

Melvin B. Pearlston  
Senior Counsel



Of Counsel  
Robert B. Hancock

November 1, 2018

**60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF  
CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 *ET SEQ.*  
(PROPOSITION 65)**

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Erika McCartney in this matter. Ms. McCartney has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with the identified products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, Ms. McCartney intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

**General Information about Proposition 65.** A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violator identified below.

**Alleged Violator.** The names of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter "the Violator") is:

**Universal Nutrition Properties, LLC d/b/a Universal Nutrition  
Amazon.com, Inc.  
Wal-Mart.com, USA, LLC  
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.  
6S, Inc. d/b/a All Star Health**

**Consumer Products and Listed Chemical.** The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

**Universal Nutrition - Gain Fast 3100 Chocolate Shake—Cadmium, Lead**

On May 1, 1997, the State of California officially listed cadmium as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity.

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals to cause cancer.

It should be noted that Ms. McCartney may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

**Route of Exposure.** The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion.

**Approximate Time Period of Violations.** Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least November 1, 2017, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, Ms. McCartney is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violator to: (1) recall any products already sold, or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation. It should be noted that counsel cannot (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who has received this notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement may satisfy the claims alleged herein, such agreement may not be satisfactory to public prosecutors.

Ms. McCartney has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Her address is 383 Stanwick St., Brentwood, California 94513. Her telephone number is 707.502.8635. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.**

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, *et seq.*

November 1, 2018

Page 3

Sincerely,



---

Robert B. Hancock  
robh@rbhancocklaw.com

**Attachments:**

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Violators only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

**Re: Notice of Proposition 65 Violations**

Robert B. Hancock declares:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemicals and the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: November 1, 2018

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Robert B. Hancock

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action.

On November 1, 2018, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY"** on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid and delivery by Certified Mail:

Current Manager or Managing Member  
Universal Nutrition Properties, LLC d/b/a  
Universal Nutrition  
3 Terminal Road  
New Brunswick, NJ 08901

Javier M. Scalini  
Registered Agent for 6S, Inc.  
d/b/a All Star Health  
9641 Lark Circle  
Fountain Valley, CA 92708

Current CEO or President  
Amazon.com, Inc.  
410 Terry Avenue North  
Seattle, WA 98109-5210

Current Manager or Managing Member  
Wal-Mart.com, USA, LLC  
850 Cherry Avenue  
San Bruno, CA 94066

Current CEO or President  
6S, Inc. d/b/a All Star Health  
9641 Lark Circle  
Fountain Valley, CA 92708

Current CEO or President  
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.  
702 S.W. 8th Street  
Bentonville, AR 72716

On November 1, 2018, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(D)(1)** on the following parties by uploading the foregoing documents at the webpage listed below:

Office of the California Attorney General  
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting  
1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000  
P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
<https://cag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>

On November 1, 2018, I served the following Documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto. As to those parties listed by mailing address only, I effected service by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties **on the Service list attached hereto**, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail. As to those parties having an e-mail address listed, I effected service by transmitting the document via electronic transmission to the email address listed.

Executed under penalty of perjury pursuant to the laws of the State of California on November 1, 2018.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Robert B. Hancock

November 1, 2018

Page 7

### Service List

District Attorney,  
Alameda County  
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900  
Oakland, CA 94612; [Prop65@acgov.org](mailto:Prop65@acgov.org)

District Attorney, Alpine County  
P.O. Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County  
708 Court Street, #202  
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County  
25 County Center Drive  
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County  
891 Mountain Ranch Road  
San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County  
547 Market Street  
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney,  
Contra Costa County  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553  
[Prop65@contracostada.org](mailto:Prop65@contracostada.org)

District Attorney,  
Del Norte County  
450 H Street, Ste. 171  
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County  
515 Main Street  
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County  
2220 Tulare Street, #1000  
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Placer County  
10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240  
Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County  
520 Main Street, Room 404  
Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County  
3960 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92502  
[Prop65@rivcoda.org](mailto:Prop65@rivcoda.org)

District Attorney,  
Sacramento County  
901 "G" Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[Prop65@sacda.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@sacda.ca.us)

District Attorney, San Benito County  
419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor  
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County  
316 N. Mountain View Avenue  
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004

District Attorney, San Diego County  
330 West Broadway, Room 1300  
San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney,  
San Francisco County  
850 Bryant Street, Room 322  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
[Prop65@sfdph.org](mailto:Prop65@sfdph.org)

District Attorney,  
San Joaquin County  
Post Office Box 990  
Stockton, CA 95201  
[Prop65@sjcda.net](mailto:Prop65@sjcda.net)

District Attorney,  
San Luis Obispo County  
1035 Palm St. Room 450  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408  
[Prop65@co.slo.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.slo.ca.us)

San Francisco City Attorney's Office  
City Hall, Room 234  
1 Drive Carlton B Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

District Attorney, Glenn County  
Post Office Box 430  
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County  
825 5th Street  
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County  
940 West Main Street, Ste 102  
El Centre, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County  
230 W. Line Street  
Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County  
1215 Truxtun Avenue  
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County  
1400 West Lacey Boulevard  
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County  
255 N. Forbes Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County  
220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8  
Susanville, CA 96130  
[mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us](mailto:mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us)

District Attorney,  
Los Angeles County  
210 West Temple Street, Suite 1800  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney,  
Madera County  
209 West Yosemite Avenue  
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, San Mateo County  
400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor  
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County  
1112 Santa Barbara Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
[Prop65@co.santabarbara.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.santabarbara.ca.us)

District Attorney, Santa Clara County  
70 West Hedding Street  
San Jose, CA 95110  
[Prop65@co.santaclara.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.santaclara.ca.us)

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County  
701 Ocean Street, Room 200  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060  
[Prop65@co.santacruz.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.santacruz.ca.us)

District Attorney, Shasta County  
1355 West Street  
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County  
PO Box 457  
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County  
Post Office Box 986  
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County  
675 Texas Street, Ste 4500  
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County  
600 Administration Drive,  
Room 212J  
Santa Rosa, CA 95403  
[Prop65@co.sonoma.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.sonoma.ca.us)

District Attorney, Stanislaus County  
832 12th Street, Ste 300  
Modesto, CA 95353

San Jose City Attorney's Office  
200 East Santa Clara Street,  
16th Floor  
San Jose, CA 95113

District Attorney, Marin County  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130  
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney,  
Mariposa County  
Post Office Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95330  
District Attorney,  
Mendocino County  
Post Office Box 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County  
2222 M Street  
Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County  
204 S Court Street, Room 202  
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County  
Post Office Box 617  
Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County  
Post Office Box 1131  
Salinas, CA 93902  
[Prop65@co.monterey.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.monterey.ca.us)

District Attorney, Napa County  
1127 First Street, Suite C  
Napa, CA 94559  
[CEPD@countyofnapa.org](mailto:CEPD@countyofnapa.org)

District Attorney, Nevada County  
201 Commercial St.  
Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County  
401 Civic Center Drive West  
Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Sutter County  
446 Second Street  
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County  
Post Office Box 519  
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County  
Post Office Box 310  
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County  
221 S. Mooney Avenue, Room 224  
Visalia, CA 93291  
[Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us)

District Attorney, Tuolumne County  
423 N. Washington Street  
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County  
800 South Victoria Avenue  
Ventura, CA 93009  
[Prop65@co.ventura.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.ventura.ca.us)

District Attorney, Yolo County  
301 2nd Street  
Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County  
215 Fifth Street, Suite 152  
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office  
City Hall East  
200 N. Main Street, Rm 800  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office  
1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620  
San Diego, CA 92101  
[CityAtt@sanprop65.com](mailto:CityAtt@sanprop65.com)

Office of the City Attorney  
City of Sacramento  
915 I Street, 4th Floor  
Sacramento, CA 95814