# LAW OFFICE OF RICHARD M. FRANCO

# 6500 ESTATES DRIVE OAKLAND, CA 94611 510.684.1022 RICK@RFRANCOLAW.COM

July 24, 2019

To: President or CEO- Jarrow Formulas, Inc.

President or CEO- Jarrow Industries, Inc.

California Attorney General

City Attorneys for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Francisco and San Jose District Attorneys for 58 Counties (See attached Certificate of Service)

Re: Notice of Violations of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement

Act (Health and Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.) (Proposition 65)

#### Dear Addressees:

I represent Center for Food Safety in connection with this Notice of Violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health and Safety Code Section 22249.5 *et seq.*, also known as Proposition 65. Center for Food Safety is a national nonprofit public interest and environmental advocacy organization working to protect human health and the environment by curbing the use of harmful food production practices and by promoting organic and other forms of sustainable agriculture. This letter serves to provide notification to you and to the public enforcement agencies listed above of the violations of Proposition 65 detailed herein.

This letter constitutes notice that the entities listed below have violated and continue to violate the warning provisions of Proposition 65. Specifically, the entities listed below have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6, which provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual..."

<u>Violators:</u> The names of the entities that violated Proposition 65 as described in this Notice are Jarrow Formulas, Inc. and Jarrow Industries, Inc. (hereinafter collectively referred to as the "Violators".)

<u>Listed Chemical:</u> The violations described herein involve exposure to the listed chemical lead. On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

<u>Product Causing Violations:</u> The following consumer product is the subject of this notice because it is causing exposures to lead in violation of Proposition 65:

## Jarrow Formulas Preg-Natal Tablets

Nature of Violation: The alleged Violators knowingly and intentionally exposed and continue to expose consumers in the State of California to lead without first providing a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning. The Violators have manufactured, marketed distributed and/or sold the above-identified products to California consumers, which have exposed and continue to expose California consumers to the listed chemical lead without providing the required Proposition 65 warning.

Route of Exposure: Use of the product identified in this notice results in exposures to lead, primarily via ingestion of the product.

<u>Duration of Violations:</u> The violations have been occurring since at least July 24, 2018, and are ongoing.

A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with the copy of this notice sent to the Violators.

Pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(d), Center for Food Safety intends to file a citizen enforcement action sixty days after service of this notice unless the violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to (1) recall products already sold in California; (2) reformulate the products so as to eliminate further exposures to the listed chemical or provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in California in the future; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Center for Food Safety is interested in pursuing a reasonable and constructive resolution to this matter, in order to avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to lead and expensive and time-consuming litigation.

George Kimbrell is Legal Director of Center for Food Safety and is located in Center for Food Safety's Pacific Northwest Office, at 2009 NE Alberta St., Ste. 207, Portland, Oregon 97211. Center for Food Safety also maintains a California office at 303 Sacramento St., 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, San Francisco, CA 94111. Center for Food Safety has retained me in connection with this matter. Please direct all correspondence concerning this notice to my attention at the above-listed law office address and telephone number.

Notice of Violation July 24, 2019 Page 3 of 4

Sincerely,

Richard M. Franco

Attachments: Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Violators and their Registered Agents for

Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

Notice of Violation July 24, 2019 Page 4 of 4

Re: Center for Food Safety's Notice of Proposition Violations by Jarrow Formulas, Inc. and Jarrow Industries, Inc.

## I, Richard M. Franco, declare:

- This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- I am an attorney for the noticing party, Center for Food Safety.
- I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate
  experience or expertise who have review facts, studies or other data
  regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the
  notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through these consultants and other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for a private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit, additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate has been served on the Attorney General, including the information identified in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: July 24, 2019

Richard M. Franco

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years old and am not a party to this action. My business address is 6500 Estates Drive, Oakland, CA 94611, located in Alameda County, where the mailing occurred.

On July 24, 2019, I served the following documents: (1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT (HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and (3) THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY on the following entities by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid and addressed as listed below, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service:

Current President or CEO	Jarrow Rogovin
Jarrow Formulas, Inc.	(Agent for Service of Process for Jarrow
1824 S. Robertson Blvd.	Formulas, Inc.)
Los Angeles, CA 90035	1824 S. Robertson Blvd.
	Los Angeles, CA 90035
Current President or CEO	Bryan O'Neill
Jarrow Industries, Inc.	(Agent for Service of Process for Jarrow
12246 Hawkins St.	Industries, Inc.)
Santa Fe Springs, CA 90670	12246 Hawkins St.
	Santa Fe Springs, CA 90670

On July 24, 2019, I served the following documents: 1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT (HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and (3) ADDITIONAL INFORMATION SUPPORTING CERTIFICATE OF MERIT PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE § 25149.7(d)(1) and 11 CALIFORNIA CODE OF REGULATIONS § 3102 on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On July 24, 2019, I served the following documents: 1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC

ENFORCEMENT ACT (HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.); and (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each party listed below:

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org	Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org
Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org
Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Atty Santa Clara County 70 W. Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org
Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Steven R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr. Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivdoca.org	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd. Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.gov	Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S. Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org
Chrisopher Dalbey, Deputy District Atty Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	Jeff W. Ressig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Ave San Diego, CA 92101	Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621
Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202
Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Proposition and Calabara San Andreas	Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prophe DAM and acrus (2001)
Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us	

On July 24, 2019, I served the following documents: 1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT (HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the entities on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid and addressed as listed on the attached Service List, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service.

Executed on July 24, 2019 in Oakland, California.

Richard M. Franco

#### Service List

District Attorney Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney Imperial County 940 West Main St. Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 District Attorney Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney Lake County 255 N. Forbes St. Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St. Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney Madera County 209 West Yosemite Ave. Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney Modoc County 204 S Court Street Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517 District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney Orange County 401 W. Civic Center Dr. Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Dr. Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney San Benito County 419 Fourth Street 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney San Bernardino County 303 West Third St. San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney San Diego County 330 West Broadway Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney San Mateo Count 400 Country Ctr. 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square 2nd Floor Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 District Attorney Solano County 675 Texas St., Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney Sutter County 463 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main St., Ste. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113