VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 990 Amarillo Ave Palo Alto, CA 94303 650-815-6022

60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

October 8, 2018

Notice Recipient: Leon Max, Inc.

Noticing Party: Dennis Johnson

Covered Products: Candle Holders With Handles

Listed Chemical: Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)

Routes of Exposure: Ingestion; Dermal

Potential Harm: Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

I. INTRODUCTION

This Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Dennis Johnson. Mr. Johnson is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Mr. Johnson seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violator, Leon Max, Inc. (the "Notice Recipient"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice that it has violated and continues to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipient has violated and continues to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Type/Category</u>: The specific type or category of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Candle Holders With Handles ("Covered Products").

Identified below is a specific example of a Covered Product recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product are also provided.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific type or category of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipient is obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipient's custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Covered Products	Exemplar Product Information	
Candle Holders With Handles	Max Studio Home Candle Holder; Style 132376;	
	Retailer: The TJX Companies, Inc.; TJ Maxx	
	(Santa Clara, CA)	
	Manufacturer/Distributor: Leon Max, Inc.	

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violation involves exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), hereinafter the "Listed Chemical". On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipient failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Covered Products expose consumers to DEHP.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Children, men and women of childbearing age ingest the Listed Chemical when the Covered Product comes into direct contact with their lips or mouth. Children, men and women of childbearing age ingest the

Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Product. Children, men and women of childbearing age are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

Number and Duration of Violations: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipient and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least October 8, 2017, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as October 8, 2015. The violations are ongoing.

III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General, clearly marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient.

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Mr. Johnson intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipient upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipient is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and then only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipient preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as October 8, 2015, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

VII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Mr. Johnson has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to my attention at the following address:

Josh Voorhees, Esq. Voorhees & Bailey, LLP 990 Amarillo Ave Palo Alto, CA 94303 josh@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely,

Josh Voorhees

Attorney for Dennis Johnson

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties;

and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose,

Sacramento and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic

Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (Leon Max, Inc., only); and

Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (Attorney General

Only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Josh Voorhees, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: October 8, 2018

Jøsh Voorhees

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 990 Amarillo Ave., Palo Alto, CA 94303.

On October 9, 2018, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;

AND THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Ernest E. Hoffer Leon Max, CEO Leon Max, Inc. Leon Max, Inc.

3100 New York Drive 3100 New York Drive Pasadena, CA 91107 Pasadena, CA 91107

On October 9, 2018, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On October 9, 2018, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on October 9, 2018, at Palo Alto, California.

Josh Voorhees

U.S. Mail Service List

The Honorable Michael Atwell	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe
Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	San Mateo County District Attorney
P.O. Box 248	211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200	400 County Center
Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Redwood City, CA 94063
The Honorable Todd Riebe	The Honorable David Linn	The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	1355 West Street
Jackson, CA 95642	Madera, CA 93637	Redding, CA 96001
The Honorable Michael Ramsey	The Honorable Edward Berberian	The Honorable Lawrence Allen
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145	P.O. Box 886
Oroville, CA 95965	San Rafael, CA 94903	Downieville, CA 95936
The Honorable Barbara Yook	The Honorable Thomas Cooke	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mariposa County District Attorney	Siskiyou County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road	P.O. Box 730	311 4th Street
San Andreas, CA 95249	Mariposa, CA 95338	Yreka, CA 96097
The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp	The Honorable C. David Eyster	The Honorable Krishna Abrams
Colusa County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
346 Fifth Street, Suite 101	P.O. Box 1000	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500
Colusa, CA 95932	Ukiah, CA 95482	Fairfield, CA 94533
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354
The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667	The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Honorable Gregg Cohen
Fresno County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	P.O. Box 617	444 Oak Street, Room L
Fresno, CA 93721	Bridgeport, CA 93517	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	The Honorable Eric Heryford Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678	The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Box Drawer D Independence, CA 93526	The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Lisa Green	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable James Sanchez
Kern County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento
1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor	419 4th Street	915 I Street, 4th Floor
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Hollister, CA 95023	Sacramento, CA 95814
The Honorable Keith Fagundes	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Dennis Herrera
Kings County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco
1400 West Lacey Boulevard	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	City Hall, Room 234
Hanford, CA 93230	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
		San Francisco, CA 94102
The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable Summer Stephan	The Honorable Richard Doyle
Lake County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, San Jose
255 North Forbes Street	330 W. Broadway Street	200 East Santa Clara Street,16th Floor
Lakeport, CA 95453	San Diego, CA 92101	San Jose, CA 95113

Electronic Mail Service List

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
Alameda County District Attorney	Riverside County	San Luis Obispo County
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	3072 Orange Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor
Oakland, CA 94621	Riverside, CA 92501	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65@rivcoda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Allison Haley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney
Napa County	San Joaquin County	Sonoma County
1127 First Street, Ste C	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	600 Administration Dr
Napa, CA 94559	Stockton, CA 95202	Sonoma, CA 95403
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney	Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney	Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney
San Francisco County	Santa Cruz County	Monterey County
732 Brannan Street	701 Ocean Street	1200 Aguajito Road
San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Monterey, CA 93940
gregory.alker@sfgov.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Yen Dang	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Yolo County	City of San Diego
Santa Clara County	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
70 W Hedding St	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
San Jose, CA 95110	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
EPU@da.sccgov.org		
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Christopher Dalbey,
Ventura County	Lassen County	Deputy District Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave	220 S. Lassen Street	Santa Barbara County
Ventura, CA 93009	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara St.
daspecialops@ventura.org	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
		DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Contra Costa County	Sacramento County	Tulare County
900 Ward Street	901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	221 S Mooney Blvd
Martinez, CA 94553	Prop65@sacda.org	Visalia, CA 95370
sgrassini@contracostada.org		Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Electronic Upload Service List

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice