

October 19, 2018

Heat Make Sense, Inc. Attn: Legal Department 300 Meserole St., 3rd Floor Brooklyn, NY 11206

Sephora USA, Inc. c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Ste 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

Re: <u>AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST HEAT MAKE SENSE, INC. AND SEPHORA USA, INC. OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6</u>

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

Ecological Alliance, LLC, a California limited liability company ("Alliance") is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Alliance has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* by Heat Make Sense, Inc., a New York corporation and Sephora USA, Inc., a Delaware corporation (collectively the "Violators"). This letter serves to provide Alliance's notification of these violations to the Violators and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Alliance intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are straightening brush sets, including but not limited to UPC #810905030220 ("Products") manufactured/distributed by Heat Make Sense, Inc. and offered for sale by retailers, including Sephora USA, Inc., to California consumers.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violators.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Diisononyl phthalate [DINP]. The routes of exposure for this chemical are ingestion and dermal. Such exposure can cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the clear and reasonable warnings required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as October 19, 2017, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Alliance intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violaters agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Alliance is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites Violators, should they seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Alliance's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Alliance's attorney, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com), Custodio & Dubey LLP, 448 S. Hill St., Suite 615, Los Angeles, CA 90013, 213-593-9095.

Sincerely,

Vineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:

Proposition 65 summary Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

## CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Ecological Alliance, LLC's Amended Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Heat Make Sense, Inc. and Sephora USA, Inc.

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: October 19, 2018

reet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 448 S. Hill St., Ste 615, Los Angeles, CA 90013.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) Amended 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Heat Make Sense, Inc. Attn: Legal Department 300 Meserole St., 3rd Floor Brooklyn, NY 11206

Sephora USA, Inc. c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Ste 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

October 19, 2018

Vineet Dubey

		uuu
Alameda County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney
1225 Fallon St, Room 900	210 W Temple St, 18th Floor	P0 Box 617
Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alnina County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248		PO Box 990
	209 W Yosemite Ave	Stockton, CA 95201 -0990
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera, CA 93637	
Amador County District Attorney	Mariposa County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney
708 Court, Suite 202	P.O. Box 730	850 Bryant St, Rm 322
Jackson, CA 95642	Mariposa, CA 95338	San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
25 County Center Dr.	3501 Civic Center Drive, #130	
Oroville, CA 95965-3385	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road	P.O. Box 1000	316 N Mountain View Ave
San Andreas, CA 95249	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General	Los Angeles City Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney
P.O. Box 70550	200 N Main St Ste 1800	# 1Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
Oakland, CA 94612-0550	Los Angeles CA 90012	San Francisco, CA 94102
Colusa County District Attorney	Inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
Courthouse, 547 Market St	P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Drive
Colusa, CA 95932	Independence, CA 93526	Suite 240
<del></del>	The state of the s	Roseville, CA 95678-6231
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney
725 Court St., Room 402	PO Box 808	550 W. Main St.
Martinez, CA 94553	Santa Ana, CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340
Del Norte County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney
450 "H" St.	10075 Levon Ave.	PO Box 720
Crescent City, CA 95531	Truckee, CA 96161	Nana, CA 94559-0720
El Dorado County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney
515 Main St.	520 Main Street, Rm 404	3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
	Ouincy, CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501
Placerville, CA 95667-5697	Sacramento County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney
Fresno County District Attorney	901 G Street	419 4th St
2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000		Hollister, CA 95023
Fresno, CA 93721	Sacramento, CA 95814	
Glenn County District Attorney PO Box 430	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney County Government Center, Rm 450	Siskiyou County District Attorney PO Box 986
Willows, CA 95988	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Yreka, CA 96097
	San Mateo County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th St., 4th Floor	400 County Center	600 Union Ave
Eureka, CA 95501		Fairfield, CA 94533
Imperial County District Attorney	Redwood City, CA 94063 Santa Barbara County District Attorney	
	1112 Santa Barbara St.	Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr.
939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor		Rm 212-J
El Centro, CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	
Z Ct District Attack	S Cl C	Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Ave.	Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St.	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West St.
	San Jose, CA 95110	
Bakersfield, CA 93301		Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney
	701 Ocean St., Room 200	P0 Box 457
Hanford, CA 93230	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Downieville, CA 95936-0457
Hanford, CA 93230  Lake County District Attorney	Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St	Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Hanford, CA 93230  Lake County District Attorney 155 N Forbes St  Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 Yuba County District Attorney
Hanford, CA 93230  Lake County District Attorney  255 N Forbes St  Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney  204 S. Court Street  Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901
Hanford, CA 93230  Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St  Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020  San Diego City Attorney	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St
Hanford, CA 93230  Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St  Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street  Alturas, CA 96101-4020  San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901  Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131
Hanford, CA 93230  Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St  Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street  Alturas, CA 96101-4020  San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130 Tulare County District Attorney	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130  Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130  Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695
Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790  Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Fuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370 Ventura County District Attorney	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130  Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291 Tehama County District Attorney	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901  Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695 SanJose City Attorney
Gov't Ctr, 1400 W Lacey Blvd Hanford, CA 93230 Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St Lakeport, CA 95453-4790 Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020 San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave # 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 Tuolumne County District Attorney 2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370 Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009	Santa Cruz, CÁ 95060 Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442 Modesto, CA 95353 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8 Susanville, CA 96130  Tulare County District Attorney County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	Downieville, CA 95936-0457 Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093  Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St Marysville, CA 95901 Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902  Yolo County District Attorney 310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695