# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d) (PROPOSITION 65)

Date: August 19, 2020

To: Alex Hsu, President and Chief Executive Officer, Wagan Corporation

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento & Los Angeles

From: My Nguyen

#### I. INTRODUCTION

My Nguyen ("**Nguyen**") is a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d). Nguyen seeks to eliminate toxic chemicals used in products; improve human health through increased public awareness; and promote corporate responsibility.

This 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is being provided to the alleged violator, Wagan Corporation ("Notice Recipient"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Offices for 58 Counties, and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles.

Nguyen provides this Notice after identifying violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"), based on the failure to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the products, listed below, in the State of California. The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice it violated and continues to violate Proposition 65 with respect to the warning requirement, codified at California's Health & Safety Code § 25249.6: "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving a clear and reasonable warning to such individual." Without proper warnings about the toxic effects of exposures to listed chemicals, citizens in California lack the information necessary to make an informed decision as to whether or how to eliminate or reduce their risk of exposure from the reasonably foreseeable use of products containing listed chemicals.

#### II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

**<u>Product.</u>** The specific type or category of products ("**Products**") that are the subject of this Notice are as follows:

Exemplar Product	Category/Type	Retailers	Manufacturer/Distributor
Black 12V Faux Leather	Seat Cushions with	Auto & Home	Wagan Corporation
Deluxe Heated Seat Cushion,	Power Cords	Accessories;	
Item no. 2282,		Amazon.com	
GTIN 0 84367 02282 0,			
ASIN B000ANOUHG			

Identified above is a specific example of Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for sale or use in the State of California, within the *category* of offending products covered by this Notice. The identified retailers, manufacturers and/or distributors of the Products are based on publicly available information.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation into the alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice. The specific identified Exemplar Product is not intended to be an exhaustive list of all such products potentially in violation of Proposition 65. It is Nguyen's position the Notice Recipient is obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other products within the category or of the type, identified above, that were manufactured, imported, sold or distributed for sale, or that have otherwise been in the Notice Recipient's custody or control during the relevant period, identified below, to ensure the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to individuals in California prior to purchase.

<u>Listed Chemical.</u> The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP"). The State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause cancer on January 1, 1988 and as a chemical known to cause developmental and male reproductive toxicity on October 24, 2003.

Routes of Exposure. The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition and handling of Products containing DEHP. Exposures occur when individuals, including children and women of childbearing age, handle, touch or otherwise utilize seat cushions with power cords containing DEHP in accordance with the Products' intended uses, resulting in exposures through ingestion and dermal absorption. Individuals ingest DEHP when they touch or handle the Products, transferring the chemical from their fingers or hands to their mouths. Dermal absorption of DEHP occurs when individuals handle, touch, or utilize the Products in accordance with their intended uses.

<u>Violations and Time Period of Exposure.</u> Nguyen alleges the Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose, individuals within the State of California to DEHP, without first giving a health hazard warning regarding the chemical's toxic effects, as required by Proposition 65, by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings to consumers and users that the Products can expose users to DEHP.

Exposures caused by the use of the Products have occurred each day since the Products were introduced into the California marketplace, but, at a minimum, since August 19, 2019, and, potentially, as far back as August 19, 2017. Because the Products lack clear and reasonable warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to DEHP, each Product sold during this period and not accompanied by a warning constitutes a violation by the Notice Recipient and/or other sellers of the Products, whether sold directly through retailers located in, or with locations in, California, via the internet, or through catalog purchases by customers and individuals located in California. Moreover, these exposures are ongoing and will continue either until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to protect consumers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products or reduced to allowable levels.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Nguyen seeks to pursue a constructive resolution of this matter to quickly rectify ongoing violations of California law. To that end, based on the allegations set forth in this Notice and pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), Nguyen intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty

(60) days after effective service of this Notice, unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these allegations. If the Notice Recipient seeks to resolve the claims alleged in this Notice without litigation, it may contact Nguyen's counsel at the address listed below.

It should be noted neither Nguyen nor his counsel can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the expiration of the 60-day Notice period; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City attorney in receipt of this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with Nguyen will satisfy his claims, the agreement may not satisfy any public prosecutors.

#### IV. GENERAL INFORMATION AND SUMMARY OF PROPOSITION 65

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65's provisions, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("**OEHHA**") is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient for its reference. For further general information concerning Proposition 65, contact OEHHA's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

#### V. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A copy of the Notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the California Attorney General and marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation, as required by Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3102, attached thereto.

#### VI. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions, issues or communications regarding this 60-Day Notice of Violation and its potential resolution to Nguyen's counsel at the following address:

My Nguyen c/o Laralei Paras, Esq. Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247

<u>Attachments:</u> Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (to Violator only); and Additional Confidential Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only.)

