

# SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)

---

**DATE:** June 5, 2020

**To:** Joe Adachi, Chief Executive Officer – Canon U.S.A., Inc.  
Mike Mohan, President – Best Buy Co., Inc.  
Gerry P. Smith, CEO – Office Depot, Inc.  
Herman Schreiber, CEO – B & H Foto & Electronics Corp.  
California Attorney General's Office;  
District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and  
City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

**FROM:** Laurence Vinocur

---

## I. INTRODUCTION

---

My name is Laurence Vinocur. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the alleged violators, Canon U.S.A., Inc., Best Buy Co., Inc., B & H Foto & Electronics Corp. and Office Depot, Inc. (the "Violators") and supplements the 60-Day Notice of Violation sent on July 23, 2019 and February 11, 2020. The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposure, routes of exposure and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("Listed Chemical") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure: See Section VII. Exhibit A  
Listed Chemical: Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP")  
Routes of Exposure: Ingestion, Dermal  
Types of Harm: Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

---

## II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

---

The specific type of product that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VII. All products within the category covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "Products." Exposures to the Listed Chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the "clear and reasonable warning" required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as June 5, 2017. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Products.

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. By way of example, consumers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age, ingest the Listed Chemical when they, among other activities, touch the Products and transfer the Listed Chemical from the Products to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Products stops. Additionally, consumers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age, are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle, touch or otherwise use the Products. The California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

---

### **III. CONTACT INFORMATION**

---

Please direct all questions concerning this Notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address:

Laurence Vinocur  
c/o Clifford A. Chanler  
The Chanler Group  
91 East Blithedale Avenue  
Mill Valley, CA 94941  
Telephone: (510) 647-8009

---

### **IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION**

---

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violators' reference, I have attached a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

---

### **V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS**

---

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violators unless such Violators enter into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to

those who have received such Products; (2) provide “clear and reasonable warnings” for Products sold in the future or reformulate such Products to eliminate the DEHP exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). If the alleged Violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and costly litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any district or city attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

---

## VI. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

---

Identified below are specific examples of Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that are within the category or type of offending Product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the examples within the category or type of Products are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending Products has also occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 “clear and reasonable warning” at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalog by the Violators and other distributors and retailers of the manufacturer.

<i>Product*</i>	<i>Retailer(s)</i>	<i>Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)</i>
Canon Digital Gadget Bag 200DG, #9320A003AA, UPC #7 50845 81884 0	Best Buy Co., Inc. Sacramento County, California	Canon U.S.A., Inc.
Canon Digital Gadget Bag 200DG, #9320A003AA, UPC #7 50845 81884 0	Best Buy Co., Inc. Placer County, California	Canon U.S.A., Inc.
Canon Digital Gadget Bag 200DG, #9320A003AA, UPC #7 50845 81884 0	B & H Foto & Electronics Corp. ( <a href="http://www.bhphotovideo.com">http://www.bhphotovideo.com</a> )	Canon U.S.A., Inc.
Canon Custom Gadget Bag 100EG, #6227A001AA, UPC#0 82966 80595 0	Office Depot, Inc. ( <a href="http://www.officedepot.com">http://www.officedepot.com</a> )	Canon U.S.A., Inc.

---

**VII. EXHIBIT A**

---

<i>Product Category/Type</i>	<i>Such As*</i>	<i>Toxicant(s)</i>
Gadget Bags with Shoulder Straps and/or Other Accessible Vinyl Components	Canon Digital Gadget Bag 200DG, #9320A003AA, UPC #7 50845 81884 0  Canon Custom Gadget Bag 100EG, #6227A001AA, UPC#0 82966 80595 0	Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate

\*The specifically identified examples of the Products that are subject to this Notice are for the recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the product category/type listed in Exhibit A. It is important to note that these examples are not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product of the type listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A. Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific Products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipients' custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

# PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 72 Huckleberry Hill Road, New Canaan, CT 06840.

On June 5, 2020, I caused to be served the following documents:

**SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);**

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**

**THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY**

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Joe Adachi, Chief Executive Officer  
Canon U.S.A., Inc.  
1 Canon Park  
Melville, NY 11747

Mike Mohan, President  
Best Buy Co., Inc.  
7601 Penn Avenue South  
Richfield, MN 55423

Gerry P. Smith, CEO  
Office Depot, Inc.  
6600 North Military Trail  
Boca Raton, FL 33496

Herman Schreiber, CEO  
B & H Foto & Electronics Corp.  
420 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
New York, NY 10001-1603

On June 5, 2020, I caused to be served the following documents:

**SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND**

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Email Service List".

