# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d) (PROPOSITION 65)

Date: July 6, 2020

To: Richard A. Orenstein, President-Chief Executive Officer, American Beauty Equipment LLC

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento & Los Angeles

From: Center for Advanced Public Awareness

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Center for Advanced Public Awareness ("CAPA") is a non-profit organization in the State of California acting in the interest of the general public, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d). CAPA seeks to further: the elimination of toxic chemicals in the manufacture of products; the improvement of human health through increased public awareness of toxic chemicals; and the promotion of environmentally sound practices and corporate responsibility.

This 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is being provided to the alleged violator, American Beauty Equipment LLC ("Notice Recipient"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Offices for 58 Counties, and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles.

CAPA provides this Notice after identifying violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"), based on the failure to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the products, listed below, in the State of California. The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice that it violated and continues to violate Proposition 65 with respect to the warning requirement, codified at California's Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, which states, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving a clear and reasonable warning to such individual." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to listed chemicals, citizens in California lack the information necessary to make an informed decision as to whether or how to eliminate or reduce their risk of exposure from the reasonably foreseeable use of products containing listed chemicals.

#### II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Consumer Product</u>. The specific type or category of products ("Products") that are the subject of this Notice are as follows:

Exemplar Product	Category/Type	Retailer	Manufacturer/ Distributor
Italica 0001 Child Salon Booster Seat	Seats with Vinyl	American Beauty	American Beauty
Part #ITA-0001	Upholstery	Equipment LLC	Equipment LLC
SKU # 782687066790			

Identified above is a specific example of Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for sale or use in the State of California, within the *category* of offending products covered by this Notice. The identified retailers, manufacturers and/or distributors of the Products are based on publicly available information.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation into the alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice. The specific identified Exemplar Product is not intended to be an exhaustive list of all such products potentially in violation of Proposition 65. It is CAPA's position the Notice Recipient is obligated to conduct, in good faith, an investigation into other products, within the category or of the type identified that may have been manufactured, imported, sold or distributed for sale, or in the Notice Recipient's custody or control during the relevant period identified below, to ensure the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to individuals in California prior to purchase.

<u>Listed Chemical.</u> The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("**DEHP**"). The State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause cancer on January 1, 1988 and as a chemical known to cause developmental and male reproductive toxicity on October 24, 2003.

Routes of Exposure. The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition and handling of Products containing DEHP. Exposures occur when consumers or users, including children and women of childbearing age, handle, touch or otherwise utilize Seats with Vinyl Upholstery containing DEHP in accordance with the Products' intended uses, resulting in exposures through ingestion and dermal absorption. Individuals ingest DEHP when they touch or handle the Products, transferring the chemical from their fingers or hands to their mouths. Dermal absorption of DEHP occurs when individuals handle, touch, or utilize the Products in accordance with their intended uses.

<u>Violations and Time Period of Exposure.</u> CAPA alleges the Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose, individuals within the State of California to DEHP, without first providing information about the chemical's toxic effects, as required by Proposition 65, by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings to consumers and users that the Products can expose users to DEHP.

Exposures caused by the use of the Products have occurred each day since the Products were introduced into the California marketplace, but, at a minimum, since July 6, 2019, and, potentially, as far back as July 6, 2017. Because the Products lack clear and reasonable warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to DEHP, each Product sold during this period and not accompanied by a warning constitutes a violation by the Notice Recipient and/or other sellers of the Products, whether sold directly through retailers located in, or with locations in, California, via the internet, or through catalog purchases by customers and individuals located in California. Moreover, these exposures are ongoing and will continue either until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to protect consumers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products or reduced to allowable levels.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, CAPA seeks to pursue a constructive resolution of this matter to quickly rectify ongoing violations of California law. To that end, based on the allegations set forth in this Notice and pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), CAPA intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice, unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these allegations. If the Notice Recipient seeks to resolve the claims alleged in this Notice without litigation, it may contact CAPA's counsel at the address listed below.

