### **Michael Freund & Associates**

1919 Addison Street, Suite 105 Berkeley, CA 94704 Voice: 510.540.1992 • Fax: 510.371.0885

Michael Freund, Esq.

April 2, 2020

# NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 *ET SEQ*. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center, Inc. ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

<u>General Information about Proposition 65</u>. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The names of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory NutraScience Labs, Inc. NutraScience Labs IP Corporation Twinlab Consolidation Corporation Twinlab Corporation Twinlab Consolidated Holdings, Inc.

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- 1. Jacked Factory Hydra Surge Electrolytes Fruit Punch Lead
- 2. Jacked Factory Hydra Surge Electrolytes Orange Mango Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

**Route of Exposure.** The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least April 2, 2017, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time-consuming litigation.

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead or at freund1@aol.com.

Sincerely,

Michael Freund

Michel Freund

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory; NutraScience Labs, Inc.; NutraScience Labs IP Corporation; Twinlab Consolidation Corporation; Twinlab Corporation; Twinlab Consolidated Holdings, Inc.; and their Registered Agents for Service of

Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory; NutraScience Labs, Inc.; NutraScience Labs IP Corporation; Twinlab Consolidation Corporation; Twinlab Corporation; and Twinlab Consolidated Holdings, Inc.

#### I, Michael Freund, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 2, 2020

Michael Freund

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On April 2, 2020, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory 65 White Rose Drive Unit 2 St. John's NL A1A 4A5 Canada

Stewart McKelvey (Registered Agent for Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory) PO Box 5038 1100 Cabot Place St John's NL A1C 6K3

Canada

Current President or CEO Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory 888 Carol Ct Carol Stream, IL 60188

Current President or CEO NutraScience Labs, Inc. 70 Carolyn Blvd Farmingdale, NY 11735

Cogency Global, Inc. (Registered Agent for NutraScience Labs, Inc.) 850 New Burton Rd, Ste 201 Dover, DE 19904

Cogency Global Inc. (Registered Agent for Twinlab Consolidated Holdings, Inc.) 321 W. Winnie Lane, #104 Carson City, NV 89703 Current President or CEO Twinlab Consolidation Corporation 4800 T-Rex Avenue, Ste 305 Boca Raton, FL 33431

Cogency Global, Inc. (Registered Agent for Twinlab Consolidation Corporation) 850 New Burton Rd, Ste 201 Dover, DE 19904

Current President or CEO Twinlab Corporation 4800 T-Rex Avenue, Ste 305 Boca Raton, FL 33431

Kyle Casey (Registered Agent for Twinlab Corporation) 4800 T-Rex Avenue, Ste 305 Boca Raton, FL 33431

Current President or CEO Twinlab Consolidated Holdings, Inc. 4800 T-Rex Avenue, Ste 305 Boca Raton, FL 33431

Kyle Casey (Registered Agent for Twinlab Consolidated Holdings, Inc.) 4800 T-Rex Avenue, Ste 305 Boca Raton, FL 33431

Kyle Casey (Registered Agent for Twinlab Consolidation Corporation) 4800 T-Rex Avenue, Ste 305 Boca Raton, FL 33431

Current President or CEO NutraScience Labs IP Corporation 70 Carolyn Blvd Farmingdale, NY 11735

Cogency Global Inc. (Registered Agent for NutraScience Labs IP Corporation) 850 New Burton Rd, Ste 201 Dover, DE 19904

The Corporation Trust Company (Registered Agent for Nutra Holdings, Inc., Individually and dba Jacked Factory) Corporation Trust Center 1209 N. Orange St Wilmington, DE 19801

Current President or CEO Twinlab Consolidation Corporation 632 Broadway, Ste 201 New York, NY 10012 Corporation Service Company (Registered Agent for Twinlab Corporation) 251 Little Falls Dr Wilmington, DE 19808

Current President or CEO NutraScience Labs IP Corporation 632 Broadway, Ste 201 New York, NY 10012

Current President or CEO NutraScience Labs, Inc. 632 Broadway, Ste 201 New York, NY 10012

Current President or CEO Nutra Holdings, Inc., individually and dba Jacked Factory 311 Crossways Park Drive Woodbury, NY 11797

On April 2, 2020, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1)** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On April 2, 2020, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

Page 6

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator

Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney

Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940

Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney

Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney

Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney

Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney

San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney

San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney

San Joaquin County

222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202

Stockton, CA 95202

DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney

San Luis Obispo County

County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor

San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney

Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney

Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney

Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060

Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney

Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney

Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney

Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney

Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

On April 2, 2020, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on April 2, 2020, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Phyllis Dunwoody

Page 8

## **Service List**

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Del Norte

450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 778 Pacific St Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial 940 West Main Street, Ste 102

El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, San Benito 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor

District Attorney.San Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernadino, CA 92415

Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square, 2nd Floor Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 463 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113