

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)

DATE: March 12, 2020

TO: Jonathan E. Schwefel, CEO - Cost Plus, Inc.
Steven H. Temares, CEO - Bed Bath & Beyond Inc.
California Attorney General's Office;
District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and
City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

FROM: Susan Davia

RE: Cost Plus Gooseneck Kettle

I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Susan Davia. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the alleged violators Cost Plus, Inc. and Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc. (collectively, "Violator"). The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposure, and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure:	See Section VII. Exhibit A
Listed Chemical:	Lead and Lead Compounds
Routes of Exposure:	Inhalation, Ingestion, Dermal
Types of Harm:	Birth Defects and other Reproductive Harm

II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific types of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VII below. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as "products." The sales of these products in California dating at least as far back as March 2018, are subject to this Notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to each identified listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposure to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemical. Children, men and women of childbearing age ingest the listed chemical when they transfer the listed chemical from the products to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the products stops. Children, men and women of childbearing age are exposed to the listed chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the products during packing, unpacking and use or otherwise come into contact during use of the products.

Children, men and women of childbearing age will directly ingest the listed chemical anytime they place the soft vinyl of the product in their mouths to hold or otherwise mouth the product.

III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address:

Susan Davia
c/o Sheffer Law Firm
81 Throckmorton Ave., Suite 202
Mill Valley, CA 94941
sheffesq@aol.com, (415) 388-0911

IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator's reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the listed chemical exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7 (b). If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

VI. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

Identified below is a specific example of a product recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that is within the category or type of offending product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the examples within the categories or types of product are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalog by the Violator and other retailers and distributors of the manufacturer.

Product*	Retailer	Manufacturer/Distributor
Cost Plus Gooseneck Kettle	Cost Plus World Market	Cost Plus, Inc. and Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc.

VII. EXHIBIT A

Product Category/Type	Such As*	Toxins
Cost Plus Gooseneck Kettle	Cost Plus Gooseneck Kettle, including, but not limited to, 25494204	Lead and Lead Compounds

*The specifically identified example of the category or type of product that is subject to this Notice is for the recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposure to the listed chemical from other items within the product category/ type listed in Exhibit A. *It is important to note that this example is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product of the type listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A.* Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violator is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Gregory M. Sheffer, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The California sale of the subject products was completed without the communication of any compliant statutory warning regarding the alleged chemical exposure.
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (*i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

Dated: March 12, 2020

Sheffer Law Firm



Gregory M. Sheffer

PROOF OF SERVICE

I am employed in the County of Marin, State of California. I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action. My business address is 81 Throckmorton Avenue, Suite 202, Mill Valley, CA 94941.

On the date indicated below, I served the following documents, described as:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (SERVED ONLY ON THE NOTICED VIOLATORS);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

on each entity or other mandatory recipient listed below by placing a true and correct copy of the foregoing document(s) in a sealed envelope addressed to each interested party as set forth hereafter and depositing each such envelope, with postage thereon fully prepaid, for collection and mailing with the United States Postal Service or agent authorized to accept mail on behalf of the United States Postal Service.

Jonathan E. Schwefel, CEO Cost Plus, Inc. 1201 Marina Village Parkway Alameda, CA 94501	Steven H. Temares, CEO Bed Bath & Beyond Inc. 650 Liberty Avenue Union, New Jersey 07083	
Attorney General of the State of California <i>(see attached list of addresses)</i>	The District Attorney for Each of the 58 counties in California <i>(see attached list of addresses)</i>	The City Attorney for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, San Francisco and Sacramento <i>(see attached list of addresses)</i>

I also caused to be served the same documents on the Attorney General of the State of California by electronically uploading a copy to the California Attorney General’s Website at <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>,

Executed this 12th day of March 2020, at Mill Valley, California. I declare under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Heidi Boissonneau

SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley
Alameda County District Attorney
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650
Oakland, CA 94621
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

The Honorable Terese Drabec
Alpine County District Attorney
270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe
Amador County District Attorney
708 Court Street
Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey
Butte County District Attorney
25 County Center Drive
Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Barbara Yook
Calaveras County District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Road
San Andreas, CA 95249
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

The Honorable John Poyner
Colusa County District Attorney
346 Fifth Street
Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Stacey Grassini, DDA
Contra Costa County District Attorney
c/o Stacey Grassini
sgrassini@contracosta.da.org

The Honorable Dale Trigg
Del Norte County District Attorney
450 H Street, Room 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Vern Pierson
El Dorado County District Attorney
515 Main Street
Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp
Fresno County District Attorney
2220 Tulare Street, #1000
Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable Dwayne Stewart
Glenn County District Attorney
P.O. Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Maggie Fleming
Humboldt County District Attorney
825 5th Street, Fourth Floor
Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero
Imperial County District Attorney
940 West Main Street, Suite 102
El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Thomas Hardy
Inyo County District Attorney
168 North Edwards Street
Independence, CA 93526
invoda@inyocounty.us

The Honorable Lisa Green
Kern County District Attorney
1215 Truxtun Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Keith Fagundas
Kings County District Attorney
1400 West Lacey Boulevard
Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Donald Anderson
Lake County District Attorney
255 North Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

The Honorable Stacey Montgomery
Lassen County District Attorney
c/o Michelle Latimer
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

The Honorable Jackie Lacey
Los Angeles County District Attorney
210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000
Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable David Linn
Madera County District Attorney
209 West Yosemite Avenue
Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Edward Berberian
Marin County District Attorney
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130
San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Thomas Cooke
Mariposa County District Attorney
5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730
Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable C. David Eyster
Mendocino County District Attorney
100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Larry Morse II
Merced County District Attorney
550 W. Main Street
Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Jordan Funk
Modoc County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street, Suite 202
Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable Tim Kendall
Mono County District Attorney
P.O. Box 617
Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo
Monterey County District Attorney
c/o Dije Andreu, Deputy DA
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein
Napa County District Attorney
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

The Honorable Clifford Newell
Nevada County District Attorney
201 Commercial Street
Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas
Orange County District Attorney
401 Civic Center Drive West
Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable R. Scott Owens
Placer County District Attorney
10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240
Roseville, CA 95678

The Honorable David Hollister
Plumas County District Attorney
520 Main Street, Room 404
Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach
Riverside County District Attorney
Prop65@rivcoda.org

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert
Sacramento County District Attorney
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
Prop65@sacda.org

The Honorable Candice Hooper
San Benito County District Attorney
419 4th Street, Second Floor
Hollister, CA 95203

The Honorable Michael Ramos
San Bernardino County District Attorney
303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis
San Diego County District Attorney
c/o Mark Ankcorn, DCA
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

The Honorable Gregory Alker, ADA
San Francisco County District Attorney
gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Honorable Valerie Lopez, DCA
San Francisco, CA 94102
Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatt.org

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar
San Joaquin County District Attorney
DAConsumer.Environmental@sicda.org

The Honorable Eric Dobroth
San Luis Obispo County
Deputy District Attorney
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe
Santa Mateo County District Attorney
400 County Center, Third Floor
Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Joyce Dudley
Santa Barbara County District Attorney
c/o Christopher Dalby, DDA
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

The Honorable Yen Dang DDA
Santa Clara County District Attorney
EPU@da.sccgov.org

The Honorable Jeff Rosell
Santa Cruz County District Attorney
701 Ocean Street, Room 200
Santa Cruz, CA 95060
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

The Honorable Stephen Carlton
Shasta County District Attorney
1355 West Street
Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Lawrence Allen
Sierra County District Attorney
100 Courthouse Square
Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus
Siskiyou County District Attorney
P.O. Box 986
Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable Krishna Abrams
Solano County District Attorney
675 Texas Street, Suite 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Stephan R.
Passalacqua
Sonoma County District Attorney
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

The Honorable Birgit Fladager
Stanislaus County District Attorney
832 12th Street, Suite 300
Modesto, CA 95354

The Honorable Amanda Hopper
Sutter County District Attorney
463 Second Street, Suite 102
Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Gregg Cohen
Tehama County District Attorney
444 Oak Street, Room L
Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable Eric Heryford
Trinity County District Attorney
P.O. Box 310
Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Phillip J. Cline
Tulare County District Attorney
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

The Honorable Laura Krieg
Tuolumne County District Attorney
423 North Washington Street
Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten
Ventura County District Attorney
daspecialops@ventura.org

The Honorable Jeff Reisig
Yolo County District Attorney
cfepd@yolocounty.org

The Honorable Patrick McGrath
Yuba County District Attorney
215 Fifth Street
Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Mike Feuer
Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles
800 City Hall East
200 North Main Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable James Sanchez
Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento
915 I Street, 4th Floor
Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Jan Goldsmith
Office of the City Attorney, San Diego
1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620
San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Dennis Herrera
Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Richard Doyle
Office of the City Attorney, San Jose
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
Via Electronic filing
<https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>