T 510.836.4200 F 510.836.4205 410 12th Street, Suite 250 Oakland, Ca 94607 www.lozeaudrury.com michael@lozeaudrury.com

# **VIA CERTIFIED MAIL**

Current President or CEO
Health Matters America, Inc., individually
and doing business as Organic Traditions
2501 Broadway Street, Ste 2
Buffalo, NY 14227

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 3215 Broadway St. Cheektowaga, NY 14227

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 125 Galleria Drive #1482 Cheektowaga, NY 14225

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 2501 Broadway Street, #19-20 Buffalo, NY 14227

Current President or CEO Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 8-250 Shields Court Markham, ON L3R 9W7 Canada

## **VIA CERTIFIED MAIL**

Current President or CEO Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 5787 Steeles Avenue West North York, ON M9L 2W3 Canada

Corporations and Companies, Inc. (Registered Agent for Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions) 910 Foulk Road, Ste 201 Wilmington, DE 19803

# **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

### **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

### **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

# **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

**VIA ONLINE SUBMISSION** 

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org Office of the California Attorney General

**VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL** 

District Attorneys of Select California Counties and Select City Attorneys (See Attached Certificate of Service)

Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.

Dear Addressees:

I represent Environmental Research Center, Inc. ("ERC") in connection with this Notice of Violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 *et seq.* and also referred to as Proposition 65.

ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

The names of the Companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions

Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions

The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemicals in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- 1. Organic Traditions Maca For Women With Probiotics Lead
- 2. Organic Traditions Maca For Men With Probiotics Lead
- 3. Organic Traditions Smooth Movement Probiotic Fiber Blend With Turmeric Lead
- 4. Organic Traditions Turmeric Latte With Probiotics And Saffron Lead
- 5. Organic Traditions Moringa Leaf Powder Lead
- 6. Organic Traditions Chlorella Powder Lead
- 7. Organic Traditions Wheat Grass Juice Powder Lead
- 8. Organic Traditions Spirulina Powder Lead
- 9. Organic Traditions Barley Grass Juice Powder Lead
- 10. Organic Traditions Premium Matcha Green Tea Lead

- 11. Organic Traditions Macaccino Drink Mix Lead, Cadmium
- 12. Organic Traditions Maca X-6 Black And Red-Purple Lead
- 13. Organic Traditions Probiotic Super Greens With Turmeric Lead
- 14. Organic Traditions Triphala Powder Lead
- 15. Organic Traditions Ashwagandha Root Powder Lead
- 16. Organic Traditions Amla Berry Powder Lead
- 17. Organic Traditions Baobab Fruit Powder Lead
- 18. Organic Traditions Turmeric Powder Lead
- 19. Organic Traditions Cacao Powder Cadmium
- 20. Organic Traditions Golden Flax Seeds Cadmium

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

Cadmium was officially listed as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity on May 1, 1997 while cadmium and cadmium compounds were listed as chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1987.

This letter is a notice to the Violators and the appropriate governmental authorities of the Proposition 65 violations concerning the listed products. This notice covers all violations of Proposition 65 involving the Violators currently known to ERC from the information now available. ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations. A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with the copy of this letter to the Violators.

The Violators have manufactured, marketed, distributed, and/or sold the listed products, which have exposed and continue to expose numerous individuals within California to the identified chemicals, lead and/or cadmium. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products by consumers. The route of exposure to lead has been through ingestion. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to lead and/or cadmium. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide an appropriate warning to persons ingesting these products that they are being exposed to lead. Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since September 20, 2015, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users.

Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a citizen enforcement action sixty days after effective service of this notice unless the Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) reformulate the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Consistent with the public interest goals of

Proposition 65 and my client's objectives in pursuing this notice, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals and expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall, and is located at 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. 619-500-3090. ERC has retained me in connection with this matter. We suggest that communications regarding this Notice of Violations should be directed to my attention at the above listed law office address and telephone number.

Sincerely,

Michael Lozony

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions and Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions and their Registered Agent for Service of Process only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions and Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions

# I, Michael Lozeau, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: September 20, 2018

Muhael Lozeau Michael Lozeau

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On September 20, 2018 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it in a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 2501 Broadway Street, Ste 2 Buffalo, NY 14227

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 3215 Broadway St. Cheektowaga, NY 14227

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 125 Galleria Drive #1482 Cheektowaga, NY 14225

Current President or CEO Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 2501 Broadway Street, #19-20 Buffalo, NY 14227 Current President or CEO Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 8-250 Shields Court Markham, ON L3R 9W7 Canada

Current President or CEO Advantage Health Matters Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions 5787 Steeles Avenue W North York, ON M9L 2W3 Canada

Corporations and Companies, Inc. (Registered Agent for Health Matters America, Inc., individually and doing business as Organic Traditions) 910 Foulk Road, Ste 201 Wilmington, DE 19803

On September 20, 2018 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On September 20, 2018 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

On September 20, 2018 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties **on the Service List attached hereto**, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on September 20, 2018, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Phylli Dunwoody

Page 10

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road

San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102

El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney. Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney,San Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernadino, CA 92415

District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square, 2nd Floor Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 463 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attornev's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street. 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113