60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d) (PROPOSITION 65)

Date: September 30, 2020
To: Herman Goldberger, President, Adir Corporation of NY d/b/a/ AdirPro Ben Werczberger, President, Tiger Supplies, Inc. California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento & Los Angeles
From: Keep America Safe and Beautiful

I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

Keep America Safe and Beautiful is a California nonprofit corporation acting in the interest of the general public, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d). Keep America Safe and Beautiful seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by eliminating hazardous substances contained in such items, promoting corporate responsibility.

This 60-Day Notice of Violation ("**Notice**") is being provided to the alleged violators, Adir Corporation of NY d/b/a/ AdirPro and Tiger Supplies, Inc. ("**Notice Recipients**"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Offices for 58 Counties, and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles.

Keep America Safe and Beautiful provides this Notice after identifying violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 *et seq.* (**"Proposition 65**"), based on the failure to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the products, listed below, in the State of California. The Notice Recipients are hereby given notice they violated and continue to violate Proposition 65 with respect to the warning requirement, codified at California's Health & Safety Code § 25249.6: "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving a clear and reasonable warning to such individual." Without proper warnings about the toxic effects of exposures to listed chemicals, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions as to whether or how to eliminate or reduce their risk of exposure from the reasonably foreseeable use of products containing listed chemicals.

II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product</u>. The specific type or category of products ("**Products**") that are the subject of this Notice are as follows:

Exemplar Product	Category/Type	Retailer	Manufacturer/Distributor
AdirPro 1 in. x 150 ft.	Flagging Tape	Walmart, Inc.	Adir Corporation of NY
Fluorescent Yellow Flagging			d/b/a/ AdirPro;
Tape (12-Pack)			Tiger Supplies, Inc.
Model No. 719-150-FLY			
Walmart No. 531163364			

Identified above is a specific example of Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for sale or use in the State of California, within the *category* of offending products covered by this Notice. The identified retailers, manufacturers and/or distributors of the Products are based on publicly available information.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation into the alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice. The specific identified Exemplar Product is not intended to be an exhaustive list of all such products potentially in violation of Proposition 65. It is Keep America Safe and Beautiful's position the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other products within the category or of the type, identified above, that were manufactured, imported, sold or distributed for sale, or that have otherwise been in the Notice Recipients' custody or control during the relevant period, identified below, to ensure the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to individuals in California prior to purchase.

Listed Chemical. The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("**DEHP**"). The State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause cancer on January 1, 1988, and as a chemical known to cause developmental and male reproductive toxicity on October 24, 2003.

Routes of Exposure. The exposures subject to this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition and handling of Products containing DEHP. Exposures occur when individuals, including women of childbearing age, handle, touch or otherwise utilize flagging tape containing DEHP in accordance with the Products' intended uses, resulting in exposures through ingestion and dermal absorption. Individuals ingest DEHP when touch or handle the Products, transferring the chemical from their fingers or hands to their mouths. Dermal absorption of DEHP occurs when individuals handle, touch, or utilize the Products.

<u>Violations and Time Period of Exposure.</u> Keep America Safe and Beautiful alleges the Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, individuals within the State of California to DEHP, without first giving a health hazard warning, as required by Proposition 65, by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings to consumers and users that the Products can expose users to DEHP.

Exposures caused by the use of the Products have occurred each day since the Products were introduced into the California marketplace, but, at a minimum, since September 30, 2019, and, potentially, as far back as September 30, 2017. Because the Products lack clear and reasonable warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to DEHP, each Product sold to customers and individuals located in California during this period not accompanied by a warning constitutes a violation by the Notice Recipients and/or other sellers of the Products. Moreover, these exposures are ongoing and will continue either until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to protect consumers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products or reduced to allowable levels.

III. <u>RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS</u>

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Keep America Safe and Beautiful seeks to pursue a constructive resolution of this matter to quickly rectify ongoing violations of California law. To that end, based on the allegations set forth in this Notice and pursuant to

Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), Keep America Safe and Beautiful intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice, unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these allegations. If the Notice Recipients seek to resolve the claims alleged in this Notice without litigation, they may contact Keep America Safe and Beautiful's counsel at the address listed below.

It should be noted neither Keep America Safe and Beautiful nor its counsel can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the expiration of the 60-day Notice period; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City attorney in receipt of this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with Keep America Safe and Beautiful will satisfy its claims, the agreement may not satisfy any public prosecutors.

IV. GENERAL INFORMATION AND SUMMARY OF PROPOSITION 65

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65's provisions, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("**OEHHA**") is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipients for their reference. For further general information concerning Proposition 65, contact OEHHA's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

V. <u>CERTIFICATE OF MERIT</u>

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A copy of the Notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the California Attorney General and marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation, as required by Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3102, attached thereto.

VI. <u>CONTACT INFORMATION</u>

Please direct all questions, issues or communications regarding this 60-Day Notice of Violation and its potential resolution to Keep America Safe and Beautiful's counsel at the following address:

Keep America Safe and Beautiful c/o Laralei Paras, Esq. Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247

<u>Attachments:</u> Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (to Violator only); and Additional Confidential Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only.)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

Re: Keep America Safe and Beautiful's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

- 1, Laralei Paras, hereby declare and certify:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e. the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies and data reviewed by that person.)

Dated: September 30, 2020

Laralei Paras

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years of age and not a party to this case. Seven Hills LLP's business address is 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94111.

On September 30, 2020, I caused to be served the following:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY; and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX by **Certified First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Herman Goldberger, President Adir Corporation of NY d/b/a/ AdirPro 27 Selvage Street Irvington, NJ 07111-5551 Ben Werczberger, President Tiger Supplies, Inc. 27 Selvage St Ste B Irvington, NJ 07111-5552

On September 30, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX by **First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Representative, with correct postage.

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by sending copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the Recipient listed on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On September 30, 2020, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by uploading the documents, addressed to California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on the 30th day of September, 2020, at Sacramento, California.

Uhr g

Caroline Liang

SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120 The Honorable Michael Bomacy	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA, 90012 The Honorable Matthew B. Becushamm	The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642
The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp Colusa County District Attorney 346 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531
The Honorable Vern Pierson	The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp	The Honorable Dwayne Stewart
El Dorado County District Attorney	Fresno County District Attorney	Glenn County District Attorney
778 Pacific Street	2220 Tulare street, Suite 1000	P.O. Box 430
Placerville, CA 95667	Fresno, CA 93721	Willows CA 95988
The Honorable Maggie Fleming	The Honorable Gilbert Otero	The Honorable Lisa Green
Humboldt County District Attorney	Imperial County District Attorney	Kern County District Attorney
825 5 th Street, 4 th Floor	940 West Main Street, Suite 102	1215 Truxtun Avenue
Eureka, CA 95501	El Centro, CA 92243	Bakersfield, CA 93301
The Honorable Keith Fagundes	The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable David Linn
Kings County District Attorney	Lake County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney
1400 West Lacey Blvd.	255 N. Forbes Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue
Hanford, CA 93230	Lakeport, CA 95453	Madera, CA 93637
The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles Kames K. Hahn Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8 th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 9548
The Honorable Richard Doyle	The Honorable Tony Rackaukas	The Honorable Tim Kendall
Office of the City Attorney, San Jose	Orange County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 th Floor	401 Civic Center Drive West	P.O. Box 2053
San Jose, CA 95113	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe	The Honorable Candace Hooper	The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett
San Mateo County District Attorney	San Benito District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
400 County Center, Third Floor	419 4th Street	1355 West Street
Redwood City, CA 94063	Hollister, CA 95023	Redding, CA 96001
The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Amanda Hopper
Siskiyou County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney
P.O. Box 986	303 W. Third Street	446 Second Street, Suite 102
Redding, CA 96097	San Bernardino, CA 92415	Yuba City, CA 95991
The Honorable Laura Krieg	The Honorable Krishna Abrams	The Honorable Eric Heryford
Tuolumne County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
423 N. Washington Street	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	P.O. Box 310
Sonora, CA 95370	Fairfield, CA 94533	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Lawrence Allen	The Honorable James Sanchez	The Honorable Patrick McGrath
Sierra County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento	Yuba County District Attorney
100 Courthouse Square	915 I Street, 4 th Floor	215 Fifth Street, Suite 152
Downieville, CA 95936	Sacramento, CA 95814	Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Jordan Funk	The Honorable Gregg Cohen	The Honorable Birgit Fladager
Modoc County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street Room 202	P.O. Box 519	832 12th street, Suite 300
Alturas, CA 96101	Red Bluff, CA 96080	Modesto, CA 95353

<u>ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST</u>				
The Honorable Nancy O'Malley	The Honorable Tori Verber Salzar	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert		
Alameda County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney		
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	901 G Street		
Oakland, CA 94621	Stockton, CA 95202	Sacramento, CA 95814		
CEPDProp65@acgiv.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Prop65@sacda.org		
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan		
Napa County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney		
1127 First St., Suite C	701 Ocean Street	300 West Broadway		
Napa, CA 94559	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101		
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org		
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney		
Yolo County District Attorney	Lassen County	City of San Diego		
301 Second Street	220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Third Avenue		
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	San Diego, CA 92101		
cfepd@yolocounty.org	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov		
Bud Porter	Alethea M. Sargent	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District		
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Attorney		
Santa Clara County	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Santa Barbara County		
70 W Hedding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	1112 Santa Barbara Street		
San Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Barbara, CA 93101		
EPU@da.sccgov.org	alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us		
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney		
Ventura County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney		
800 S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor		
Ventura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102		
daspecialops@ventura.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org		
Stacey Grassini	Eric J. Dobroth	Jeannine M. Pacioni		
Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney		
Contra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Monterey County		
900 Ward Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor	1200 Aguajito Road		
Martinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Monterey, CA 93940		
sgrassini@contracostada.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us		
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Honorable Phillip J. Cline	The Honorable Clifford Newell		
Inyo County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney		
168 N. Edwards Street	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street		
Independence, CA 93526	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959		
inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us		
The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Honorable David Hollister		
Riverside County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney		
3072 Orange Street	600 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room 404		
Riverside, CA 92501	Sonoma, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971		
Prop65@rivcoda.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com		
The Honorable Walter W. Wall	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire		
Mariposa County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney		
P.O. Box 730	550 West Main Street	10810 Justice Center Drive		
Mariposa, CA 95338	Merced, CA 95340	Roseville, CA 95678		
mcda@mariposacounty.org	Prop65@countyofmerced.com	prop65@placer.ca.gov		

ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice