

Matthew M. Maclear mcm@atalawgroup.com 415.568.5200

July 19, 2018

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

Aqua Terra Aeris (ATA) Law Group represents the Center for Advanced Public Awareness, Inc. (CAPA), 180 Promenade Circle, Suite 300, Sacramento, CA 95834. CAPA is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, fostering and increasing the public awareness of chemicals used to manufacture consumer products, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

CAPA has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code, section 25249.5 et seq., with respect to the product identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. Section 25249.6 of the statute provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to this listed chemical that results from contact with this product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make an informed decision on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) their risk of exposure to the listed chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the product.

This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code, section 25249.7, subdivision (d), CAPA intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

<u>Certificate of Merit and General Information about Proposition 65</u>. Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 11, section 3100, a certificate of merit is attached hereto. Pursuant to C.C.R., title 27, section 25903, subdivision (b), a copy of a summary of Proposition



65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

Alleged Violators. The name(s) of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violator," individually, or "Violators," collectively) are:

- OMG Accessories, LLC
 10 W. 33rd Street, Suite 1224
 New York, NY 10001
- Nordstrom, Inc. 1617 Sixth Avenue Seattle, WA 98101

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

• Unicorn Cosmetics Case – Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate

On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to the State to cause developmental and male reproductive toxicity. The addition took place more than twenty (20) months before CAPA served this Notice.

Chemical	CAS No.	Toxicological Endpoint	Listing Mechanism
Di(2-ethyhexly)phthalate	117-81-7	Reproductive toxicity	AB-NIOSH/FDA
("DEHP") ¹			

<u>Violations</u>. The alleged Violators knowingly and intentionally have exposed and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose consumers within the State of California to Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP") at levels that, upon reasonable use of the product, exceed the Maximum Allowable Dose Level without providing clear and reasonable warning of this exposure. In particular, the product does not warn that it contains chemicals known to the State of California to cause developmental and male reproductive toxicity.

The oral Maximum Allowable Dose Level ("MADL") for DEHP is 410 μ g/day (adult); 58 μ g/day (infant boys, age 29 days to 24 months); and 20 μ g/day (neonatal infant boys, age 0 to 28 days). The overall exposure estimate from the Unicorn Cosmetics Bag exceeds the MADL for and infant boys aged 29 days to 2 years based on dermal absorption, object-to-mouth ingestion,

¹ https://oehha.ca.gov/proposition-65/chemicals/di2-ethylhexylphthalate-dehp.



and direct and indirect hand-to-mouth ingestion, as applicable. As a result, the Unicorn Cosmetics Bag needs a clear a reasonable warning under Proposition 65.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, and handling of the product. Consequently, a primary route of exposure to these chemicals is through dermal absorption, direct and indirect hand-to-mouth ingestion, and object-to-mouth ingestion. Consumers and other individuals, are exposed to the listed chemical through reasonably foreseeable direct dermal contact when they handle, touch, or otherwise use Unicorn Cosmetics Bag. The potential exists for exposure of DEHP through dermal absorption, direct and indirect hand-to-mouth ingestion, and object-to-mouth ingestion, as applicable

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least March 22, 2017, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced via reformulation to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators committed Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with clear and reasonable warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, CAPA is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the product to reduce/eliminate further DEHP exposures; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 for products sold in the future. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time-consuming litigation.

CAPA has retained ATA Law Group as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated herein.



Dated: July 19, 2018 Very truly yours,

Matthew C. Maclear

Shaff Morelier

AQUA TERRA AERIS LAW GROUP Attorney for Center for Advanced Public

Awareness

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service OEHHA Summary (to OMG Accessories, LLC and Nordstrom, Inc.) Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)



CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Center for Advanced Public Awareness, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations to OMG Accessories LLC.

I, Matthew Maclear, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
 - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: July 19, 2018

Matthew C. Maclear

AQUA TERRA AERIS LAW GROUP Attorney for Center for Advanced Public

That Muller

Awareness



CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 490 43rd Street, Suite 108, Oakland, California 94609. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Albany, California.

On July 19, 2018, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986**(**PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY"** on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Anne Harper or Current President or CEO

OMG Accessories, LLC

Anne Rebecca Narter

10 W. 33rd Street, Ste. 1224

New York, NY 10001

Agent for Service of Process, OMG Accessories, LLC:

Anne Rebecca Narter

1630 Little John Court

Highland Park, IL 60035

Anne Bramman or Current President or CEO
Agent to
1617 Sixth Avenue
Corpor
Seattle, WA 98101
West 5

Agent for Service of Process, Nordstrom, Inc.: Corporate Creations Network, Inc. West 505 Riverside Ave., Suite 500 Spokane, WA 99201

On July 19, 2018, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d)(1)** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On July 19, 2018, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was **sent via electronic mail** to the party listed below:



Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Birgit Fladager, District Attorney District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354 Prop65@standa.org

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney District Attorney, Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Attorney District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Prop65@sacda.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Rm 202 Stockton, CA 95202

DAConsumer.Environmental@sicda.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney District Attorney, Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 <u>cfepd@yolocounty.org</u> Allison Haley, District Attorney District Attorney, Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach District Attorney, Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Philip J. Cline District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten
District Attorney, Ventura County
800 S Victoria Ave
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator District Attorney, Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney District Attorney, San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 Gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

On July 19, 2018, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to



each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by U.S. First Class Mail.

Executed on July 19, 2018, in Oakland, California.

Esmeralda Bustos

Emeralde But

Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County	District Attorney, Los Angeles County	District Attorney, Lake County
1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900	210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000	255 N. Forbes Street
Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Lakeport, CA 95453
District Attorney, Alpine County	District Attorney, Madera County	District Attorney, Shasta County
P.O. Box 248	209 West Yosemite Avenue	1355 West Street
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera, CA 93637	Redding, CA 96001
District Attorney, Amador County	District Attorney, Marin County	District Attorney, Sierra County
708 Court Street	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	PO Box 457
Jackson, CA 95642	San Rafael, CA 94903	Downieville, CA 95936
District Attorney, Butte County	District Attorney, Mariposa County	District Attorney, Siskiyou County
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	Post Office Box 730	Post Office Box 986
Oroville, CA 95965	Mariposa, CA 95338	Yreka, CA 96097
District Attorney, Calaveras County	District Attorney, Mendocino County	District Attorney, Solano County
891 Mountain Ranch Road	Post Office Box 1000	675 Texas Street, Ste 4500
San Andreas, CA 95249	Ukiah, CA 95482	Fairfield, CA 94533
District Attorney, Colusa County	District Attorney, Merced County	Sacramento City Attorney's Office
346 Fifth Street Suite 101	550 W. Main Street	915 I Street, 4 th Floor
Colusa, CA 95932	Merced, CA 95340	Sacramento, CA 95814
District Attorney, Del Norte County	District Attorney, Modoc County	District Attorney, Sutter County
450 H Street, Room 171	204 S Court Street, Room 202	446 Second Street
Crescent City, CA 95531	Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Yuba City, CA 95991
District Attorney, El Dorado County	District Attorney, Mono County	District Attorney, Tehama County
515 Main Street	Post Office Box 617	Post Office Box 519
Placerville, CA 95667	Bridgeport, CA 93517	Red Bluff, CA 96080



District Attorney, Fresno County	District Attorney, Nevada County	District Attorney, Trinity County
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	201 Commercial Street	Post Office Box 310
Fresno, CA 93721	Nevada City, CA 95959	Weaverville, CA 96093
District Attorney, Glenn County	District Attorney, Orange County	District Attorney, Tuolumne County
Post Office Box 430	401 West Civic Center Drive	423 N. Washington Street
Willows, CA 95988	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney, Humboldt County	District Attorney, Placer County	District Attorney, Yuba County
825 5th Street 4th Floor	10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240	215 Fifth Street, Suite 152
Eureka, CA 95501	Roseville, CA 95678	Marysville, CA 95901
District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243	District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012
District Attorney, Inyo County	District Attorney, San Benito County	San Diego City Attorney's Office
PO Box D	419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor	1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620
Independence, CA 93526	Hollister, CA 95023	San Diego, CA 92101
District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	District Attorney, San Bernardino County 303 West 3 rd Street, 6 th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, 234 1 Dr. Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102
District Attorney, Kings County	District Attorney, San Diego County	San Jose City Attorney's Office
1400 West Lacey Boulevard	330 West Broadway, Suite 1300	200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
Hanford, CA 93230	San Diego, CA 92101	San Jose, CA 95113
District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	