LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNEY, A Professional Corporation 446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310

Pacifica, California 94044 (650) 219 3187 Phone <u>brian@gaffneylegal.com</u>

April 24, 2019

Notice of Violations
Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting Attn: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street Oakland, CA 94612

Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code § 1040

By Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested to Violators in U.S.A. By Registered Mail to Violators Located Outside U.S.A.

By First Class U.S. Mail to Public Enforcement Agencies

Dear Public Enforcement Agencies / Violators:

This office and Ecological Rights Foundation ("ERF") gives you notice that, since at least April 24, 2016 the businesses listed on Attachment A have been, and continue to be, in violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.6. ERF is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to protecting human and environmental health, including raising awareness of, and reducing exposures to, toxic chemicals.

ERF intends to bring an enforcement action 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify the violations discussed in this notice letter. The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this notice of violations are identified on the attached Certificate of Service.

The above referenced violations occur when California residents use 3D pens utilizing filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, including acrylonitrile-butadiene-styrene (ABS) filaments, polycarbonate ABS (PC-ABS) filaments, and high impact polystyrene (HIPS) filaments. Use of 3D pens and the above identified filaments expose people to styrene, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. 3D pens sold by the businesses listed on Attachment A expose consumers and workers to styrene via inhalation.

Examples of particular products manufactured, sold, distributed and/or marketed by the violators are attached as Attachment B. All of the 3D pens at issue in this notice can be used with

filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, including acrylonitrile-butadiene-styrene (ABS) filaments, polycarbonate ABS (PC-ABS) filaments, and high impact polystyrene (HIPS) filaments. When people use these 3D pens, the above filaments are heated by the 3D pens and thus release styrene into the air. People using 3D pens utilizing filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, and others in the same room where such 3D pens are being used, inhale styrene in the normal course of use.

In addition, exposures in the environmental context occur in the homes, businesses, schools and public locations where the people use 3D pens utilizing filaments incorporating a styrene monomer. Exposures to styrene occur within the consumer and environmental contexts.

The businesses listed on Attachment A did not and do not provide clear and reasonable warnings to people who use 3D pens utilizing filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, that use of these products will expose them to chemicals known to cause cancer. The above violations have occurred every day since at least April 24, 2016 and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are given.

Attachment B is a non-exclusive list of examples of these types of products. Though specific models or product numbers are given as examples, this Notice also pertains to all models and all variations of 3D pens utilizing filaments incorporating a styrene monomer sold in California. Attachment B is for the recipient's benefit and is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product. It is ERF's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other specific products within the identified category or type that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the past three years, to ensure that clear and reasonable warnings are provided to California citizens prior to purchase, or retroactively if necessary.

These violations and threatened violations will continue to occur everyday until these businesses either provide clear and reasonable warnings, reformulate their 3d pens so as not to use filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, or stop selling these 3d pens in California. These violations occur in all of California's 58 counties, both on and off of these businesses' properties.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to expeditiously rectify these ongoing violations of California law, ERF is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

The following individual is the responsible individual within ERF for purposes of this Notice:

Fredric Evenson
Ecological Rights Foundation
P.O. Box 1000
Santa Cruz, California 95061
Telephone: (831) 454-8216
Email: evenson@ecologylaw.com

ERF has retained the following counsel to represent it in this matter. Please direct communications to counsel.

Brian Gaffney
LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNEY APC
446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310
Pacifica, California 94044
(650) 219 3187
brian@gaffneylegal.com

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

ERF is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that advances the public interest without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. ERF is willing to settle this matter to the extent legally possible prior to the commencement of any enforcement action. Settlement terms would require that the unwarned exposures described in this Notice of Violation be stopped. That would require at least the following: 1) a potential recall of products already sold; 2) that either warnings be given to all future purchasers in California of the products subject to this Notice, that the products be reformulated to eliminate the exposures described in the Notice, or that you stop marketing, distributing or selling the products in California, 3) that you locate and provide a warning compliant with 27 Cal. Code Regs Section 25601 to each person who has been subject to the unwarned exposures described in the Notice to the extent those exposures are caused by products that were sold in California during the past three years; and 4) that you pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249(b). It should be noted that ERF cannot finalize any settlement of this matter until 70 days have elapsed since the sending of the Notice and unless no public enforcer has begun an enforcement action concerning the violations described in the Notice. Any settlement on behalf of the public interest must be approved by the California Superior Court on noticed motion with 45 days' notice to the California Attorney General. The Attorney General may appear at any approval hearing and oppose a settlement if he or she believes the proposed settlement is not in the public interest. If you wish to discuss settlement of this matter before ERF files suit, please promptly contact ERF's counsel.

