

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Lead in Dietary Supplements Made With Moringa

September 13, 2018

This Notice of Violation is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice of Violation is provided by the Center for Environmental Health (“CEH”), 2201 Broadway, Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Charlie Pizarro is the Associate Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- Violators: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least September 13, 2015, and are ongoing.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice of Violation covers the “warning provision” of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The names of the listed chemicals involved in these violations are lead and lead compounds (“Lead”). Exposures to Lead occur from consumption of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations is dietary supplements made with moringa. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to Lead. Consumption of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to Lead. The products contain Lead. The primary route of exposure for the violations is direct ingestion when individuals consume the products. These exposures occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout

California where the products are consumed. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards of Lead.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the Lead exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in dietary supplements made with moringa; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by each alleged violator in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Eric S. Somers at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, esomers@lexlawgroup.com.

EXHIBIT 1
September 13, 2018 Notice of Violation
Lead in Dietary Supplements Made With Moringa

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products
<p>Lucky Vitamin, LLC 555 East North Lane Suite 6050 Conshohocken, PA 19428</p> <p>Lucky Oldco Corporation 300 6th Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15222</p>	<p>Moringa Source Organic Raw Moringa Powder SKU No. 728028069280 Item No. 125313</p>
<p>Moringa Source LLC 22 Shelter Rock Lane Unit 3 Danbury, CT 06810</p>	<p>Moringa Source Organic Raw Moringa Powder SKU No. 728028069280 Item No. 125313</p>
<p>Nuts.com, Inc. 125 Moen Street Cranford, NJ 07016</p>	<p>Nuts.com Organic Moringa Powder Product ID No. 8479</p>

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Eric S. Somers, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

September 13, 2018



Eric S. Somers
Attorney for CENTER FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE**

2

3 I, Nick Redfield, declare:

4 I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of San Francisco, State of
5 California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business
6 address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 and my email address is
nredfield@lexlawgroup.com.

7 On September 13, 2018, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in
8 this action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:

9 **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND
10 TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

11 **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

12 **THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986**
13 **(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (only sent to those on service list marked with an
14 asterisk).

15 ☒ **BY MAIL:** I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail
16 with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited
17 with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the
18 ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above
19 mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices.

20 *Please see attached service list.*

21 ☐ **BY FACSIMILE:** I caused all pages of the document(s) listed above to be transmitted via
22 facsimile to the fax number(s) as indicated and said transmission was reported as complete and
23 without error.

24 ☒ **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via
25 email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] before 5 p.m.
26 on the date executed.

27 Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney
28 Contra Costa County
900 Ward Street
Martinez, CA 94553
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Yen Dang
Supervising Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County
70 West Hedding Street, West Wing
San Jose, CA 95110
epu@da.sccgov.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator
Lassen County
220 S. Lassen Street
Susanville, CA 96130
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney
Napa County
1127 First Street, Suite C
Napa, CA 94559
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

1 Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney
2 Sonoma County
3 600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J
4 Santa Rosa, CA 95403
5 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

6 Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
7 Tulare County
8 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Rm. 224
9 Visalia, CA 93291
10 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

11 Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney
12 Riverside County
13 4075 Main Street
14 Riverside, CA 92501
15 Prop65@rivcoda.org

16 Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney
17 Riverside County
18 4075 Main Street
19 Riverside, CA 92501
20 Prop65@rivcoda.org

21 Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney
22 Yolo County
23 301 Second Street
24 Woodland, CA 95695
25 cfepd@yolocounty.org

26 Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney
27 Monterey County
28 1200 Aguajito Road
Monterey, CA 93940
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney
San Joaquin County
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
Stockton, CA 95202
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District
Attorney, Santa Barbara County
1112 Santa Barbara Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Mara W. Elliott, City Attorney
City of San Diego
1200 Third Ave, Suite 700
San Diego, CA 92101
CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura
County
800 South Victoria Avenue
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney
San Francisco County
732 Brannan Street
San Francisco, CA 94103
gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney
Sacramento Country
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
Prop65@sacda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
San Luis Obispo County
County Government Center Annex, 4th
Floor
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney
Santa Cruz County
701 Ocean Street
Santa Cruz, CA 95060
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney
Alameda County
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650
Oakland, CA 94621
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

1 ☐ **BY PERSONAL DELIVERY:** I placed all pages of the document(s) listed above in a sealed
2 envelope addressed to the party(ies) listed above, and caused such envelope to be delivered by
hand to the addressee(s) as indicated.

3 ☐ **BY OVERNIGHT DELIVERY:** I deposited such document(s) in a box or other facility
4 regularly maintained by FedEx, or delivered such document(s) to a courier or driver authorized by
FedEx, with delivery fees paid or provided for, and addressed to the person(s) being served.

5

6 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
7 foregoing is true and correct.

8

Executed on September 13, 2018 at San Francisco, California.

9

10



Nick Redfield

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County
P.O. Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County
708 Court Street, Ste. 202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County
Administration Building
25 County Center Drive
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Calaveras County
891 Mountain Ranch Road
San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney of Colusa County
346 Fifth Street, Suite 101
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County
450 H Street, Ste. 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County
778 Pacific Street
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Fresno County
2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney of Glenn County
P.O. Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County
825 5th Street
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County
939 Main Street, Ste. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Inyo County
P.O. Drawer D
Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney of Kern County
1215 Truxtun Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County
255 N. Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County
Hall of Justice
211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County
209 West Yosemite Avenue
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Marin County
3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mariposa County
P.O. Box 730
Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney of Mendocino County
P.O. Box 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Merced County
2222 "M" Street
Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney of Modoc County
204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County
P.O. Box 617
Bridgeport, CA 93546

District Attorney of Nevada County
201 Commercial Street
Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney of Orange County
401 Civic Center Drive West
Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Placer County
10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste. 240
Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney of Plumas County
520 Main Street, Rm. 404
Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney of San Benito County
419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl.
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County
316 N. Mountain View Avenue
San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney of San Diego County
330 West Broadway, Ste. 1300
San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney of San Mateo County
400 County Center, 3rd Fl.
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County
1355 West Street
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County
Courthouse
100 Courthouse Sq., 2nd Fl.
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County
P.O. Box 986
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County
675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County
832 12th Street, Ste. 300
Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County
446 Second Street
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County
P.O. Box 519
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County
P.O. Box 310
11 Court Street
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County
423 N. Washington Street
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County
215 Fifth Street
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office
City Hall East
200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800
Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Francisco City Attorney's Office
City Hall, Room 234
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office
200 East Santa Clara Street
San Jose, CA 95113

California Attorney General's Office
Attention: Proposition 65 Coordinator and Robert
Thomas
1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

President*
Lucky Vitamin, LLC
555 East North Lane
Suite 6050
Conshohocken, PA 19428

President*
Lucky Oldco Corporation
300 6th Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15222

James Fitzpatrick*
Moringa Source LLC
22 Shelter Rock Lane, Unit 3
Danbury, CT 06810

James Fitzpatrick*
Moringa Source LLC
261 South Main Street, Ste 315
Newtown, CT 06470

Jeffrey Braverman, President*
Nuts.com, Inc.
125 Moen Street
Cranford, NJ 07016