On June 5, 2020, I caused to be served the following documents:


**SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);**

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".


Executed on June 5, 2020, in New Canaan, Connecticut.

  
Lorent Guimaraes



6/4/2020


https\_\_\_shop.usa.canon.com\_shop\_SearchDisplay\_categoryId=&storeId=10051&catalogId=10051&langId=-1&s

[SIGN IN / REGISTER](#)1-800-385-2155

[SHOP](#) [SALE](#) [INK/TONER FINDER](#) [SUPPORT](#)

[Need Help?](#)



 A COVID-19 Update from Canon USA

We are continuing to thoroughly follow the developments and directives associated with COVID-19 (coronavirus). [Learn more](#) about the measures we have in place.

[HOME](#) \ [SEARCH GADGET BAG](#)



**CATEGORY**


CAMERAS (69)


EOS INTERCHANGEABLE LENS CAMERAS (58)

No further refinement

**SEARCH RESULTS FOR "GADGET BAG" (85 MATCHES.)**

RECOMMENDED  Items Per Page **18** 


1 2 3 4 5 






[Compare](#)

**Gadget Bag 2400**

**\$52.00**  
~~\$65.00~~

In Stock 


 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Gadget Bag 300DG**

**\$50.00**

In Stock 


 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Deluxe Gadget Bag 10EG**

**\$104.00**  
~~\$130.00~~

In Stock 

 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Professional Gadget Bag 1EG**

**\$120.00**  
~~\$150.00~~

Out of Stock


 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Custom Gadget Bag 100EG**

**\$40.00**  
~~\$50.00~~

In Stock 


 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Digital Gadget Bag 100DG**

**\$79.99**  
~~\$99.99~~

In Stock 

 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Digital Gadget Bag 200DG**

**\$80.00**  
~~\$100.00~~

Out of Stock


 Available Offer 






[Compare](#)

**Refurbished Rebel Gadget Bag**

**\$80.00**

In Stock 

 Available Offer 

 **CHAT**

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Clifford A. Chanler, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the *alleged* exposure to the Listed Chemical that is the subject of this action;
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate under Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) including (i) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (ii) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 5, 2020



---

Clifford A. Chanler

# EMAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Michael Atwell  
Alpine County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120  
daoffice@alpinecountyca.gov

The Honorable Todd Riebe  
Amador County District Attorney  
708 Court Street  
Jackson, CA 95642  
amadorda@amadorgov.org

The Honorable Michael Ramsey  
Butte County District Attorney  
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245  
Oroville, CA 95965  
DA@ButteCounty.net

The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp  
Colusa County District Attorney  
346 Fifth Street, Suite 101  
Colusa, CA 95932  
clerkinfo@countyofcolusa.com

The Honorable David Hollister  
Plumas County District Attorney  
520 Main Street, Room 404  
Quincy, CA 95971  
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp  
Fresno County District Attorney  
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000  
Fresno, CA 93721  
damail@fresnocountyca.gov

The Honorable Maggie Fleming  
Humboldt County District Attorney  
825 5th Street, Fourth Floor  
Eureka, CA 95501  
districtattorney@co.humboldt.ca.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney  
Alameda County  
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650  
Oakland, CA 94621  
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney  
Napa County  
931 Parkway Mall  
Napa, CA 94559  
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

The Honorable Phillip J. Cline  
Tulare County District Attorney  
221 South Mooney Boulevard  
Visalia, CA 93291-4593  
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar  
San Joaquin County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 990  
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202  
Stockton, CA 95201  
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

The Honorable Clifford Newell  
Nevada County District Attorney  
201 Commercial Street  
Nevada City, CA 95959  
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

The Honorable Donna Daly  
Trinity County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 310  
11 Court Street  
Weaverville, CA 96093  
trinityjournal@dcacable.net

The Honorable Jackie Lacey  
Los Angeles County District Attorney  
211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200  
Los Angeles, CA 90012  
info@da.lacounty.gov

The Honorable Sally O. Moreno  
Madera County District Attorney  
209 West Yosemite Avenue  
Madera, CA 93637  
CountyClerkInfo@Madera-County.com

The Honorable Thomas Hardy  
Inyo County District Attorney  
P.O. Box Drawer D  
Independence, CA 93526  
inyoda@inyocounty.us

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco  
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatt.org

The Honorable C. David Eyster  
Mendocino County District Attorney  
100 North State Street, Room G-10  
P.O. Box 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482  
enviroh@mendocinocounty.org

The Honorable Kimberly Lewis  
Merced County District Attorney  
550 West Main Street  
Merced, CA 95340  
Dainfo@co.merced.ca.us

The Honorable Samuel D. Kylo  
Modoc County District Attorney  
204 South Court Street, Suite 202  
Alturas, CA 96101  
da@co.modoc.ca.us

The Honorable Tim Kendall  
Mono County District Attorney  
278 Main Street  
P.O. Box 617  
Bridgeport, CA 93517  
districtattorney@mono.ca.gov

The Honorable Jeannine M. Pacioni  
Monterey County District Attorney  
1200 Aguajito Road  
Monterey, CA 93940  
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

The Honorable Jill R. Ravitch  
Sonoma County District Attorney  
600 Administration Drive  
Sonoma, CA 95403  
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney, San Diego  
1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620  
San Diego, CA 92101  
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney  
Yolo County  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
cfejd@yolocounty.org

The Honorable Jason Anderson  
San Bernardino County District Attorney  
303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor  
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502  
da@sbcdca.org

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney  
San Francisco County  
732 Brannan Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
gregory.alker@sfgov.org

The Honorable Laura L. Krieg  
Tuolumne County District Attorney  
423 North Washington Street  
Sonora, CA 95370  
da@tuolumnecounty.ca.gov

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney  
Contra Costa County  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553  
sgrassini@contracostada.org

The Honorable Susan J. Kronen  
Lake County District Attorney  
255 North Forbes Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453  
Don.Anderson@lakecountyca.gov

The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell  
Santa Cruz County District Attorney  
701 Ocean Street, Room 200  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060  
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

The Honorable Summer Stephan  
San Diego County District Attorney  
330 West Broadway Street  
San Diego, CA 92101  
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcdca.org

The Honorable Sandra Groven  
Sierra County District Attorney  
100 Courthouse Square, Room B1  
P.O. Box 457  
Downieville, CA 95936  
sgroven@sierracounty.ca.gov

The Honorable Walter Wall  
Mariposa County District Attorney  
5101 Jones Street  
P.O. Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95338  
mcda@mariposacounty.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney  
Santa Barbara County  
1112 Santa Barbara St.  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

The Honorable Barbara Yook  
Calaveras County District Attorney  
891 Mountain Ranch Rd.  
San Andreas, CA 95249  
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney  
Riverside County  
3072 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92501  
Prop65@rivcoda.org

The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer  
Kern County District Attorney  
1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor  
Bakersfield, CA 93301  
caomailbox@kerncounty.com

The Honorable Gregory D. Totten  
Ventura County District Attorney  
800 South Victoria Avenue, Suite 314  
Ventura, CA 93009  
daspecialops@ventura.org

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert  
Sacramento County District Attorney  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Prop65@sacda.org

The Honorable R. Scott Owens  
Placer County District Attorney  
10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240  
Roseville, CA 95678  
infopcd@placer.ca.gov

The Honorable Richard Doyle  
Office of the City Attorney, San Jose  
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor  
San Jose, CA 95113  
cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus  
Siskiyou County District Attorney  
311 4th Street  
Yreka, CA 96097  
da@siskiyouda.org

The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams  
Solano County District Attorney  
675 Texas Street, Suite 4500  
Fairfield, CA 94533  
SolanoDA@solanocounty.com

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney  
Santa Clara County  
70 West Hedding Street  
San Jose, CA 95110  
EPU@da.sccgov.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney  
San Luis Obispo County  
County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408  
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Michelle Latimar  
Lassen County Program Coordinator  
220 S. Lassen Street  
Susanville, CA 96130  
mlatimar@co.lassen.ca.us



# **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General  
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting  
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator  
P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
<https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>