

October 23, 2018

Ace Hardware Corporation c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Ste 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST ACE HARDWARE CORPORATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

Ecological Alliance, LLC, a California limited liability company ("Alliance") is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, Alliance has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. by Ace Hardware Corporation, a Delaware corporation (collectively the "Violators"). This letter serves to provide Alliance's notification of these violations to the Violators and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Alliance intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days or more after effective service of this notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are HDMI cables, including but not limited to UPC #843518048108 ("Products") manufactured/distributed by Ace Hardware Corporation and offered for sale by retailers to California consumers.

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached, to the copy of this letter served to the Violators.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Diisononyl phthalate [DINP]. The routes of exposure for this chemical are ingestion and dermal. Such exposure can cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring

without the clear and reasonable warnings required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as October 23, 2017, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Alliance intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violaters agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Alliance is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites Violators, should they seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with Alliance's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to Alliance's attorney, Vineet Dubey (dubey@cd-lawyers.com), Custodio & Dubey LLP, 448 S. Hill St., Suite 615, Los Angeles, CA 90013, 213-593-9095.

Sincerely,

Xineet Dubey

Custodio & Dubey LLP

cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:

Proposition 65 summary

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

## CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Ecological Alliance, LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Ace Hardware Corporation

- I, Vineet Dubey, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: October 23, 2018

Vineet Dubey, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 448 S. Hill St., Ste 615, Los Angeles, CA 90013.

On the date shown below, I served the following:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2) Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)
- 3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)
- 4) The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary

on the alleged violator listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Ace Hardware Corporation c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Ste 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

October 23, 2018

Vineet Dubey

		dubey
Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St, Room 900	Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 W Temple St, 18th Floor	Mono County District Attorney P0 Box 617
Oakland, CA 94612	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Bridgeport, CA 93517
Alpine County District Attorney PO Box 248	Madera County District Attorney 209 W Yosemite Ave	San Joaquin County District Attorney PO Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201 -0990
Markleeville, CA 96120 Amador County District Attorney	Madera, CA 93637 Mariposa County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney
708 Court, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642	P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	850 Bryant St, Rm 322 San Francisco, CA 94103
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
25 County Center Dr. Oroville, CA 95965-3385	3501 Civic Center Drive, #130 San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101-3803
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	316 N Mountain View Ave San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004
Office of the Attorney General	Los Angeles City Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney
P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550	200 N Main St Ste 1800 Los Angeles CA 90012	# 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234 San Francisco, CA 94102
Colusa County District Attorney	Inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
Courthouse, 547 Market St Colusa, CA 95932	P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526	10810 Justice Center Drive Suite 240
·		Roseville, CA 95678-6231  Merced County District Attorney
Contra Costa County District Attorney 725 Court St., Room 402	Orange County District Attorney P0 Box 808	550 W. Main Št.
Martinez, CA 94553	Santa Ana, CA 92702	Merced, CA 95340  Napa County District Attorney
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 "H" St.	Nevada County District Attorney 10075 Levon Ave.	PO Box 720
Crescent City, CA 95531	Truckee, CA 96161	Nana, CA 94559-0720 Riverside County District Attorney
El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main St.	Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Rm 404	3960 Orange Street, Suite 6
Placerville, CA 95667-5697	Ouincy, CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501 San Benito County District Attorney
Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare St, Ste. 1000	Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street	419 4th St
Fresno, CA 93721 Glenn County District Attorney	Sacramento, CA 95814 San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Hollister, CA 95023 Siskiyou County District Attorney
PO Box 430	County Government Center, Rm 450	PO Box 986
Willows, CA 95988 Humboldt County District Attorney	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 San Mateo County District Attorney	Yreka, CA 96097 Solano County District Attorney
825 5th St., 4th Floor	400 County Center	600 Union Ave
Eureka, CA 95501 Imperial County District Attorney	Redwood City, CA 94063 Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Fairfield, CA 94533 Sonoma County District Attorney
939 W. Main St., 2nd Floor	1112 Santa Barbara St.	600 Administration Dr. Rm 212-J
El Centro, CA 92243-2860	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Kern County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St.	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West St.
1215 Truxtun Ave. Bakersfield, CA 93301	San Jose, CA 95110	Redding, CA 96001-1632
Kings County District Attorney Gov't Ctr, 1400 W Lacey Blvd	Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean St., Room 200	Sierra County District Attorney P0 Box 457
Hanford, CA 93230	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Downieville, CA 95936-0457
Lake County District Attorney 255 N Forbes St	Stanislaus County District Attorney P0 Box 442	Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310
Lakeport, CA 95453-4790	Modesto, CA 95353	Weaverville, CA 96093
Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street	Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street	Yuba County District Attorney 215 5th St
Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Yuba City, CA 95991	Marysville, CA 95901
San Diego City Attorney City Center Plaza	Lassen County District Attorney 200 S Lassen St, Suite 8	Monterey County District Attorney PO Box 1131
1200 3rd Ave # 1100	Susanville, CA 96130	Salinas, CA 93902
San Diego, CA 92101 Tuolumne County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney
2 S Green St Sonora, CA 95370	County Civic Center, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291	310 Second St Woodland, CA 95695
Ventura County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	San Jose City Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009	P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff; CA 96080	200 E. Santa Clara St 16th Floor
Tonima, OA 23002	New Divil, On 70000	San Jose, CA 95110