

# December 2, 2019

To: Manager or Member – Garden of Life LLC

President or CEO – Atrium Innovations, Inc.

President or CEO – Nestlé Health Science U.S. Holdings, Inc.

California Attorney's Office

District Attorney's Office for 58 counties

City Attorney's for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, and Los Angeles

(See attached Certificate of Service)

From: Center for Food Safety

Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.

#### Dear Addressees:

This firm represents Center for Food Safety in connection with this Notice of Violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). Center for Food Safety is a national non-profit public interest and environmental advocacy organization working to protect human health and the environment by curbing the use of harmful food production technologies and by promoting organic and other forms of sustainable agriculture. This letter serves to provide notification of these violations to you and to the public enforcement agencies of Proposition 65.

This letter constitutes notice that the entities listed below have violated and continue to violate provisions of Proposition 65. Specifically, the entities listed below have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement at § 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual..."

<u>Violators</u>: The name of the violators covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter referred to as the "Violators") are: 1) Garden of Life LLC, 2) Atrium Innovations, Inc., and 3) Nestlé Health Science U.S. Holdings, Inc.

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: These violations involve exposure to the listed chemical lead. On October 1, 1992, California officially listed lead as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. On February 27, 1987, California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause reproductive and developmental toxicity.

Notice of Violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.5 et seq. December 2, 2019 Page 2

<u>Consumer Products</u>: The following specific product that is the subject of this notice because it is causing exposures in violation of Proposition 65 is:

#### 1. Vitamin Code Raw Prenatal Multivitamin

<u>Violation</u>: The alleged Violators knowingly and intentionally exposed and continue to expose consumers within the State of California to lead without providing a Proposition 65 warning. The Violators have manufactured, marketed, distributed, and/or sold the listed products, which have exposed and continue to expose numerous individuals within California to the identified chemical, lead.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>: Use of the products identified in this notice results in human exposures to lead. The primary route of exposure is ingestion.

<u>Duration of Violation</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least December 2, 2018, and are ongoing.

A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with the copy of this letter sent to the Violators.

Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), Center for Food Safety intends to file a citizen enforcement action sixty days after effective service of this notice unless the Violators agree in an enforceable written agreement to: (1) reformulate the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and my client's objectives in pursuing this notice, Center for Food Safety is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical and expensive and time consuming litigation.

Sylvia Wu is a Senior Attorney with Center for Food Safety. Ms. Wu is located at 303 Sacramento St., 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94111, Tel. 415-826-0507. Center for Food Safety has retained my firm in connection with this matter. Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me, Rebecca Davis (rebecca@lozeaudrury.com), Lozeau Drury LLP, 1939 Harrison St., Suite 150, Oakland, California, 94612, (510) 836-4200.

Sincerely,

Rebecca L. Davis

Notice of Violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.5 et seq. December 2, 2019 Page 3

# Attachments:

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Violators and their Registered Agents for Service of Process only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

Notice of Violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.5 et seq. December 2, 2019 Page 4

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Center for Food Safety's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Garden of Life LLC, Atrium Innovations, Inc., and Nestlé Health Science U.S. Holdings, Inc.

# I, Rebecca Davis, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party, Center for Food Safety.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants and other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit, additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate has been served on the Attorney General, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 2, 2019

Rebecca Davis

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years old, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 1939 Harrison Street, Suite 150, Oakland, California 94612, in Alameda County, where the mailing occurred.

On December 2, 2019, I served the following documents: (1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF THE CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; (3) THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY on the following entities by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail, addressed to the entity listed below, and placing the envelope for collection and mailing, following our ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is placed for collection and mailing, it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the United States Postal Service.

Current Manager or Member Garden of Life LLC 4200 Northcorp Parkway, Suite 200 Palm Beach Gardens, FL 33410

Corporation Service Company (Agent for Service of Process for Garden of Life LLC) 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833-3505

Current President or CEO Atrium Innovations, Inc. 3500 de Maisonneuve Boulevard West, Suite 2405

Current President or CEO Nestlé Health Science U.S. Holdings, Inc. 1812 N. Moore Street Arlington, VA 22209

Westmount, Québec, CD H3Z 3C1

Current Manager or Member Garden of Life LLC 3500 De Maisonneuve Boulevard West, Suite 2405 Westmount, Québec, CD H3Z 3C1

Current President or CEO Atrium Innovations, Inc. 600 Boyce Road Pittsburgh, PA 15205

Corporation Service Company (Agent for Service of Process for Nestlé Health Science U.S. Holdings, Inc.) 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833-3505 On December 2, 2019, I served the following documents (1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF THE CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; (3) ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)(1) on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On December 2, 2019, I served the following documents (1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF THE CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to the party listed below:

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Gary Liberstein, District Attorney Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr. Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney

Sacramento County

901 G Street

Sacramento, CA 95814

Prop65@sacda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney

Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101

DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney

San Diego City Attorney

1200 Third Ave.

San Diego, CA 92101

CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney

San Luis Obispo County

County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor

San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Barbara Yook, District Attorney

Calaveras County

891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney

Inyo County

168 North Edwards Street

Independence, CA 93526

inyoda@inyocounty.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney

Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave

Ventura, CA 93009

daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney

Yolo County 301 Second Street

Woodland, CA 95695

cfepd@yolocounty.org

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney

7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650

Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County

222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202

Stockton, CA 95202

DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney

Santa Cruz County

701 Ocean Street

Santa Cruz, CA 95060

Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

On December 2, 2019, I served the following documents (1) NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF THE CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail, addressed to each of the entities on the Service List attached hereto, and placing the envelope for collection and mailing, following our ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is placed for collection and mailing, it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the United States Postal Service.

Executed on December 2, 2019, in Oakland, California.

Toyer Grear

### **Service List**

District Attorney Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney Imperial County 940 West Main St. Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 District Attorney Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney Lake County 255 N. Forbes St. Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St. Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney Madera County 209 West Yosemite Ave. Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney Modoc County 204 S Court Street Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517 District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney Orange County 401 W. Civic Center Dr. Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Dr. Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney San Benito County 419 Fourth Street 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney San Bernardino County 303 West Third St. San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney San Diego County 330 West Broadway Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney San Mateo Count 400 Country Ctr. 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square 2nd Floor Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 District Attorney Solano County 675 Texas St., Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney Sutter County 463 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main St., Ste. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113