Singerely,

Brian Gaffney

Enclosure to Violators "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986: A Summary." A Certificate of Merit is also attached.

Certificate of Merit - Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

- I, Brian Gaffney, hereby declare:
- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Date: April 24, 2019

Attachment A – Violators – 3D Pens

Walmart Inc.
Platinum Micro Inc.
Media Supply, Inc.
Profound 3D
WobbleWorks LLC
Amazon.com Inc.
MYNT3D
Hunan World Maya Ecommerce Co., Ltd.

ATTACHMENT B

3D PENS

ATTACHIVIENTE	3D PENS
<u>Violator</u>	<u>Product</u>
Walmart Inc.	3D PEN GEN-II by Titanium
	Micro
	MODEL: MK0607
Platinum Micro Inc.	3D PEN GEN-II by Titanium
	Micro
	MODEL: MK0607
·	·
**	
Media Supply, Inc.	IDRAWING 3D Printing Pen
	UPC: 183206 002297
Profound 3D	IDRAWING 3D Printing Pen
	UPC: 183206 002297
WobbleWorks LLC	3DOODLER CREATE+ 3D PEN
	UPC: 817005 022407

Amazon.com Inc.	MYNT3D PROFESSIONAL
	PRINTING 3D PEN
	B01BLQ24IW
MYNT3D	AAVAITAD DDOFFEELOMAA
IVITNISU	MYNT3D PROFESSIONAL
	PRINTING 3D PEN
	B01BLQ24IW

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Brian Gaffney, declare:

If so called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310, Pacifica, CA 94044.

On April 24, 2019, I caused the attached

(1) Notice of Violations: California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, (2) Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), (3) Appendix A: The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary, (4) Certificate of Service to be served by CERTIFIED MAIL to each private business entity listed on the attached SERVICE LIST-Noticed Parties, except for each private business located outside of the U.S.A. which are served by REGISTERED MAIL. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected.

In addition, on the same date and I caused the attached
(1) Notice of Violations: California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, (2)
Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), (3) Certificate of Merit
(Attorney General Copy): Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the Certificate
of Merit (only sent to the Attorney General), (4) Certificate of Service by FIRST CLASS U.S.
MAIL on those public enforcement agencies listed on the attached SERVICE LIST-Public
Enforcers. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S.
Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected, and

by sending portable document format (PDF) files of the same to the electronic mail addresses to each of the public prosecutors identified by the California Attorney General as having authorized electronic service of notices. These public enforcement agencies appear on the attached Service List with their electronic mail addresses.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on April 24, 2019, at Pacifica, California.

Brian Gaffi

SERVICE LIST-Noticed Parties 3D PENS

Jeffrey P. Bezos or Current President or CEO, Amazon.Com Inc. 410 Terry Avenue North Seattle WA 98109-5210

Walmart Inc. ATTN: President/CEO 708 SW 8th Street Bentonville, AR 72716

Media Supply, Inc. ATTN: President/CEO 208 Philips Road, Exton PA 19341

WobbleWorks LLC c/o BRIAN ALBERS 1558 McDANIEL AVE SAN JOSE CA 95126 Amazon.Com Inc. c/o CSC - LAWYERS INCORPORATING SERVICE 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Ste. 150N Sacramento CA 95833

Platinum Micro Inc. c/o CHALERMCHAI SIRICHALERMCHAI 15815 MONTE ST, STE F103 SYLMAR CA 91342

Media Supply Inc. ATTN: President/CEO, 611 Jeffers Circle Exton PA 19341 Walmart, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 818 West Seventh Street, Suite 930 Los Angeles, CA 90017

MYNT3D ATTN: President/CEO 4041 Soquel Dr., Ste A148 Soquel, CA 95073

Profound 3D ATTN: President/CEO 208 Philips Rd Exton PA 19341

Hunan World Maya Ecommerce Co., Ltd., ATTN: President/CEO, Yuhua Qu Xiangfu Donglu, 2Duan 168Hao Shanshuixiyuan 5Dong 701, Changsha, Hunan, China 410007

