  |
| Sierra County District Attorney<br>100 Courthouse Square<br>Downieville, CA 95936<br>Sonoma County District Attorney  | Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 Stanislaus County District Attorney             | Solano County District Attorney<br>675 Texas Street, Suite 4500<br>Fairfield, CA 94533<br>Sutter County District Attorney |
| 600 Administration Dr<br>Sonoma, CA 95403<br>jbarnes@sonoma-county.org  | 832 12th Street, Suite 300<br>Modesto, CA 95353  | 446 Second Street, Suite 102<br>Yuba City, CA 95991   |
| Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080  | Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  | Tulare County District Attorney 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us                                |
| Tuolumne County District Attorney<br>423 N. Washington Street<br>Sonora, CA 95370   | Ventura County District Attorney<br>800 S Victoria Ave<br>Ventura, CA 93009<br>daspecialops@ventura.org        | Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org                                   |
| Yuba County District Attorney<br>215 Fifth Street, Suite 152<br>Marysville, CA 95901  | Los Angeles City Attorney's Office<br>City Hall East<br>200 N. Main Street, Suite 800<br>Los Angeles, CA 90012 | San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett Pl, San Francisco, CA 94102                      |
| San Diego City Attorney's Office<br>1200 Third Ave #1620, San Diego,<br>CA 92101  |  |   |