

LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNEY, A Professional Corporation
446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310
Pacifica, California 94044
(650) 219 3187 Phone
brian@gaffneylegal.com

April 21, 2020

Notice of Violations
Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

By Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested to Violators in U.S.A.
By Registered Mail to Violators Located Outside U.S.A.
By First Class U.S. Mail to Public Enforcement Agencies

Dear Public Enforcement Agencies / Violators:

This office and Ecological Rights Foundation (“ERF”) gives you notice that, since at least April 24, 2017 the businesses listed on Attachment A have been, and continue to be, in violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.6. ERF is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to protecting human and environmental health, including raising awareness of, and reducing exposures to, toxic chemicals.

ERF intends to bring an enforcement action 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify the violations discussed in this notice letter. The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this notice of violations are identified on the attached Certificate of Service.

The above referenced violations occur when California residents use filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, including acrylonitrile-butadiene-styrene (ABS) filaments, polycarbonate ABS (PC-ABS) filaments, and high impact polystyrene (HIPS) filaments in the operation of 3d printers or 3d pens. These filaments, used in the operation of 3d printers or 3d pens, expose people to styrene, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. Filaments sold by the businesses listed on Attachment A expose consumers and workers to styrene via inhalation.

Examples of particular products manufactured, sold, distributed and/or marketed by the violators are attached as Attachment B. All of the filaments at issue in this notice can be used with 3d printers or 3d pens. When people use filaments incorporating a styrene monomer with 3d printers or 3d pens, the filaments are heated by the 3D printers or 3d pens and thus release styrene into

the air. People using the filaments incorporating a styrene monomer with 3d printers or 3d pens, and others in the same room where such filaments are being used, inhale styrene in the normal course of use.

In addition, exposures in the environmental context occur in the homes, businesses, schools and public locations where the people use filaments incorporating a styrene monomer with 3d printers or 3d pens. Exposures to styrene occur within the consumer and environmental contexts.

The businesses listed on Attachment A did not and do not provide clear and reasonable warnings to people who use filaments incorporating a styrene monomer, that use of these products in 3d printers or 3d pens will expose them to chemicals known to cause cancer. The above violations have occurred every day since at least April 24, 2017, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are given.

Attachment B is a non-exclusive list of examples of these types of products. Though specific models or product numbers are given as examples, this Notice also pertains to all models and all variations of filaments incorporating a styrene monomer sold in California. Attachment B is for the recipient's benefit and is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product. It is ERF's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other specific products within the identified category or type that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the past three years, to ensure that clear and reasonable warnings are provided to California citizens prior to purchase, or retroactively if necessary.

These violations and threatened violations will continue to occur everyday until these businesses either provide clear and reasonable warnings, reformulate their filaments so as not to contain styrene, or stop selling these filaments in California. These violations occur in all of California's 58 counties, both on and off of these businesses' properties.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to expeditiously rectify these ongoing violations of California law, ERF is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

The following individual is the responsible individual within ERF for purposes of this Notice:

Fredric Evenson
Ecological Rights Foundation
P.O. Box 1000
Santa Cruz, California 95061
Telephone: (831) 454-8216
Email: evenson@ecologylaw.com

ERF has retained the following counsel to represent it in this matter. **Please direct communications to counsel.**

Brian Gaffney
LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNEY APC
446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310
Pacifica, California 94044
(650) 219 3187
brian@gaffneylegal.com

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

ERF is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that advances the public interest without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. ERF is willing to settle this matter to the extent legally possible prior to the commencement of any enforcement action. Settlement terms would require that the unwarned exposures described in this Notice of Violation be stopped. That would require at least the following: 1) a potential recall of products already sold; 2) that either warnings be given to all future purchasers in California of the products subject to this Notice, that the products be reformulated to eliminate the exposures described in the Notice, or that you stop marketing, distributing or selling the products in California; 3) that you locate and provide a warning compliant with 27 Cal. Code Regs Section 25601 to each person who has been subject to the unwarned exposures described in the Notice to the extent those exposures are caused by products that were sold in California during the past three years; and 4) that you pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249(b). It should be noted that ERF cannot finalize any settlement of this matter until 70 days have elapsed since the sending of the Notice and unless no public enforcer has begun an enforcement action concerning the violations described in the Notice. Any settlement on behalf of the public interest must be approved by the California Superior Court on noticed motion with 45 days' notice to the California Attorney General. The Attorney General may appear at any approval hearing and oppose a settlement if he or she believes the proposed settlement is not in the public interest. If you wish to discuss settlement of this matter before ERF files suit, please promptly contact ERF's counsel.

Sincerely,

/S/Brian Gaffney
Brian Gaffney

Enclosure to Violators "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986: A Summary." A Certificate of Merit is also attached.

Certificate of Merit - Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Brian Gaffney, hereby declare:

(1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

(2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.

(3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

(4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

(5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Date: April 21, 2020

By:

/S/Brian Gaffney
Brian Gaffney

Attachment A – Violators – FILAMENTS

Staples, Inc.

ATTACHMENT B**FILAMENTS**

<u>Proposition 65 Violator</u>	<u>Products Manufactured, Sold, Distributed and/or Marketed</u>
Staples, Inc.	MONOPRICE PREMIUM 3D PRINTER FILAMENT ABS 1.75MM, 1KG WHITE ITEM# 10546 UPC: 757901 803796
Staples, Inc.	Robox Smart Reel ABS Hot Pink; ITEM#1590421; Model #: RBX-ABS-RD535
Staples, Inc.	Green Project 3-D ABS-1.75NT Nature; ITEM# 1M17U0578; Model: 3D-ABS-1.75NT

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Brian Gaffney, declare:

If so called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310, Pacifica, CA 94044.

On April 21, 2020, I caused the attached

(1) Notice of Violations: California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, (2) Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), (3) Appendix A: The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary, (4) Certificate of Service to be served by CERTIFIED MAIL to each private business entity listed on the attached SERVICE LIST-Noticed Parties, except for each private business located outside of the U.S.A. which are served by REGISTERED MAIL. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected.

In addition, on the same date and I caused the attached

(1) Notice of Violations: California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, (2) Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), (3) Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy): Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the Certificate of Merit (only sent to the Attorney General), (4) Certificate of Service by FIRST CLASS U.S. MAIL on those public enforcement agencies listed on the attached SERVICE LIST-Public Enforcers. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected, and

by sending portable document format (PDF) files of the same to the electronic mail addresses to each of the public prosecutors identified by the California Attorney General as having authorized electronic service of notices. These public enforcement agencies appear on the attached Service List with their electronic mail addresses.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on April 21, 2020, at Pacifica, California.

/S/Brian Gaffney
Brian Gaffney

Service List – Noticed Violators

Staples, Inc.
c/o CT Corporation System
818 West Seventh Street, Suite 930
Los Angeles, CA 90017

Staples, Inc.
ATTN: President / CEO
500 Staples Drive
Framingham, MA 01702

Service List - Public Enforcers

Office of the District Attorney Alameda County CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Office of the District Attorney Lassen County mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Office of the District Attorney San Benito County 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023	Office of the District Attorney Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080
Office of the District Attorney Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Office of the District Attorney Los Angeles County 211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	Office of the District Attorney San Bernardino County 303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415	Office of the District Attorney Trinity County P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Office of the District Attorney Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642	Office of the District Attorney Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	Office of the District Attorney San Diego County CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov	Office of the District Attorney Tulare County Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Office of the District Attorney Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965	Office of the District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	Office of the District Attorney San Francisco County gregory.aliker@sfgov.org	Office of the District Attorney Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
Office of the District Attorney Calaveras County Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Office of the District Attorney Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	Office of the District Attorney San Joaquin County DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Office of the District Attorney Ventura County daspecialops@ventura.org
Office of the District Attorney Colusa County 346 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Office of the District Attorney Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	Office of the District Attorney San Luis Obispo County edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Office of the District Attorney Yolo County cfepd@yolocounty.org
Office of the District Attorney Contra Costa County sgrassini@contracostada.org	Office of the District Attorney Merced County 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340	Office of the District Attorney San Mateo County 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	Office of the District Attorney Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901
Office of the District Attorney Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	Office of the District Attorney Modoc County 204 S. Court Street Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101	Office of the District Attorney Santa Barbara County DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	Oakland City Attorney City Hall, 6th Floor 1 Frank Ogawa Plaza Oakland, California 94612
Office of the District Attorney El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667	Office of the District Attorney Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	Office of the District Attorney Santa Clara County EPU@da.sccgov.org	Office of the City Attorney City of San Francisco City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Pl. San Francisco, CA 94102
Office of the District Attorney Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	Office of the District Attorney Monterey County Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	Office of the District Attorney Santa Cruz County Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Office of the City Attorney City of Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814
Office of the District Attorney Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	Office of the District Attorney Napa County CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Office of the District Attorney Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	Office of the City Attorney City of San Jose 200 E. Santa Clara St. San Jose, CA 95113
Office of the District Attorney Humboldt County 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501	Office of the District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	Office of the District Attorney Sierra County P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936	Office of the City Attorney City of Los Angeles 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012
Office of the District Attorney Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	Office of the District Attorney Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	Office of the District Attorney Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	Office of the City Attorney City of San Diego 1200 Third Ave., Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101
Office of the District Attorney Inyo County inyoda@inyocounty.us	Office of the District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678	Office of the District Attorney Solano County 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting Attn: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612
Office of the District Attorney Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	Office of the District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	Office of the District Attorney Sonoma County jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	
Office of the District Attorney Kings County 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230	Office of the District Attorney Riverside County Prop65@rivcoda.org	Office of the District Attorney Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
Office of the District Attorney Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	Office of the District Attorney Sacramento County Prop65@sacda.org	Office of the District Attorney Sutter County 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991	