

# AMENDED 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH  
*Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.*  
("Proposition 65")

---

**DATE:** May 18, 2020

**TO:** John W. Howard, CEO — Grant Howard Associates, LLC  
George M. Dima, Vice President — Grant Howard Associates, LLC  
Michael Dima, Registered Agent for Grant Howard Associates, LLC  
President/CEO — Walmart, Inc.  
Member/Manager — Walmart, Inc.  
Amazon.com, Inc.  
California Attorney General's Office  
District Attorney's Office for All California Counties; and  
City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

**FROM:** Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC

---

## I. INTRODUCTION

---

**Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC** ("PHSA") is the noticing entity, acting in the interest of the general public. It seeks to reduce or eliminate the presence of hazardous substances in consumer products sold in California, and to ensure that California consumers are aware of the presence of such substances in consumer goods so that they can make an educated effort to limit their own exposure where deemed necessary.

This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the violators: Grant Howard Associates, LLC, Walmart, Inc., Amazon.com, Inc. (the "Violators"). The violations covered by this Notice consists of a summary of Proposition 65, Statement of Violation, Number and Duration of Violation, Product Category/Type, Listed Chemical(s), Preservation of Evidence, Product Exposure, Routes of Exposure and type of harm resulting from exposure to the chemicals ("Listed Chemicals") as follows:

Product Exposure:	See Section VI. and VII. Exhibit A
Listed Chemical:	Lead
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion and Dermal Absorption
Type of Harm:	Cancer, Birth Defect and other Reproductive Harm

---

## II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – SUMMARY

---

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementation regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipients. For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

---

## III. STATEMENT OF VIOLATIONS

---

The specific type of product that is causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that is covered by this Notice, is listed under "Product Category/Type" in section VI. and the specific toxicant(s)/Listed Chemical(s) is set forth in Exhibit A of Section VII. All products within the category covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "Covered Product(s)" or "Product(s)". Exposures to the Listed Chemical from the use of the Products have been

occurring without the “clear and reasonable warning” required by Proposition 65. The method of the warning should be a label on the product itself. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Products.

The Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to the Listed Chemical(s), a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipients failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Listed Product expose consumers to Listed Chemical(s).

---

#### **IV. NUMBER AND DURATION OF VIOLATIONS**

---

Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipients and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least May 18, 2019, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California. These violations will continue until “clear and reasonable warning” are provided prior to exposure of the Listed Chemicals.

---

#### **V. ROUTE OF EXPOSURE**

---

California consumers and other individuals, through the act of using and consuming the Covered Product, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical by eating the Covered Product, or when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products.

By way of example but not limitation, exposures occur when California Citizens use as an ingredient, eat, sample or otherwise ingest the product. These acts cause consumers and other individuals to be exposed to the Listed Chemical through the routine consumption of all or a portion of the product containing the Listed Chemical. People likely to be exposed include both children and adult including women of childbearing age.

---

#### **VI. PRODUCT CATEGORY/TYPE**

---

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the “Exemplar Product”). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product is also provided.


The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipients’ benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific type or category of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the PHSA’s position that the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipients’ custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

<b>Exemplar Product</b>	<b>Chain of Commerce</b>	
	<b>Wholesaler(s); Retailer(s)</b>	<b>Manufacturer(s); Importer(s); Distributor(s)</b>
GRANT HOWARD Rooster Oil Dispenser – Ref # 609087-50634 UPC: ASIN: B00R9VQ9AI	Amazon.com; Walmart, Inc.	Grant Howard Associates, LLC

---

**VII. EXHIBIT A – LISTED CHEMICAL**

---

<b><u>Product Category / Type</u></b>	<b><u>Picture</u></b>	<b><u>Toxicant(s)</u></b>
Kitchenware		Lead

---

**VIII. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS**

---

Consistent with goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these violations corrected, PHSA is interested in seeking a resolution of this matter that includes a binding written agreement by the Violators to: (1) recall any products already sold, or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provide to those who have received such products; (2) reformulate the Covered Product so as to eliminate further exposures to the Covered Chemical(s), or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposure to the Covered chemical(s), as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation. It should be noted that counsel cannot (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who has received this notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with PHSA will resolve its claims; such an agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Proposition 65 requires that notice of intent to sue be given to the violators(s) sixty (60) days before the suit is filed. *Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1)*. With this letter, PHSA gives notice of the alleged violations to Violator and the appropriate governmental authorities. In absence of any action by the appropriate governmental authorities within sixty (60) calendar days of the sending of this notice PHSA may file suit. *See Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 1013; Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1)*; and *Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27 § 25903(d)(1)*. Per *Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 25600.2(g)* (2018) the retail seller noticed on this 60 Day Notice is hereby requested to promptly provide the names and contact information for the manufacture(s), producer(s), packager(s), importer(s), supplier(s), and/or distributor(s) of the Listed Products in this Notice.

Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC remains open and willing to discuss the possibilities of resolving its grievance short of formal litigation.

---

**IX. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE**

---

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic document and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence of the Listed Chemicals in the Covered Product; purchase and sales information for Covered Products (i.e. list of purchasers and quantity sold; list of manufacturer(s), producer(s), packager(s), importer(s), supplier(s), and/or distributor(s) and quantity in each transaction, as well as current inventory of the Covered Product in stock); efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as May 18, 2018 through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

---

**X. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

---

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.6 and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by section 3102 attached hereto.

---

**XI. CONTACT INFORMATION**


---

Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC has retained the Law Offices of Danialpour & Associates as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

David Davar Danialpour, Esq.  
Danialpour & Associates  
357 S. Robertson Blvd. 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
Beverly Hills, CA 90211  
Telephone: (310) 444-0055  
Facsimile: (310) 444-0066  
Email: david@davarlaw.com

Sincerely,

Dated: May 18, 2020

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
David Davar Danialpour, Esq.  
Danialpour & Associates  
Attorneys for  
Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC

**Attachments:**

Certificate of Merit;  
Certificate of Service;  
The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary;  
Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Only)

//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Davar Danialpour, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the Listed Chemical that is the subject of this action;
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (*i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

Dated: May 18, 2020

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Davar Danialpour