Service List - Public Enforcers

Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Occupation Division
Alameda County	Lassen County	San Benito County	Office of the District Attorney Tehama County
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	419 4th Street	P.O. Box 519
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Hollister, CA 95023	Red Bluff, CA 96080
Alpine County	Los Angeles County	Office of the District Attorney San Bernardino County	Office of the District Attorney
P.O. Box 248	211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200	303 W. Third Street	Trinity County P.O. Box 310
Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Bernardino, CA 92415	Weaverville, CA 96093
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney
Amador County 708 Court Street, #202	Madera County	San Diego County	Tulare County
Jackson, CA 95642	209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	CityAttyProp6S@sandiego.gov	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	0.00
Butte County	Marin County	San Francisco County	Office of the District Attorney Tuolumne County
25 County Center Drive	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	gregory.alker@sfgov.org	423 N. Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95965	San Rafael, CA 94903		Sonora, CA 95370
Office of the District Attorney Calaveras County	Office of the District Attorney Mariposa County	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	P.O. Box 730	San Joaquin County DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Ventura County
	Mariposa, CA 95338	Diteonsumer. Environmental@sjcda.org	daspecialops@ventura.org
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney
Colusa County	Mendocino County	San Luis Obispo County	Yolo County
346 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	P.O. Box 1000	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	cfepd@yolocounty.org
······································	Ukiah, CA 95482 Office of the District Attorney	Office of the Diselect Au	· .
Office of the District Attorney	Merced County	Office of the District Attorney San Mateo County	Office of the District Attorney
Contra Costa County sgrassini@contracostada.org	550 West Main Street	400 County Center, Third Floor	Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152
	Merced, CA 95340	Redwood City, CA 94063	Marysville, CA 95901
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Oakland City Attorney
Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171	Modoc County 204 S. Court Street Room 202	Santa Barbara County	City Hall, 6th Floor
Crescent City, CA 95531	Alturas, CA 96101	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	1 Frank Ogawa Plaza
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Oakland, California 94612 Office of the City Attorney
El Dorado County	Mono County	Santa Clara County	City of San Francisco
515 Main Street	P.O. Box 617	EPU@da.sccgov.org	City Hall, Room 234
Placerville, CA 95667	Bridgeport, CA 93517	•	l Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Pl.
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	San Francisco, CA 94102
Fresno County	Monterey County	Santa Cruz County	Office of the City Attorney City of Sacramento
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	915 I Street, 4th Floor
Fresno, CA 93721			Sacramento, CA 95814
Office of the District Attorney Glenn County	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
P.O. Box 430	Napa County	Shasta County 1355 West Street	City of San Jose
Willows, CA 95988	CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Redding, CA 96001	200 E. Santa Clara St.
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	San Jose, CA 95113 Office of the City Attorney
Humboldt County	Nevada County	Sierra County	City of Los Angeles
825 5th Street, 4th Floor	201 Commercial Street	.P.O. Box 457	200 N. Main Street, Suite 800
Eureka, CA 95501	Nevada City, CA 95959	Downieville, CA 95936	Los Angeles, CA 90012
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Off of City
Imperial County	Orange County	Siskiyou County	Office of the City Attorney City of San Diego
940 West Main Street, Suite 102	401 Civic Center Drive West	P.O. Box 986	1200 Third Ave., Suite 1620
El Centro, CA 92243	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Yreka, CA 96097	San Diego, CA 92101
Office of the District Attorney inyo County	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Proposition 65 Enforcement
nyoda@inyocounty.us	Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive	Solano County 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	Reporting
,	Roseville, CA 95678	Fairfield, CA 94533	Attn: Prop 65 Coordinator
			1515 Clay Street , Su .74 2000 P.O. Box 70550
Destance of the To			Oakland, CA 94612
Office of the District Attorney Kern County	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	4 72 77 77 77
215 Truxtun Avenue	Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404	Sonoma County	
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Quincy, CA 95971	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	
Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	Office of the District Attorney	
lings County	Riverside County	Stanislaus County	
400 West Lacey Blvd.	Prop65@rivcoda.org	832 12th Street, Suite 300	
Hanford, CA 93230 Office of the District Attorney	Office of the Division	Modesto, CA 95354	
Lake County	Office of the District Attorney Sacramento County	Office of the District Attorney	
255 N. Forbes Street		Sutter County 446 Second Street, Suite 102	
		THE PRESENTING FOR THE PARTY OF	