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

Re: Nguyen's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

- 1, Laralei Paras, hereby declare and certify:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e. the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies and data reviewed by that person.)

Dated: August 19, 2020

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years of age and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94111.

On August 19, 2020, I caused to be served the following:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY; and

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** 

XXXX by Certified First Class Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Alex Hsu, President and CEO Wagan Corporation 31088 San Clemente Street Hayward, CA 94544

On August 19, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** 

XXXX by **First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Representative, with correct postage.

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by sending copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the Recipient listed on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On August 19, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and** 

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS** 

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by uploading the documents, addressed to California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on the 19<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2020, at San Francisco, California.

Laralei Paras

# **SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Michael Atwell	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Todd Riebe
Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	Amador County District Attorney
P.O. Box 248	211 West Temple Street, Ste 1200	708 Court Street, #202
Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA, 90012	Jackson, CA 95642
The Honorable Michael Ramsey	The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp	Del Norte County District Attorney
Butte County District Attorney	Colusa County District Attorney	450 H street, Room 171
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	346 5th Street, Suite 101	Crescent City, CA 95531
Oroville, CA 95965	Colusa, CA 95932	Crescent City, Cri 93331
The Honorable Vern Pierson	The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp	The Honorable Dwayne Stewart
El Dorado County District Attorney	Fresno County District Attorney	Glenn County District Attorney
515 Main Street	2220 Tulare street, Suite 1000	P.O. Box 430
Placerville, CA 95667	Fresno, CA 93721	Willows CA 95988
The Honorable Maggie Fleming	The Honorable Gilbert Otero	The Honorable Lisa Green
Humboldt County District Attorney	Imperial County District Attorney	Kern County District Attorney
525 5th Street, 4th Floor	940 West Main Street, Suite 102	1215 Truxtun Avenue
Eureka, CA 95501	El Centro, CA 92243	Bakersfield, CA 93301
The Honorable Keith Fagundes	The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable David Linn
Kings County District Attorney 1400	Lake County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney
West Lacey Blvd.	255 N. Forbes Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue
Hanford, CA 93230	Lakeport, CA 95453	Madera, CA 93637
The Honorable Edward Berberian	1 .	·
	The Honorable Mike Feuer	The Honorable C. David Eyster
Marin County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles Kames K. Hahn Hall East	Mendocino County District
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	200 North Main Street, 8 <sup>th</sup> Floor	Attorney P.O. Box 1000
San Rafael, CA 94903		Ukiah, CA 9548
The Hamanahla Diahand Dayla	Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Tim Kendall
The Honorable Richard Doyle	The Honorable Tony Rackaukas	
Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 <sup>th</sup> Floor	Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West	Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 2053
San Jose, CA 95113	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe	The Honorable Candace Hooper	The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett
San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor	San Benito District Attorney 419 4th Street	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street
Redwood City, CA 94063	Hollister, CA 95023	Redding, CA 96001
The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Amanda Hopper
Siskiyou County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney
P.O. Box 986	303 W. Third Street	446 Second Street, Suite 102
Redding, CA 96097	San Bernardino, CA 92415	Yuba City, CA 95991
The Honorable Laura Krieg	The Honorable Krishna Abrams	The Honorable Eric Heryford
Tuolumne County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310
423 N. Washington Street	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	
Sonora, CA 95370	Fairfield, CA 94533	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Lawrence Allen	The Honorable James Sanchez	The Honorable Patrick McGrath
Sierra County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor	Yuba County District Attorney
100 Courthouse Square	Sacramento, CA 95814	215 Fifth street, Suite 152
Downieville, CA 95936		Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Jordan Funk	The Honorable Gregg Cohen	The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislans County District Attorney
Modoc County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th street, Suite 300
204 S. Court Street Room 202	P.O. Box 519	Modesto, CA 95353
Alturas, CA 96101	Red Bluff, CA 96080	wioucsio, CA 73333

## **ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	The Honorable Tori Verber Salzar, San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street
Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgiv.org	Stockton, CA 95202  DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org
The Honorable Gary Lieberstein Napa County District Attorney 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	The Honorable Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attorney 300 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
Gregory Alker, Assistant District Atty San Francisco County 732 Brannan Street San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org	The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney City of San Diego 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 City Atty Prop65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten, Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009	The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney Office of the City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94102
daspecialops@ventura.org Stacey Grassini Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us  Eric J. Dobroth Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Govt Center Annex, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org Jeannine M. Pacioni Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us The
The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney 168 N. Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us	The Honorable Phillip J. Cline Tulare County District Attorney 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co nevada.ca.us
The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach, Riverside County District Attorney 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua, Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
The Honorable Walter W. Wall Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov

# **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice