60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d) (PROPOSITION 65)

Date: July 6, 2020

 To: Damiano Petruccelli, Chief Executive Officer, P.S. Pibbs, Inc. California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento & Los Angeles
From: Center for Advanced Public Awareness

I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

Center for Advanced Public Awareness ("CAPA") is a non-profit organization in the State of California acting in the interest of the general public, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d). CAPA seeks to further: the elimination of toxic chemicals in the manufacture of products; the improvement of human health through increased public awareness of toxic chemicals; and the promotion of environmentally sound practices and corporate responsibility.

This 60-Day Notice of Violation ("**Notice**") is being provided to the alleged violator, P.S. Pibbs, Inc. ("**Notice Recipient**"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Offices for 58 Counties, and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles.

CAPA provides this Notice after identifying violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 *et seq.* ("**Proposition 65**"), based on the failure to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the products, listed below, in the State of California. The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice that it violated and continues to violate Proposition 65 with respect to the warning requirement, codified at California's Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, which states, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving a clear and reasonable warning to such individual." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to listed chemicals, citizens in California lack the information necessary to make an informed decision as to whether or how to eliminate or reduce their risk of exposure from the reasonably foreseeable use of products containing listed chemicals.

II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

Consumer Product. The specific type or category of products ("**Products**") that are the subject of this Notice are as follows:

Exemplar Product	Category/Type	Retailer	Manufacturer/ Distributor
Child Sofa Seat-Black Item No. 600BL	Seats with Vinyl Upholstery	SalonEquipment.Com	P.S. Pibbs, Inc.

Identified above is a specific example of Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for sale or use in the State of California, within the *category* of offending products covered by this Notice. The identified retailers, manufacturers and/or distributors of the Products are based on publicly available information.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation into the alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice. The specific identified Exemplar Product is not intended to be an exhaustive list of all such products potentially in violation of Proposition 65. It is CAPA's position the Notice Recipient is obligated to conduct, in good faith, an investigation into other products, within the category or of the type identified that may have been manufactured, imported, sold or distributed for sale, or in the Notice Recipient's custody or control during the relevant period identified below, to ensure the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to individuals in California prior to purchase.

Listed Chemical. The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("**DEHP**"). The State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause cancer on January 1, 1988 and as a chemical known to cause developmental and male reproductive toxicity on October 24, 2003.

Routes of Exposure. The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition and handling of Products containing DEHP. Exposures occur when individuals, including children and women of childbearing age, handle, touch or otherwise utilize Seats with Vinyl Upholstery containing DEHP in accordance with the Products' intended uses, resulting in exposures through ingestion and dermal absorption. Individuals ingest DEHP when they touch or handle the Products, transferring the chemical from their fingers or hands to their mouths. Dermal absorption of DEHP occurs when individuals handle, touch, or utilize the Products in accordance with their intended uses.

<u>Violations and Time Period of Exposure.</u> CAPA alleges the Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose, individuals within the State of California to DEHP, without first providing information about the chemical's toxic effects, as required by Proposition 65, by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings to consumers and users that the Products can expose users to DEHP.

Exposures caused by the use of the Products have occurred each day since the Products were introduced into the California marketplace, but, at a minimum, since July 6, 2019, and, potentially, as far back as July 6, 2017. Because the Products lack clear and reasonable warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to DEHP, each Product sold during this period and not accompanied by a warning constitutes a violation by the Notice Recipient and/or other sellers of the Products, whether sold directly through retailers located in, or with locations in, California, via the internet, or through catalog purchases by customers and individuals located in California. Moreover, these exposures are ongoing and will continue either until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to protect consumers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products or reduced to allowable levels.

III. <u>RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS</u>

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, CAPA seeks to pursue a constructive resolution of this matter to quickly rectify ongoing violations of California law. To that end, based on the allegations set forth in this Notice and pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), CAPA intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice, unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these allegations. If the Notice Recipient seeks to resolve the claims alleged in this Notice without litigation, it may contact CAPA's counsel at the address listed below.

It should be noted neither CAPA nor its counsel can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the expiration of the 60-day Notice period; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City attorney in receipt of this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CAPA will satisfy CAPA's claims, the agreement may not satisfy any public prosecutors.

IV. GENERAL INFORMATION AND SUMMARY OF PROPOSITION 65

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65's provisions, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("**OEHHA**") is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient for its reference. For further general information concerning Proposition 65, contact OEHHA's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

V. <u>CERTIFICATE OF MERIT</u>

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A copy of the Notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the California Attorney General and marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation, as required by Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3102, attached thereto.

VI. <u>CONTACT INFORMATION</u>

Please direct all questions, issues or communications regarding this 60-Day Notice of Violation and its potential resolution to CAPA's counsel at the following address:

Center for Advanced Public Awareness c/o Laralei S. Paras, Esq. Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247

<u>Attachments:</u> Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (to Violator only); and Additional Confidential Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only.)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

Re: CAPA's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

I, Laralei S. Paras, hereby declare and certify:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e. the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies and data reviewed by that person.)

Dated: July 6, 2020

Laralei S. Paras

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years of age and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94111.

On July 6, 2020, I caused to be served the following:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY; and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX by **Certified First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Damiano Petruccelli, CEO P.S. Pibbs, Inc. 13315 32nd Avenue Flushing, NY 11354

On July 6, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX by **First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Representative, with correct postage.

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by sending copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the Recipient listed on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On July 6, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by uploading the documents, addressed to California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on the 6th day of July, 2020, at San Francisco, California.

Laralei S. Paras

SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Michael Atwell	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Todd Riebe
Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	Amador County District Attorney
P.O. Box 248	211 West Temple Street, Ste 1200	708 Court Street, #202
Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA, 90012	Jackson, CA 95642
The Honorable Michael Ramsey	The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp	Del Norte County District Attorney
Butte County District Attorney	Colusa County District Attorney	450 H street, Room 171
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	346 5th Street, Suite 101	Crescent City, CA 95531
Oroville, CA 95965	Colusa, CA 95932	
The Honorable Vern Pierson	The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp	The Honorable Dwayne Stewart
El Dorado County District Attorney	Fresno County District Attorney	Glenn County District Attorney
515 Main Street	2220 Tulare street, Suite 1000	P.O. Box 430
Placerville, CA 95667	Fresno, CA 93721	Willows CA 95988
The Honorable Maggie Fleming	onorable Gilbert Otero	The Honorable Lisa Green
Humboldt County District Attorney	Imperial County District Attorney	Kern County District Attorney
525 5 th Street, 4 th Floor	940 West Main Street, Suite 102	1215 Truxtun Avenue
Eureka, CA 95501	El Centro, CA 92243	Bakersfield, CA 93301
The Honorable Keith Fagundes	The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable David Linn
Kings County District Attorney 1400	Lake County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney
West Lacey Blvd.	255 N. Forbes Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue
Hanford, CA 93230	Lakeport, CA 95453	Madera, CA 93637
The Honorable Edward Berberian	The Honorable Jordan Funk	The Honorable C. David Eyster
Marin County District Attorney	Modoc County District Attorney	Mendocino County District
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	204 S. Court Street Room 202	Attorney
San Rafael, CA 94903	Alturas, CA 96101	P.O. Box 1000
,	,	Ukiah, CA 9548
The Honorable Larry Morse II	The Honorable Tony Rackaukas	The Honorable Tim Kendall
Merced County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney
550 West Main Street	401 Civic Center Drive West	P.O. Box 2053
Merced, CA 95340	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Richard Doyle	The Honorable Candace Hooper	The Honorable Gregg Cohen
Office of the City Attorney, San Jose	San Benito District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 th Floor	419 4th Street	P.O. Box 519
San Jose, CA 95113	Hollister, CA 95023	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett
San Mateo County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
400 County Center, Third Floor	303 W. Third Street	1355 West Street
Redwood City, CA 94063	San Bernardino, CA 92415	Redding, CA 96001
The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	The Honorable Mike Feuer	The Honorable Amanda Hopper
Siskiyou County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles	Sutter County District Attorney
P.O. Box 986	Kames K. Hahn Hall East	446 Second Street, Suite 102
Redding, CA 96097	200 North Main Street, 8 th Floor	Yuba City, CA 95991
1000011, 011 90097	Los Angeles, CA 90012	1 aou Oity, 011 70771
The Honorable James Sanchez	The Honorable Krishna Abrams	The Honorable Birgit Fladager
Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento		Stanislaus County District Attorney
915 I Street, 4 th Floor	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	832 12th street, Suite 300
Sacramento, CA 95814	Fairfield, CA 94533	Modesto, CA 95353
The Honorable Laura Krieg	The Honorable Patrick McGrath	The Honorable Eric Heryford
Tuolumne County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
423 N. Washington Street	215 Fifth street, Suite 152	P.O. Box 310
Sonora, CA 95370	Marysville, CA 95901	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Lawrence Allen	wa yovine, CA 75701	11 caver ville, CA 20023
Sierra County District Attorney		
100 Courthouse Square		
Downieville, CA 95936		

ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salzar, District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni
Alameda County District Attorney	San Joaquin County	Deputy District Attorney
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	Monterey County
Oakland, CA 94621	Stockton, CA 95202	1200 Aguajito Road
CEPDProp65@acgiv.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Monterey, CA 93940
		Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney	Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
Napa County	Santa Cruz County	San Diego County
931 Parkway Mall	701 Ocean Street	300 West Broadway
Napa, CA 94559	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
Gregory Alker, Assistant District Atty	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
San Francisco County	Yolo County	City of San Diego
732 Brannan Street	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94103	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
gregory.alker@sfgov.org	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Lassen County	Attorney
Santa Clara County	220 S. Lassen Street	Santa Barbara County
70 W Hedding Street	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara Street
San Jose, CA 95110	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
EPU@da.sccgov.org	matmer@co.iassen.ea.us	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
Ventura County	Calaveras County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
800 S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7 th Floor
Ventura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
daspecialops@ventura.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org
Stacey Grassini	Eric J. Dobroth	Anne Marie Schubert
Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	District Attorney
Contra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Sacramento County
900 Ward Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4 th Floor	901 G Street
Martinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Sacramento, CA 95814
sgrassini@contracostada.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Prop65@sacda.org
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney	The Honorable Clifford Newell
Inyo County District Attorney	Tulare County	Nevada County District Attorney
168 N. Edwards Street	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street
Independence, CA 93526	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Stephan Passalacqua, District Attorney	The Honorable David Hollister
Riverside County	Sonoma County	Plumas County District Attorney
3072 Orange Street	600 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room 404
Riverside, CA 92501	Sonoma, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
Prop65@rivcoda.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
The Honorable Walter W. Wall	Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney	
Mariposa County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	
P.O. Box 730	10810 Justice Center Drive	
Mariposa, CA 95338	Roseville, CA 95678	
mcda@mariposacounty.org	prop65@placer.ca.gov	

ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice