



Matthew Maclear
mcm@atalawgroup.com
415-568-5200

Anthony Barnes
amb@atalawgroup.com
415-326-3173

September 14, 2018

**NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF
CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.
(PROPOSITION 65)**

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center, Inc. ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

Alleged Violators. The names of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

**Pervine Foods, LLC, individually and doing business as Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch
Bakery Barn, Inc., individually and doing business as Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch**

Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 2

Consumer Products and Listed Chemical. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

1. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Brownie Chocolate 50g - Lead**
2. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Baked Bar Birthday Cake 88g - Lead**
3. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Baked Bar Chocolate Chip Cookie Dough 46g - Lead**
4. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Baked Bar Cinnamon Twist 46g - Lead**
5. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Baked Bar Birthday Cake 46g - Lead**
6. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Baked Bar Caramel Peanut 46g - Lead**
7. **Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch Whey Protein Baked Bar Chocolate Peanut Butter 46g - Lead**

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least September 14, 2015, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 3

warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time-consuming litigation.

ERC has retained ATA Law Group as legal counsel in connection with this matter. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention, or the attention of ATA partner Anthony Barnes, using the address or contact information indicated on the letterhead.**

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Matthew Maclear". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized initial "M".

Matthew Maclear
AQUA TERRA AERIS LAW GROUP

Attachments

- Certificate of Merit
- Certificate of Service
- OEHHA Summary (to Pervine Foods, LLC, individually and doing business as Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch; Bakery Barn, Inc., individually and doing business as Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch)
- Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 4

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Pervine Foods, LLC, individually and doing business as Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch; Bakery Barn, Inc., individually and doing business as Chef Robert Irvine's Fit Crunch

I, Matthew Maclear, declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read "Matthew Maclear", is written over a horizontal line.

Dated: September 14, 2018

Matthew Maclear



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 5

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On September 14, 2018, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; “THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY”** on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO
Pervine Foods, LLC, individually and
doing business as Chef Robert Irvine’s
Fit Crunch
111 Terence Drive
Pittsburgh, PA 15236

Current President or CEO
Bakery Barn, Inc., individually and
doing business as Chef Robert Irvine’s
Fit Crunch
111 Terence Drive
Pittsburgh, PA 15236

Current President or CEO
Pervine Foods, LLC, individually and
doing business as Chef Robert Irvine’s
Fit Crunch
3900 Veterans Memorial Highway, #371
Bohemia, NY 11716

On September 14, 2018, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1)** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General’s website, which can be accessed at <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice> :

Office of the California Attorney General
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
Oakland, CA 94612-0550



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 6

On September 14, 2018, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney
Alameda County
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650
Oakland, CA 94621
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney
Sacramento County
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
Prop65@sacda.org

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney
Contra Costa County
900 Ward Street
Martinez, CA 94553
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
San Diego City Attorney
1200 Third Avenue
San Diego, CA 92101
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator
Lassen County
220 S. Lassen Street
Susanville, CA 96130
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney
San Francisco County
732 Brannan Street
San Francisco, CA 94103
gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney
Monterey County
1200 Aguajito Road
Monterey, CA 93940
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney
San Joaquin County
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
Stockton, CA 95202
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Allison Haley, District Attorney
Napa County
1127 First Street, Suite C
Napa, CA 94559
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
San Luis Obispo County
County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney
Riverside County
3072 Orange Street
Riverside, CA 92501
Prop65@rivcoda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney
Santa Barbara County
1112 Santa Barbara Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 7

Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County
70 W Hedding St
San Jose, CA 95110
EPU@da.sccgov.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Tulare County
221 S Mooney Blvd
Visalia, CA 95370
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney
Santa Cruz County
701 Ocean Street
Santa Cruz, CA 95060
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney
Ventura County
800 S Victoria Ave
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney
Sonoma County
600 Administration Dr
Sonoma, CA 95403
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney
Yolo County
301 Second Street
Woodland, CA 95695
cfepd@yolocounty.org

On September 14, 2018, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on September 14, 2018, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Phyllis Dunwoody



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*
September 14, 2018
Page 8

Service List

| | | | |
|--|--|---|--|
| District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120 | District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230 | District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 | District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370 |
| District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642 | District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 | District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023 | District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901 |
| District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965 | District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012 | District Attorney, San Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernadino, CA 92415 | Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012 |
| District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 | District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637 | District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101 | San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102 |
| District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932 | District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903 | District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063 | San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113 |
| District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531 | District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 | District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001 | |
| District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667 | District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482 | District Attorney, Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square, 2 nd Floor Downieville, CA 95936 | |
| District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721 | District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340 | District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 | |
| District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988 | District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020 | District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 | |
| District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4 th Floor Eureka, CA 95501 | District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517 | District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354 | |
| District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243 | District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 | District Attorney, Sutter County 463 2 nd Street Yuba City, CA 95991 | |
| District Attorney, Inyo County P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526 | District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701 | District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080 | |
| District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 | District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678 | District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 | |