It should be noted neither CAPA nor its counsel can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the expiration of the 60-day Notice period; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City attorney in receipt of this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CAPA will satisfy CAPA's claims, the agreement may not satisfy any public prosecutors.

#### IV. GENERAL INFORMATION AND SUMMARY OF PROPOSITION 65

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65's provisions, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("**OEHHA**") is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient for its reference. For further general information concerning Proposition 65, contact OEHHA's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

#### V. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A copy of the Notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the California Attorney General and marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation, as required by Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3102, attached thereto.

#### VI. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions, issues or communications regarding this 60-Day Notice of Violation and its potential resolution to CAPA's counsel at the following address:

Center for Advanced Public Awareness c/o Laralei S. Paras, Esq. Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247

<u>Attachments:</u> Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (to Violator only); and Additional Confidential Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only.)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

Re: CAPA's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

I, Laralei S. Paras, hereby declare and certify:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e. the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies and data reviewed by that person.)

Dated: July 6, 2020

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years of age and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94111.

On July 6, 2020, I caused to be served the following:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY; and

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** 

XXXX by Certified First Class Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Richard A. Orenstein, President-CEO American Beauty Equipment LLC 830 Fairway Drive Bensenville, IL 60106

On July 6, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** 

XXXX by **First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Representative, with correct postage.

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by sending copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the Recipient listed on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On July 6, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and** 

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS** 

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by uploading the documents, addressed to California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on the 6<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2020, at San Francisco, California.

Laralei S. Paras

# **SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA, 90012	The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642
The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp Colusa County District Attorney 346 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531
The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667	The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows CA 95988
The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 525 5 <sup>th</sup> Street, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501	onorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301
The Honorable Keith Fagundes Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230	The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	The Honorable David Linn Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637
The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 9548
The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340	The Honorable Tony Rackaukas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 95113	The Honorable Candace Hooper San Benito District Attorney 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023	The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415	The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Redding, CA 96097	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles Kames K. Hahn Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Sacramento, CA 95814	The Honorable Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353
The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370	The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901	The Honorable Eric Heryford Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936		

### **ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST**

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salzar, District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni
Alameda County District Attorney		Deputy District Attorney
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	1 3
*		Monterey County
Oakland, CA 94621	Stockton, CA 95202	1200 Aguajito Road
CEPDProp65@acgiv.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Monterey, CA 93940
G. Itil at Birth	I. 00 G. D. 11 D	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney	Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
Napa County	Santa Cruz County	San Diego County
931 Parkway Mall	701 Ocean Street	300 West Broadway
Napa, CA 94559	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
Gregory Alker, Assistant District Atty	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
San Francisco County	Yolo County	City of San Diego
732 Brannan Street	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94103	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
gregory.alker@sfgov.org	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Lassen County	Attorney
Santa Clara County	220 S. Lassen Street	Santa Barbara County
70 W Hedding Street	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara Street
San Jose, CA 95110	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
EPU@da.sccgov.org		DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
Ventura County	Calaveras County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
800 S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
Ventura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
daspecialops@ventura.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org
Stacey Grassini	Eric J. Dobroth	Anne Marie Schubert
Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	District Attorney
Contra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Sacramento County
900 Ward Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor	901 G Street
Martinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Sacramento, CA 95814
sgrassini@contracostada.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Prop65@sacda.org
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney	The Honorable Clifford Newell
Inyo County District Attorney	Tulare County	Nevada County District Attorney
168 N. Edwards Street	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street
Independence, CA 93526	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Stephan Passalacqua, District Attorney	The Honorable David Hollister
Riverside County	Sonoma County	Plumas County District Attorney
3072 Orange Street	600 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room 404
Riverside, CA 92501	Sonoma, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
Prop65@rivcoda.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
The Honorable Walter W. Wall	Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney	au, ranomision (geodinty orpiumas.com
Mariposa County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	
P.O. Box 730	10810 Justice Center Drive	
Mariposa, CA 95338	Roseville, CA 95678	
mcda@mariposacounty.org	Prop65@placer.ca.gov	
meda@mariposacounty.org	Tropos@piacer.ca.gov	

## **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice