NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Lead in Molasses

November 30, 2018

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Charlie Pizarro is the Associate Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- <u>Violators</u>: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least November 30, 2015, and are ongoing.
- <u>Provision of Proposition 65</u>: This Notice covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- <u>Chemical(s) Involved</u>: The names of the listed chemicals involved in these violations are lead and lead compounds ("Lead"). Exposures to Lead occur from consumption of the products identified in this Notice.
- <u>Type of Product</u>: The specific type of product causing these violations is molasses. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1. Further limitations, if any, on the specific products subject to this Notice for each individual violator are also identified on Exhibit 1.
- <u>Description of Exposure</u>: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to Lead.
 Consumption of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to Lead. The products contain Lead. The primary route of exposure for the violations is direct ingestion when consumers eat the products or food from which

these products are made. These exposures occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout California where the products are consumed. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards of Lead.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the Lead exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in molasses; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by each alleged violator in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Eric S. Somers at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, esomers at lexlawgroup.com.

EXHIBIT 1 November 30, 2018 Notice of Violation Lead in Molasses

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Further Limitation on Products Sold by Violators	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products
B&G Foods North America, Inc. Four Gatehall Drive Parsippany, NJ 07054	n/a	Brer Rabbit Molasses Full Flavor Unsulphured UPC No. 0-24000-33513-9
Good Food, Inc. 4960 Horseshoe Pike Honey Brook, PA 19344	n/a	Golden Barrel Unsulphured Blackstrap Molasses Item No. 999BLKS1232 UPC No. 0-77391-32111-3
Honeytree, Inc. 8570 Monroe Road Onsted, MI 46265	n/a	Slow As Molasses Light & Mild, Pure Unsulphured Item No. SOE6331216 UPC No. 0-41496-33121-6
Target Corporation 1000 Nicollet Mall Minneapolis, MN 55403	Sold under the Simply Balanced brand	Simply Balanced Organic Blackstrap Molasses Unsulphured UPC No. 0-85239-06780-2
Trader Joe's Company 800 S. Shamrock Avenue Monrovia, CA 91016	Sold under the Trader Joe's brand	Trader Joe's Organic Blackstrap Molasses Unsulphured SKU No. 0057-8073
Vitacost.com, Inc. 5400 Broken Sound Pkwy NW Suite 500 Boca Raton, FL 33487	Sold by Honeytree, Inc.	Slow As Molasses Light & Mild, Pure Unsulphured Item No. SOE6331216 UPC No. 0-41496-33121-6
Wal-Mart.com USA, LLC 702 SW 8 th Street Bentonville, AR 72716	Sold by B&G Foods North America, Inc.	Brer Rabbit Molasses Full Flavor Unsulphured UPC No. 0-24000-33513-9

The WEBstaurant Store, Inc. 2205 Old Philadelphia Pike Lancaster, PA 17602

Sold by Good Food, Inc. Golden Barrel Unsulphured Blackstrap Molasses Item No. 999BLKS1232 UPC No. 0-77391-32111-3

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Eric S. Somers, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.
- 3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

November 30, 2018

Eric S. Somers

Attorney for CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

1	PROOF OF SERVICE		
2			
3	I, Alexis Pearson, declare:		
4	California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not	a party to this action. My business	
5	apearson@lexlawgroup.com.	and my email address is	
6 7	On November 30, 2018, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in this action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:		
8	TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;	SAFE DRINNKING WATER AND	
9	CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and		
10	THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORC	CEMENT ACT OF 1986 o those on service list marked with an	
12	àsterisk).		
13	■ BY MAIL: I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the		
14	ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices		
15	Please see attached service list.		
16 17	BY FACSIMILE: I caused all pages of the document(s) listed above to be transmitted via facsimile to the fax number(s) as indicated and said transmission was reported as complete and without error.		
18 19	☑ BY ELECTRONIC MAIL: I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] before 5 p.m on the date executed.		
20		Dang	
21	1 Contra Costa County Supe	rvising Deputy District Attorney a Clara County	
22	2 Martinez, CA 94553 70 W	est Hedding Street, West Wing lose, CA 95110	
23	g epu@)da.sccgov.org	
24	Lasser County	n Haley, District Attorney	
25	5 Susanville, CA 96130 1127	County First Street, Suite C	
26	L II III CALITION CONTROL CONTROL	, CA 94559 D@countyofnapa.org	
27	7		

1 2	Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403	Mara W. Elliott, City Attorney City of San Diego 1200 Third Ave, Suite 700 San Diego, CA 92101	
3	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov	
5	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Rm. 224	Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue	
6	Visalia, CA 93291 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org	
7	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney	
8	Riverside County 4075 Main Street	San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street	
9	Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org	San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org	
10	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	
11	Yolo County 301 Second Street	Sacramento Country 901 G Street	
12	Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org	Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org	
13		Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney	
14	Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County	San Luis Obispo County	
15	1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940	County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor	
16	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	
17	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County	Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney	
18	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street	
19	Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	
20	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	
21	Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street	Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County	
22	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621	
23	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	CEPDProp65@acgov.org	
24			
25	E DY DEDGOMAN DELIMINATION OF THE STATE OF T	ros of the document(s) listed above in a sealed	
26	☐ BY PERSONAL DELIVERY: I placed all pages of the document(s) listed above in a sealed envelope addressed to the party(ies) listed above, and caused such envelope to be delivered by hand to the addressee(s) as indicated.		
27	D DV OVEDNICHT DEI IVERV: I denosited s	uch document(s) in a box or other facility	
28	regularly maintained by FedEx, or delivered such document(s) to a courier or driver authorized by FedEx, with delivery fees paid or provided for, and addressed to the person(s) being served.		

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on November 30, 2018 at San Francisco, California.

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Ste. 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney of Colusa County 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney of Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County 939 Main Street, Ste. 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Inyo County P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney of Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 District Attorney of Kings County 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney of Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney of Modoc County 204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93546

District Attorney of Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney of Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste. 240 Roseville CA 95678-6231 District Attorney of Plumas County 520 Main Street, Rm. 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney of San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl. Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney of San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Ste. 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3rd Fl. Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2nd Fl. Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste. 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County P.O. Box 310 11 Court Street Weaverville, CA 96093 District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

California Attorney General's Office Attention: Proposition 65 Coordinator and Robert Thomas 1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

President*
B&G Foods North America, Inc.
Four Gatehall Drive
Parsippany, NJ 07054

Sally Martin, President* Good Food, Inc. 4960 Horseshoe Pike Honey Brook, PA 19344

Sally Martin, President* Good Food, Inc. P.O. Box 160 Honey Brook, PA 19344

Robert C. Olney, Jr., President* Honeytree, Inc. 8570 Monroe Road Onsted, MI 46265

Brian Cornell, CEO* Target Corporation 1000 Nicollet Mall Minneapolis, MN 55403 Danny Bane, CEO* Trader Joe's Company 800 S. Shamrock Avenue Monrovia, CA 91016

Brian Helman, President* Vitacost.com, Inc. 5400 Broken Sound Pkwy NW Suite 500 Boca Raton, FL 33487

Brian Helman, President* Vitacost.com, Inc. 1014 Vine Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

President* Wal-Mart.com USA, LLC 702 SW 8th Street Bentonville, AR 72716

President* Wal-Mart.com USA, LLC 850 Cherry Avenue San Bruno, CA 94066

David Groff, President* The WEBstaurant Store, Inc. 2205 Old Philadelphia Pike Lancaster, PA 17602